

Along the Silk Road

Essays on History, Literature, and Culture
in China

Along the Silk Road

Essays on History, Literature, and Culture
in China

Edited by
M. Darrol Bryant
Yan Li &
Judith Maclean Miller

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Along the Silk Road, History, Literature, and Culture in China (2010 : Renison University College)

Along the Silk Road : essays on History, Literature, and Culture in China / edited by M. Darrol Bryant, Yan Li & Judith Maclean Miller.

Essays presented at the conference held at Renison University College at the University of Waterloo, May 20-23, 2010.

ISBN 978-1-926599-23-6

1. China--History--Congresses. 2. China--Civilization--Congresses. 3. Chinese literature--21st century--Congresses.
I. Bryant, M. Darrol II. Li, Yan, 1955- III. Miller, Judith, 1943- IV. Renison University College V. Title.

DS702.A56 2012

951

C2012-901287-4

Book design by Christian Snyder

ALONG THE SILK ROAD.

ISBN 978-1-926599-23-6

Copyright © 2011 Pandora Press

Published by Pandora Press

All rights reserved.

www.pandorapress.com

21 20 19 18 17 16 15 14 13 12

3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	7
Introduction: M. Darrol Bryant & Judith Maclean Miller	9
1. Judith Maclean Miller	19
Mysteries of the Silk Road	
2. Joseph Adler	28
Classical and Contemporary Confucian Ways	
3. James Flath	44
Showdown at Kong Temple: Modern Politics and the Confucian Material Heritage	
4. Ye Bai	57
Literature in China: 2008-09	
5. Judith Maclean Miller	75
Absence and Presence: Canadian Chinese Writers	
6. Yan Li	89
The Menzies in China: An Unforgettable Family in Sino-Canadian History	
7. Jie Yang	102
Renqing, Privatization and Kindly Power in Post-Mao China	
8. Glenn Cartwright	119
Educational Challenges in China	
9. Norman Smith	128
Spirits in China	
10. Ning Wang	139
Daoism & Chinese Medicine	
11. Whalen Lai	157
“Evil Monks?” Buddhism Along the Silk Road	

12. M. Darrol Bryant	174
The Abrahamic Traditions in China: Judaism, Islam, & Daoist Christianity	
Appendix	191
Contributors	195

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We wish to acknowledge the support of the Confucius Institute of the University of Waterloo for funding the conference where most of these papers were first presented. Renison University College also provided facilities and support for this venture. We are also grateful to the contributors for their essays and their revisions. Professor Yan Li did the Chinese summaries that precede each essay in the volume. Judith Maclean Miller and M. Darrol Bryant shared the editing tasks on these essays. Susan Hodges Bryant ran her trained eye over the final draft and caught things earlier missed. Christian Snyder at Pandora Press was wonderful to work with and provided many useful improvements. We are grateful for all your assistance in improving the quality of this volume. Remaining errors are the responsibility of the editors.

INTRODUCTION

M. Darrol Bryant and Judith Maclean Miller

On May 20-23, 2010, scholars from Canada, China and the United States gathered at Renison University College at the University of Waterloo for a conference entitled *Along the Silk Road: History, Literature, and Culture in China*. The conference had been two years in the making and involved the joint efforts of Professor Yan Li of the Confucius Institute and Professor M. Darrol Bryant of the Centre for Dialogue and Spirituality in the World's Religions in Waterloo. They had settled on the title *Along the Silk Road* as a fitting and dynamic image for a conference that sought a wide range of contributions exploring varied aspects of Chinese life and culture. The net was cast widely, inviting scholars from Europe, North America, and China. The hope was that the invitation would bring a range of papers that would capture aspects of China's historical and contemporary life.

We were not disappointed as we gathered on those lovely spring days in May 2010. The conference participants came from varied backgrounds and different disciplines (literature, history, anthropology, religious studies, social science and education). With different levels of expertise in relation to China, there was a shared passion to understand a land and people that were coming to the end of a century of unprecedented change and transformation. That century had begun in October 1911 with the revolts against the Qing Dynasty that had ruled China since 1644. In May 2010, we were nearing the centennial of the beginning of a century of unprecedented change for Chinese life and culture.

Before we turn to the papers that are gathered in this volume, it is perhaps useful to say a few more words concerning our conference theme "Along the Silk Road" and this century of change (1911–2011) for China.

II. THE SILK ROAD

Though the name, the Silk Road (*Seindenstrasse*), comes from the 19th century German geographer Ferdinand von Richthofen (1833–1905), the route is an ancient one. Its beginnings go back before the Common Era, as does the trade and exchange that moved along these paths from Central Asia to the Mediterranean in the West and to the heartland of China in the East. The Silk Road actually denotes the multiple caravan routes that crossed deserts, mountains and the grassy steppes of Central Asia carrying goods between cultures East and West. The phrase “the Silk Road” evokes an aura of mystery and romance that stands in marked contrast to the stark realities facing the hardy trader on trips that took months and years to complete. While few travelled the whole distance, a steady stream of traders out of China in the East, from India in the South, and Europe in the West brought goods and ideas along these tracks to meeting places in Central Asia. It was here that much of the exchange took place.

Already in 334–323 BCE, Alexander the Great had fought his way across ancient Persia to Central Asia and into ancient India. He left an enduring legacy that flowered under the Kushan Buddhist rulers of Gandhara in the first centuries of the Common Era. Cultural traditions, including Hindu and Buddhist ones coming out of India, the traditions of ancient Greece and later Eastern Christianity and those of Central Asia and China came together in an immensely creative way in the Gandhara Kingdom. The Silk Road was not only a trading route; it was also a cross-cultural highway, or, as a later traveler said, “a ceaselessly flowing stream of life.”¹

It is therefore a title and theme that points to China’s long history of exchange with the wider world. The collection of papers here seeks to illumine some familiar and some neglected aspects of historical and contemporary Chinese life and culture. Rather than focusing on what diplomats now call “hard power,” the focus here is on the cultural or “soft power” dimensions of Chinese life.

We have evoked the metaphor of the Silk Road for these essays because it recognizes the long history of China in interaction with the rest of the world. These land routes have carried goods and

ideas between the East and West for over two millennia.

In our time, the routes of exchange between China and the world have changed dramatically. While goods move across land and sea to the world, ideas and information traverse the information highway in ways that seemingly abolish time and distance. Moreover, Chinese people are now found across the world, with “China towns” a standard feature of most of the great cities of the world. Some years ago, one of the editors was sitting in a square in downtown Hong Kong and overheard a young Chinese say to his friends that he had recently been in Vancouver and had to use his English hardly at all.

In our time, the exchange between China and the world has exploded on the new silk road: the internet. And as Yo-yo Ma’s Silk Road Project suggests, the *silk road* has become a “modern metaphor for multicultural and interdisciplinary exchange.”²

III. 1911-2011: A CENTURY OF TURMOIL AND TRANSFORMATION

The contemporary background to these essays is a century of turmoil and transformation in China. October 1911 marked the beginning of the end for the Qing Dynasty that had ruled China since 1644. By 2011, China has emerged as one of the world’s leading powers.

Over the past hundred years, China has endured decades of war that came to an end in 1949, when the Communist Army marched into Beijing. In Tiananmen Square, Mao Zedong declared the founding of the People’s Republic of China. Mao sought to revolutionize Chinese society. The Mao era (1949–1976) came to an end in the Cultural Revolution (1966–1976). Deng Xiaoping then charted an era of reconstruction (1976–1989) that began to transform Chinese society yet again as it opened the economy. An era of rising power (1989–2002) followed as the economy began to grow at annual rates of eight percent or more with Jiang Zemin at the helm. In 2011, China finds itself emerging as a leading world power in the dawning Pacific Era. It has been a century of unprecedented

transformation for the peoples of China.

IV: INTRODUCING THE ESSAYS

As already noted, all of the essays were first presented at a conference held at Renison University College in May 2010. The conference did not proceed in the conventional way. Rather than gathering to hear papers read, all the papers were submitted in advance and circulated to the conference participants. Hence when the conference convened at Renison University College, we spent three days in discussion of the papers. They were subsequently revised for publication, edited, and included here. The exceptions are the essays by Professor Joseph Adler of Kenyon College (Ohio) and Professor Ye Bai of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences (Beijing) which were included later.

The opening essay, *Mysteries of the Silk Road* by Professor Judith Miller, Renison University College, evokes the romance and mystery of the Silk Road, exploring poetry from the West and the East. From Coleridge's mysterious Kubla Khan to Xijun's lament at being exchanged for horses, we learn something of the mystique, foreboding, and exchange that the Silk Road engendered. Miller then turns to the ceramic art of Sin-ying Ho, a contemporary artist born in China, who studied in Canada and the USA and now lives in New York City, to illustrate an artistic response to the cultural collisions and exchanges that emerged along the Silk Road. For Miller – and for this volume – the Silk Road has become, in her words, “a metaphor for bridges of understanding across widely differing lands.”

The next two essays, by Professor Joseph Adler and Professor James Flath, are centered, in very different ways, on the Confucian tradition. They deserve pride of place in the ordering of these essays as they turn our attention to the long and complex issue of the Confucian traditions in China. Confucianism has been at the heart of the struggle between tradition and modernity in China over the past 100 years.

The masterful essay by Professor Joseph Adler from Kenyon College (Ohio), *The Classical & Contemporary Confucian Ways*, unfolds the classical Confucian Way, its permutations over the centuries, and its contemporary resurgence. Adler shows that Confucianism is a Way centered in the family and society. He guides us through the thought of Confucius, Mencius and the Neo-Confucians, down to the fall of Confucianism as it turned authoritarian and rigid in more recent times. He also looks at the recent, surprising, and ambiguous resurgence of Confucius and Confucian thought after the Cultural Revolution in the 1970s.

The essay by Professor James Flath from the University of Western Ontario, *Showdown at Kong Temple: Modern Politics and the Confucian Material Heritage*, takes us on a fascinating tour of a century of political machinations surrounding the Kong Temple (*Kong Miao*), the temple dedicated to Confucius in Qufu in Shandong province. Here, it is the Confucian material heritage rather than its philosophy that is under investigation. Alternately attacked, defended, vilified, and restored, the material heritage of Confucius and the Kong family has persisted as a contested “site of memory” in Chinese life and culture.

The next two essays focus on Chinese Literature. Unlike in earlier centuries when the trip from China to Europe along the Silk Road took years, modern means of transport and now the internet have made exchange in our world instant and virtual. The first essay, entitled *Chinese Literature: 2008-2009*, is by Ye Bai, a Professor of Chinese Literature at the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences in Beijing. Professor Bai is also the Vice-Chair of the Contemporary Chinese Literature Research Association, which means that he is well placed to provide this overview of Chinese literature. He provides an informed review of the novels and poetry published in the year of the Wenchuan earthquake and during events leading up to the Olympics. His essay also covers the astonishing growth of web publications and readership, a phenomenon that does not receive the critical review Bai believes it should. He then bravely outlines some of his concerns about the implications of the growth

of web publications and readership for literature in China. This essay is especially important for Western readers who are largely uninformed about Chinese literature – and its scale.

The second essay, *Absence and Presence: Canadian Chinese Writers* by Professor Judith Miller, Professor of English at Renison University College, and a specialist in Canadian literature, presents a reading of works by writers of Chinese heritage and culture who have come to Canada over a long period of time, from the beginning of the 19th century to the present. The early experiences of loss, longing, and danger make poignant readings. She discovers in these writings, which span generations, recurrent images and themes such as a familiarity with ghosts, the bone journey, the keeping of secrets, and the central importance of food to family and community. She also notes that some of the Chinese writers are exploring a new hybrid genre of “biotext” that emerges at that intersection where fiction and non-fiction meet. She takes pleasure in the voices and forms which have become a significant part of the Canadian literary canon.

The next four essays deal with disparate topics: a missionary family, the human dimensions of social transition, education, and the role of alcohol in Chinese history. Yan Li, author of *Daughters of the Red Land* and the Director of the Confucius Institute, recounts the story of the Menzies family in China in her essay *The Menzies in China: An Unforgettable Family in Sino-Canadian History*. James Mellon Menzies (1885–1957) came to China from Canada in 1910 as an unusual missionary. Trained as an engineer, James Menzies dug wells and built homes in Henan province. He became a self-trained archeologist and discovered oracle bones in Zhangde. His book *Oracle Records from the Waste of Yin* was published in China a year after the birth of his son, Arthur Menzies. James Menzies was made a Professor of Archeology at Qilu University (1932–37). Arthur Menzies would become Canada’s Ambassador to China (1976–80). It is a fascinating and compelling story.

Jie Yang is a Professor of Anthropology at Simon Fraser University. Her essay, *Renqing, Privatization and Kindly Power in*

Post-Mao China, explores the human dimensions of the transition to a socialist market economy or state-capitalism in China. Yang argues that the complex and multi-dimensional Chinese notion of *Renqing* (human feelings) can easily be ignored or undervalued in the process of privatization, something Professor Yang helps us to see in her analysis of the privatization of a watch factory near Beijing where she conducted her research in 2002. It recounts the experience of workers in the factory – and some managers – during this difficult period.

Glen Cartwright, Principal and Vice-Chancellor of Renison University College, casts a more optimistic eye on another aspect of Chinese life: education. His essay, *Reflections on Educational Challenges of China*, was initially presented at a 2003 conference in China on higher education. That event was celebrating Deng Xiaoping's (1904–1997) “Three Fors Inscription” or his declaration that education should promote modernization, foster a worldview, and gear citizens for the future. This essay has been revised for inclusion here. In these reflections on education in China, Cartwright focuses on the process of modernization, the world-wide scope of education and its future.

A historian at the University of Guelph, Professor Norman Smith takes up the unlikely issue of alcohol in China in his essay entitled, tongue in cheek, *Spirits in China*. Unlike those who contend that the Chinese do not consume alcohol, Smith argues that alcohol has played a role throughout the history of Chinese life and culture. It has inspired cultural production in poetry, literature, and theatre; it has informed ritual and been seen as a tonic for good health, and taxes on alcohol have funded military campaigns. This is not to deny the long history in China of discussion concerning the benefits and dangers of alcohol, and the role of the state in its regulation. Li Bai (701–762), the famed Chinese writer, celebrated the “god of wine” and modern China has become a major producer of beer and wine. This instructive romp through Chinese history is a fitting transition to the final three essays, dealing with the traditions of spiritual cultivation in China: Daoism, Buddhism,

and, surprisingly, the Abrahamic traditions of the West (Judaism, Islam, and Christianity).

Professor Ning Wang of Brock University opens this trilogy of essays with *Daoism and Chinese Medicine*. He documents the connections between philosophical Daoism and the quest for health in Chinese medicine. Central here is cultivating *qi* (vital spirit/energy) that courses through the universe and human beings. After clarifying some of the philosophical principles of Daoism that are relevant to medicine, Professor Wang focuses his critical eye on three aspects of Chinese medicine: dietetics, drug therapy, and *qi* cultivation.

The volume concludes with two essays on traditions of spiritual life that originated outside China: Buddhism and the Abrahamic traditions of Judaism, Christianity and Islam. Buddhism, we learn from Professor Whalen Lai from the University of California in Davis, came into China along the Silk Road in the first century of the Common Era. Initially regarded with some suspicion among the Chinese for its silence on the family, so central to the Chinese traditions, it gradually made its way. In its journey of acceptance in a Chinese context, Buddhism creatively evolved some new forms: Chan and Pure Land. But even before that, Buddhists evolved a unique Buddhist institution known as the “Sangha-households.” It is, says Lai, a kind of “monastic capitalism” long before there was such a thing as capitalism. It involved families pledging to work Sangha (the community of monks) lands in exchange for a percentage of the crop. *Evil Monks?* is a fascinating but little known story of Buddhism in China that Lai unfolds.

The final essay, by Professor M. Darrol Bryant, focuses on the so-called Western traditions in China: Judaism, Islam and Christianity. These traditions also made their way into Chinese life via the Silk Road. In the early 1900s, Wang Yuanli (1849–1931), a Daoist priest at Dunhuang, discovered the caves that contained a treasure trove of Buddhist, Daoist and other Chinese writings including surprisingly, some by Nestorian Christians. Many of these manuscripts were then purchased by Sir Marc Aurel Stein

(1862-1943) of Great Britain. They are still being catalogued and deciphered. In Bryant's essay, *Abrahamic Traditions in China: Judaism, Islam, and Daoist Christianity*, we learn that these traditions have been part of Chinese life over much of the past two millennia and have adapted themselves to Chinese culture in sometimes intriguing ways.

Along the Silk Road: Essays on History, Literature, and Culture in China is, then, an interesting glimpse into some neglected areas in contemporary studies of China and its intersections with the West. In their unique and varied styles, these essays invite the reader to consider what has been and is happening in Chinese life and culture at home and abroad at the end of a century of unprecedented change.

Notes

- 1 See Frances Wood, *The Silk Road, Two Thousand Years in the Heart of Asia* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), pp. 9 ff. With text and images, it is an excellent guide to the rich history of the Silk Road.
- 2 See The Silk Road Project at www.silkroadproject.org

MYSTERIES OF THE SILK ROAD

Judith Maclean Miller

加拿大滑铁卢大学的朱迪丝·米勒教授的论文《神秘的丝绸之路》研究了东西方文学作品，以探索那条连接了中国与西方的神秘的丝绸之路。这些贸易路线可以追溯到公元前，它不仅输送了商品、人员，而且还传播了文化和跨文化的观念。“丝绸之路”成了一种跨文化交流的比喻。

The very phrase “Along the Silk Road” suggests adventure and romance. The Silk Road or Roads were travel routes from the cities of the West to China, through Central Asia. The routes were used by travelers and traders from early times, certainly hundreds of years BCE. Although we speak of “the Silk Road,” there were at least two overland routes, one toward the north, one more southerly, and there was a sea route in addition. From early times, there were shorter trails, marking the movements of local traders, many of which became part of the longer routes from Europe to China. People in China referred to these movements as “journey to the west.”

The route overland through Central Asia came to particular attention in the West through the medieval accounts of travelers, especially Marco Polo, who described the route from Baghdad to China. The name, “The Silk Road,” though, was not used until 1877 – by the German Baron Ferdinand van Richthofen, himself an explorer and geographer in the region. It brings to mind images of camel caravans and wonderful cities, rich in art and song. It also suggests markets, the exchange of goods as well as ideas. This sense of mystery and romance has hovered over the Silk Road for a long time, attracting archeologists, geographers, historians – and poets.

Samuel Taylor Coleridge’s poem fragment, based he said on an opium dream, catches some of that romance:

Kubla Khan

In Xanadu did Kubla Khan
 A stately pleasure-dome decree:
 Where Alph, the sacred river, ran
 Through caverns measureless to man
 Down to a sunless sea.

Samuel Taylor Coleridge (c.1816)

The idea of “the stately pleasure-dome,” built far to the east, out of untold wealth and privilege, caught the fancy of many Englishmen and women. The image of “Alph, the sacred river,” reminds readers that religions and philosophies were part of that unknown and therefore fascinating world. The “caverns measureless to man” suggest mystery, beyond the usual ways of measuring or valuing.

Some years later, in 1900, James Elroy Flecker wrote the often-quoted lines which were to become almost a hymn for travellers to the East.

The Golden Journey to Samarkand

We are the Pilgrims, master; we shall go
 Always a little further: it may be
 Beyond that last blue mountain barred with snow,
 Across that angry or that glimmering sea,

White on a throne or guarded in a cave
 There lives a prophet who can understand
 Why men were born: but surely we are brave,
 Who take the Golden Road to Samarkand.

Sweet to ride forth at evening from the wells
 When shadows pass gigantic on the sand,
 And softly through the silence beat the bells
 Along the Golden Road to Samarkand.

We travel not for trafficking alone;
 By hotter winds our fiery hearts are fanned:
 For lust of knowing what should not be known
 We make the Golden Journey to Samarkand.

James Elroy Flecker (1900)

Flecker conveys the sense of pilgrimage which went along with travel on the Silk Road. This was not only a journey to trade or to find luxurious goods and lifestyles – “We travel not for trafficking alone.” It had to do with searching, looking for answers to such questions as “Why men were born,” searching for wisdom or knowledge that was perhaps exotic, dangerous, beyond what Europeans knew, reached through a meeting of cultures and knowledge.

Long before these writers, Chinese imaginations were also caught by the romance of the Silk Road, that trade route where bolts of Chinese silk were traded, especially for horses, which had become a part of Chinese myth, poetry and art. Horses were difficult to breed in China and the shaggy mountain ponies of Mongolia had none of the grace or stature of the horses from more western regions which had achieved legendary status in China. Waiting for the delivery of horses to the Chinese capital of Chang’an, the Emperor Wu wrote a hymn to his idea of them, which interestingly has more to do with the horses’ spiritual strengths than their military usefulness:

The Heavenly Horses are coming,
 Coming from the Far West.
 They crossed the Flowering Sands,
 For the barbarians are conquered.

The Heavenly Horses are coming
 That issued from the water of a pool.
 Two of them have tiger backs:
 They can transform themselves like spirits.

The Heavenly Horses are coming
 Across the pastureless wilds
 A thousand leagues at a stretch,
 Following the eastern road.

The Heavenly Horses are coming;
 Jupiter is in the Dragon.
 Should they choose to soar aloft,
 Who could keep pace with them?

The Heavenly Horses are coming;
 Open the gates while there is time.
 They will draw me up and carry me
 To the Holy Mountains of K'un-lun.

The Heavenly Horses have come
 and the Dragon will follow in their wake.
 I shall reach the Gates of Heaven,
 I shall see the Palace of God.

Emperor Wu, 101 BCE

In early times, people of China also saw the Silk Road as a trade route, leading into strange and mysterious places, but their view of the West was harsh. They saw it as a territory of barbarians, difficult landscapes and dangerous travel. Emperor Wu is waiting for the heavenly horses because “the barbarians are conquered.”

During the Han period, a Chinese princess, Xijun, daughter of the king of Jiangdu, was sent to the elderly ruler of Wusun (in the Ili Valley?) in exchange for a thousand horses. She was not enchanted by the idea of trading along the Silk Road:

My family sent me off to be married on the other side of heaven.
 They sent me a long way to a strange land, to the king of Wusun.

A domed lodging is my dwelling place with walls of felt.
Meat is my food, with fermented milk as the sauce.
I live with constant thoughts of my home, my heart is full of sorrow.
I wish I were a golden swan, returning to my home country.

(quoted in Wood, *The Silk Road*)

Travel in the areas served by the Silk Road was, in China, referred to as “the journey to the west,” after the title of a classic and widely popular novel, *Journey to the West*, published anonymously in the 1590s, during the Ming dynasty. It is based on the diaries of a Buddhist monk, Xuanzang (c. 602–664), sometimes called Tang Tripitaka, who travelled to the western regions during the Tang dynasty, to acquire Buddhist sutras from a monastery in India. The novel is full of folk images and the three amusing characters who accompany Tripitaka on his journey, resolving challenges and dangers as they travel through a fantastic landscape of barbarians and monsters. They return to China with the sutras and with many curiosities—ideas as well as objects.

Wole Soyinka, Nigerian poet and dramatist, winner of the 1986 Nobel Prize in Literature, wrote a celebrated collection of poems, *Samarkand and Other Markets I Have Known*, which has also been dramatized and presented as theatre. He makes the point that, in markets, people meet. Many exchanges happen. In the great markets of the Silk Road, much was shared, bartered, sold. Goods were important, but so were ideas and the materials to bring them to fruition.

In an unexpected link to the Silk Road, a modest venue, The Harbinger Gallery in Waterloo, Ontario, recently presented an exhibition of ceramics, titled “West Meets East.” It included work by artists who acknowledge influences from Chinese traditions of ceramics. Sin-ying Ho’s sculptural pieces in white porcelain with blue figures seem very obviously linked to the blue-and-white patterns often associated with Chinese pottery, while at the same time bringing to mind the Dutch delftware which became so popular

in England in the 17th century.

Ho's Artist's Statement (Appendix 1) addresses several ideas which raise intriguing questions. "In my work," she writes, "I demonstrate that visual signs and linguistic symbols are equally important for tracing and recording human history, culture, and geography." She uses computer binary codes and images of popular cartoon figures as ornamentation on her sculptures (Figure 3), which suggest vases but often are not traditional vase shapes (Figure 3). These binary codes and cartoons merge with symbols from much older cultures and figures from well-known paintings (Figure 2) to create complex surfaces, recording the intersections of many cultures, eastern and western.

"My collision course of cross-cultural experience speaks to universal concerns." This is Ho's last sentence. And, of course, she is right. Perhaps there was no richer "collision course of cross-cultural experience" than that represented by the Silk Road, that fabled route along which traders, thinkers, products and ideas traveled between cultures of east and west, through the early centuries of European and Asian contact. It has become almost a metaphor, in contemporary times, for bridges of understanding across widely differing lands.

A ceramic artist, Sin-ying Ho exemplifies that bridging. She was born in Hong Kong, immigrated to Canada, and currently resides in New York City. She holds a BFA from the Nova Scotia College of Art and Design and an MFA from Louisiana State University. Her work has been studied and shown from Harvard to Hong Kong. Her pieces are in the permanent collections of the Icheon World Ceramic Centre in Korea, Glenbow Museum in Canada, Yingge Ceramics Museum in Taiwan, and Guangdong Museum of Art, China.

There is every reason for Ho to believe that she is using the pottery traditions of China as the base for her sculptures. This blue-and-white pottery is closely associated with Chinese traditions of ceramics. Looking at trade along the Silk Road, though, and the movements of goods and ideas, suggests that this style of pottery has also participated in cross-cultural experience.

John Major, in an article for the Asia Society's website, writes about "The Arts of the Silk Road." Among other arts, he traces the movement of blue-and-white porcelain, which he says was produced in China from about the 13th century onward. He offers the following history. "Islamic potters decorated early (post-8th century) tin-glazed vessels with cobalt. Muslim merchants in Chinese coastal cities introduced the Islamic cobalt-decorated ware to China. In the late 13th century potters in South China began decorating white porcelain vessels with cobalt blue." The influence and the fashion spread, so that the Chinese pottery made its way back into Asia and the Middle East.

"The best cobalt-bearing pebbles for producing the blue glaze," Major writes, "came from rivers in Central Asia, and were transported by caravan to China for processing and use." So the Silk Road carried the original idea of this pottery to China and then transported the materials to make it, bringing back into the Middle East the products which were created. Sometimes, other pigments besides blue were used.

Then this blue-and-white pottery made its way through Spain into Holland, where in the 17th century, in Delft, it became the famous delftware, described as using some of the patterns from the "mysterious east." Some Dutch potters moved to England in the late 17th century and eventually British potters took up the fashion, making fine blue and white porcelain table ware which by the 18th century led to the closure of most Dutch factories. In the early twentieth century, renewed interest in Holland led to Porceleyne Fles Delft which is made and painted entirely by hand.

The images traced in blue onto the white porcelain have varied with the ages and the cultures. The early Chinese potters, according to Major, "often decorated export blue-and-white porcelain with tulips, pomegranates, Arabic script, and other motifs designed to appeal to a Middle Eastern clientele ..." The pottery made for the domestic market included Chinese ladies and gentlemen, rulers, flowers of China and other elements drawn from that landscape.

In Holland, windmills, tulips and figures in rural dress decorated the delft ware. In England, flowers and gardens were the favoured motifs, as well as figures from Greek and Roman mythology. Sin-ying Ho includes many of these traditional motifs, but then draws from a contemporary “landscape” of popular images, computer codes, and even commercial logos like those for Coca-Cola and McDonald’s (Figure 1). “I use computer language as part of the composition and metaphor to express, describe, and reflect collisions among cultures.”

Certainly, the inclusion of such images, as well as folk motifs from *Journey to the West*, among the traditional motifs associated with blue-and-white porcelain startles the viewer and gives rise to speculation about the meanings of the older imagery. The collision of their meetings on these porcelain forms seems to create an energy that pushes traditional pottery forms into new shapes, no longer the traditional urn or vase. For instance, Figure 2 suggests a musical instrument, with a classical composer, a Peking opera star, and a contemporary rock musician meeting on its surface. Figure 3 links The Monkey King to Charlie Brown and “Hello Kitty.” This collision also gives the images which surround us in 21st century culture new significance, drawing our attention to how the images of a culture reflect and define it.

So . . . like the poets, Sin-ying Ho’s sculptures in blue-and-white porcelain take the viewer on journeys – to the east, to its mysteries and markets, from a small private gallery in Ontario, Canada, along the Silk Road to China and back, into the Middle East, Holland and England, across the water to North America. When her sculpture is shown in China, the circle – or perhaps the spiral – takes another turn. Her work does demonstrate her interest in “exploring the idea of technology and our place in society,” through many eras and cultures. It also urges us to explore the mysteries of the Silk Road: economic, technological, artistic, cultural, linguistic.

SOURCES USED

Ho, Sing-ying. "Artist's Statement" for West Meets East, curated by Ann Roberts. Waterloo, Ontario: Harbinger Gallery, May 1-22, 2010. (Appendix 1)

Major, John. "The Arts of the Silk Roads," Asia Society website: <http://www.asiasociety.org/arts-culture/the-arts-silk-roads>.

Wood, Frances. *The Silk Road; Two Thousand Years in the Heart of Asia*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002.

<http://www.delfthuis.com/history>.

THE CLASSICAL AND CONTEMPORARY CONFUCIAN WAYS

Joseph A. Adler

美国凯尼恩学院的约瑟夫·艾德勒教授的论文《儒教的过去和现状》涵盖了孔子、孟子的学说以及现代新儒教。这篇论文对儒家教义和哲学思想的来源与发展做了详尽的论述。进而探讨了日益僵化的儒家传统和19世纪导致清朝覆灭的现代性之间的冲突，同时也检视了最近几十年来儒学惊人的复兴现象。

I: INTRODUCTION: THE CONFUCIAN WAY

The man we call Confucius lived from 551 to 479 BCE in eastern China. His actual name was Kong Qiu (Kong being the family name), but he is most often referred to as Kongzi, or “Master Kong.” He was the founder of a religio-philosophical tradition that became almost synonymous with Chinese culture. From the 2nd century BCE to the beginning of the 20th century, “Confucianism” (*rujiao*, literally “the teaching of the scholars”) was the official ideology of the Chinese imperial government and the reigning philosophy of education. This resulted in Confucian values eventually permeating all levels of Chinese society. Confucius thereby became a cultural icon and a symbol for both the glories and the failures of traditional Chinese culture.

The word “Way” (*dao*) happens to be the most fundamental concept in all three of the major text-based religions that have flourished over the last two millennia in Chinese culture: Confucianism, Daoism, and Buddhism. Each of them interprets *dao* differently, but their common ground is the belief that for human life to be fulfilled it must follow the Way, however it is defined.

Buddhism originated in India in the fifth century BCE and

entered China in the first century. The Buddhist Way is the “Middle Path” or the “Eightfold Path” (both “path” and “way” are *dao* in Chinese), which involves wisdom, morality, and mental cultivation. Daoism, at least in its classical form, took shape in several Chinese texts from the third and fourth centuries BCE, including the *Laozi* or *Daodejing* and the *Zhuangzi*. The Daoist *dao* is the Way of nature, which accomplishes all through *wu-wei*, or non-intentional actions; humans should emulate that naturalness in order to live harmoniously.

The Confucian *dao* is similar to the Daoist *dao*, but the point of reference is the social world, not the natural world. The Confucian *dao* is the ideal socio-ethical-political order. Confucius and his followers believed that this Way had been achieved in the distant past by the benevolent founders of the Zhou dynasty (11th – 3rd centuries BCE), but that it was no longer being put into practice by the rulers of their time. By reviving the ways of those ancient sage-kings, Confucius hoped to restore the moral character of the ruling class of China. Virtuous rulers would put in place a benevolent government, ordinary people would respond by emulating their rulers, and the resulting social harmony would allow each individual to fulfill his or her moral and creative potential.

Confucius lived during a time of social and political chaos. The Zhou dynasty had been founded in the mid-11th century BCE, and had flourished for about three hundred years. It began to decline in the 8th century BCE, after the original Zhou capital (Chang’an, today known as Xi’an) was overrun by a northern nomadic group called the Xiongnu. By Confucius’ time it had split into several warring kingdoms, each vying for supremacy.

Confucius was an itinerant teacher who regarded himself as merely a transmitter of the Way of the ancient sage-kings, not the creator of a new tradition. But in fact he was an innovator, being largely responsible for injecting ethics into the religion of the Zhou literate elite. Until his time, the religious practices of the aristocracy had centered on ritual sacrifice to ancestral and natural spirits and divination. Confucius redirected attention to the human, social realm

of family life, community life, and government – the beginnings of “Confucian humanism.” But this humanism was a religious humanism, because it was grounded in the belief in “Heaven” (*tian*), a semi-personalistic but mostly naturalistic absolute reality that engendered “virtue” or “moral power” (*de*) in human beings.

The best source for what Confucius actually taught is a collection of his sayings, brief conversations, and statements about him called the *Analects* or *Lunyu*. Although this text was compiled after his death by his students and several generations of their students, it has traditionally been regarded as an accurate representation of the Master’s thought and, to some extent, his practice. “Practice” here means, primarily, selected examples of his comportment in daily life: how he treated other people, how he listened to music, how he ate, how he dressed, etc.

This type of daily activity was included by Confucius in his understanding of “ritual” (*li*), a term that originally had referred more specifically to sacrificial ritual. Confucius broadened its meaning to include every human activity, which should be conducted, he said, with the same sense of reverence that one should have when sacrificing to gods or ancestors. Ritual so understood, or “ritual propriety,” was the uniquely human way of expressing the fact that human beings are fundamentally social beings. Our social relationships are constitutive of who and what we are: we are sons or daughters, brothers or sisters, fathers or mothers, etc. These relationships are primary characteristics of human beings, not secondary. What distinguishes the “noble person” (*junzi*) from the “petty person” (*xiaoren*) is an understanding of these basic facts and a dedication to strive toward perfecting one’s social nature. That perfection – probably not achievable but important as a goal nonetheless – was called by Confucius “humaneness” or “humanity” (*ren*) – a variant of the word for person or human (also pronounced *ren*). Thus for Confucius, to be authentically human is to be humane; this is the proper goal of human life and what makes it meaningful. Without *ren*, ritual (*li*) – no matter how perfectly performed – is meaningless (*Analects* 3:3). But ritual is necessary

in order to achieve *ren* (*Analects* 12:1). So *ren* is the necessary inner dimension of *li*, and *li* is the necessary outward expression of *ren*.

The reason that reverence is appropriate to the process of transforming oneself into a humane person is that “Heaven produced the virtue (*de*) in me” (*Analects* 7:22 or 7:23, depending on the edition), and Heaven is the Confucian symbol of the ultimate. One’s inherent virtue is one’s connection with something that transcends the mundane world and is therefore sacred. Yet the fact that such virtue is inherent in human nature means that the sacred is, in a sense, immanent in the human world; the potential or power enabling human beings to transcend their given conditions is immanent.

Another connection with the sacred in Confucian thought is “learning” (*xue*), which for Confucius primarily meant learning from the wisdom of the “sages” (*shengren*) who produced the Classics or Scriptures (*jing*). The Confucian Classics were thought to be the records of the divine sages who created some of the fundamental features of Chinese culture and the sage-kings who founded the Zhou dynasty, whose first three or four hundred years were thought to have been a glorious golden age of peace and benevolent government. Confucius regarded these sages as beyond the reach of ordinary humans, beyond even the achievement of perfect humaneness (*ren*). They were divine or semi-divine, as is suggested by the word we translate as sage, *shengren*, which is also used for “saint.” Similarly, the so-called “classics” were *jing*, the same word used later to translate the word *sutra* when Buddhism entered China from India. And the two words together, *sheng jing*, are in fact the Chinese translation of “Holy Bible.” This is why “scripture” is a better translation of *jing* than “classic.” So the Confucian understanding of learning is also a connection with the sacred. In addition to these texts, learning encompassed the arts, such as poetry and music.

All of this together – *wen* or literate culture – is part of the Confucian Way (*dao*). The *junzi* is one who practices moral self-cultivation (*xiu shen*) through learning, ritual propriety, and self-reflection, with the aim of making the Way prevail. This

encompasses not only the self-perfection of the *junzi* aimed at humaneness but also the perfection of society through benevolent government. Service in government was the highest calling for the Confucian *junzi*. Confucius himself apparently served in several minor positions, but never achieved his personal goal of being an advisor to a king. The next best position for him was to be a professional teacher, and this is how he was honored throughout later Chinese history, as the “First Teacher,” the “patron saint” of the teaching profession. His birthday, conventionally recognized as September 28, has traditionally been celebrated as Teachers Day in both mainland China and Taiwan.

II: MENCIUS AND THE CONFUCIAN WAY

The teachings of Confucius were spread by his disciples, in several different lineages and variations. The next great Confucian thinker was Meng Ke, called Mengzi (Master Meng) in Chinese and Mencius in English. His dates are less certain than those of Confucius, but he lived in the 4th century BCE and perhaps a little into the 3rd. While we know Confucius (based on the *Analects*) as a teacher, Mencius comes down to us, through the book bearing his name, as a philosopher who presents and defends his ideas through rational argumentation. He is best known for his argument that human nature (*renxing*) is inherently good – a claim that can be found implicitly but not explicitly in the teachings of Confucius. What he means by this, Mencius says, is that humans are born with the *potential* to achieve the virtues of humaneness (*ren*), rightness (*yi*), ritual propriety (*li*), and wisdom (*zhi*). That potential is innate in the form of specific, natural feelings, such as the feeling of commiseration, which can be consciously cultivated into the fully-developed virtue of humaneness. It is these concrete, naturally-occurring feelings that constitute the inherent goodness of human nature.

Mencius’ view of the goodness of human nature is a further development of Confucius’ claim that “Heaven produced the virtue in me.” It is restated by another text from the Mencian school,

the *Zhongyong* (The Mean in Practice), which begins with the line, “What Heaven ordains/confers (*tian ming*) is called human nature.” Mencius differed from Confucius in regarding sagehood as being within the realm of human possibility – in effect redefining sagehood as the theoretically achievable goal of humaneness.

The teachings of Confucius and Mencius constitute the core of “classical Confucianism.” In the 2nd century BCE, during the Han dynasty (206 BCE–220 CE), Confucianism became the official ideology of government. It was this government support that led eventually to the permeation of Chinese culture by Confucian values. However, after the fall of the Han, Confucianism fell into decline, while Buddhism and Daoism developed and gained popularity. (This was Daoism as a full-fledged religion, which originated in the 2nd century and was only loosely connected to the classical texts, *Laozi* and *Zhuangzi*.) It was not until the Song dynasty (960–1279) that there was a major revival of Confucianism. The new schools of Confucian thought that developed during this period collectively came to be known in the West as “Neo-Confucianism.”

III: NEO-CONFUCIANISM: RECONFIGURING THE CONFUCIAN WAY

Neo-Confucianism built on the Confucian-Mencian base – the pursuit of sagehood as an ethico-religious ideal – but added elements borrowed from or inspired by Buddhism and Daoism. For example, the Neo-Confucians developed sophisticated theories of mind and human nature, no doubt inspired by the intense Buddhist interest in the mind. They also adopted meditation as one method of self-cultivation, although it was never as central to Confucian practice as it was in Buddhism. Another new dimension of Neo-Confucian thought was an interest in cosmology, and several key concepts were borrowed directly from Daoism. So we might say that the Confucian Way expanded from its original socio-ethical-political focus to include psychology and cosmology. All of this, however, was still directed to the joint goal of perfecting the self

and perfecting society.

The Neo-Confucian school that emerged dominant from the 13th century onward was the Cheng-Zhu school, named after Cheng Yi (1033–1107) and Zhu Xi (1130–1200). Cheng Yi and his brother, Cheng Hao (1032–1085), developed a metaphysical terminology in which the earlier Confucian-Mencian concerns with human virtue, human nature, learning, and government could be embedded in a larger philosophical framework. The two key terms were *li* (“principle” or “order” – a different word from the *li* that means “ritual”) and *qi* (the “psycho-physical stuff” of which all existing things including mind and spirit – are composed). Zhu Xi, a few generations after the Cheng brothers, combined their ideas with those of several of their contemporaries, constructing a coherent system that dominated Chinese intellectual life for the next seven hundred years, and is still being actively studied and developed by scholars world-wide. Zhu Xi also developed an educational curriculum covering all levels of schooling and beyond. This included a book called *Family Rituals (Jia li)*, which became very popular in China, was reprinted throughout the ensuing centuries in many editions, and was regarded as the standard to strive for in the practices of ancestor worship and life-cycle rituals.

Another influential school of Neo-Confucian thought was developed in the Ming dynasty (1368–1644) by Wang Shouren (1472–1529, commonly called Wang Yangming) and his followers. Drawing in part on the ideas of a contemporary of Zhu Xi’s, Lu Jiuyuan (1139–1193, commonly called Lu Xiangshan), and therefore called the Lu-Wang school, this approach relied more on moral intuition than the Cheng-Zhu school, which emphasized the importance of intellectual inquiry in pursuit of the Way.

The teachings of the Cheng-Zhu school, beginning in 1313 under the Mongol Yuan dynasty (1279–1368), became the official basis of the civil service examination system through which government officials were selected, and remained so until 1905. This examination system was the most important avenue of social mobility in China. Therefore, although Zhu Xi’s system was motivated by his sincere

desire to help people achieve or approach Sagehood, his teachings quickly became politicized. Memorization of Zhu Xi's interpretations of the Confucian tradition became the goal of those hoping to get government jobs, ignoring the moral purpose of the whole system. And during the Ming and Qing dynasties (1368–1644 and 1644–1911), politicized Confucianism was used to support increasingly conservative agendas, such as absolute obedience of elders and strict subjugation of women to men.

IV: THE DECLINE AND FALL OF THE CONFUCIAN WAY

The last imperial dynasty, the Qing, was ruled by a non-Chinese ethnic group, the Manchus (who are today pretty much blended into the Han Chinese population). It had reached a pinnacle of success in the 18th century, but in 1793 the Qing emperor, Qianlong, rejected a request by King George III of Great Britain to establish trade relations. Britain needed markets for the products of its new industrial revolution, and it responded to the Chinese cold shoulder by growing opium in India and selling it illegally in China. The Opium Wars of the 1840s began a long series of catastrophes for China, including internal rebellions. Meanwhile Japan, which opened its doors to the West after over 200 years of self-imposed isolation, was becoming a modern industrial power, and defeated China in the 1895 Sino-Japanese War.

Chinese reformers in the late 19th and early 20th centuries tried various means of bringing China back to its feet, to no avail. The Qing dynasty fell in 1911 and was replaced by the Republic of China (ROC), which continues today in Taiwan. But the early republic was rife with corruption and very weak. In the 1920s the Chinese Communist Party arose and began a long civil war with the ruling Nationalist Party (Guomindang, or KMT) of the Republic, led by Chiang Kai-shek. Mao Zedong rose to prominence in the Communist party and became its leader. After the Japanese occupation of Manchuria in northeast China in the 1930s, the Nationalists and Communists temporarily joined forces against the Japanese. This

continued through World War II until the Japanese defeat in 1945. The Nationalists and Communists then resumed their civil war, and in 1949 the Communists won, driving the Nationalist government offshore to the island of Taiwan. On October 1, 1949, Mao Zedong stood on the reviewing stand of the Gate of Heavenly Peace (Tiananmen) in Beijing and declared, “China has stood up” – alluding of course to the century and a half of decline, humiliation, and subjugation. This was the founding of the People’s Republic of China (PRC), which today governs the Chinese mainland.

V: CONFUCIANISM IN CHINA TODAY

This brief historical background is necessary to understand the vicissitudes of Confucianism in the 20th century. The “New Culture Movement” in the early part of the century was based on the premise that virtually everything about China’s traditional culture was holding it back from becoming a modern nation-state. High on the list of culprits in this blanket rejection of traditional China was Confucianism. Under the banner of science and democracy, the reformers felt that there was nothing worth salvaging in Confucianism. They especially criticized Confucianism for its age and gender-based hierarchies, which had become quite rigid during the Ming and Qing dynasties. Communist thinkers also joined this anti-Confucian trend, so by the time of the Communist victory in 1949 Confucianism in mainland China seemed virtually dead.

At the same time, some intellectuals felt that Confucianism, too, could be reformed, especially by engaging in dialogue with Buddhism and Western philosophy. These thinkers were sowing the seeds of what later became known as “New Confucianism,” which some call the “third epoch” of the Confucian tradition (after Classical and Neo-), and still continues today. But the tide in the first few decades of the 20th century was clearly against them.

After the Communists took power in 1949, anti-Confucian rhetoric only increased. In addition to their professed opposition to social hierarchies, they viewed Confucianism as a “feudal ideology”

– despite the fact that the Chinese socio-political system hadn't been feudal since the Zhou dynasty. "Feudalism," according to the Marxist theory of history, is an inevitable stage prior to capitalism, which in turn will inevitably be replaced by socialism. China had not even entered the capitalist stage, but the Maoist program of radical social reform attempted to leap-frog into the socialist stage. For example, they reorganized society into rural communes and other "work units" (*danwei*), which essentially replaced the extended family as the basic social unit. Confucian ethics had been based on the family, so any remnants of Confucian thought were, obviously, regarded as a millstone around the neck of the "New China." All traces of it had to be ruthlessly eliminated, along with all forms of religion. (They drew a sharp and simplistic distinction between "ideologies" and "religions.")

The harshest repression came during the "Great Proletarian Cultural Revolution" of 1966–1976. This was instigated by Mao Zedong. Schools and universities were closed and young people were urged to join the roving bands of "Red Guards" who destroyed temples and other cultural artifacts of traditional China; they harassed and violently punished anyone suspected of being sympathetic to Western or traditional Chinese culture. This was part of Mao's theory of "continuing revolution," aimed at maintaining the ideological purity of the party and the country. Another feature of the Cultural Revolution was the staging of mass rallies in the newly-cleared Tiananmen Square (the largest public open square in the world, cleared specifically to accommodate these rallies). At these rallies, up to a million Red Guards and others would wave their "little red books" of quotations from Chairman Mao, many of them swooning in their love and reverence for the Chairman. Mao was treated very much like the charismatic founder of a new religion. Overall, the ten years of the Cultural Revolution were a nightmare, which virtually all Chinese today deeply regret.

An example of the overheated rhetoric of the Cultural Revolution is a pamphlet, issued in English translation in 1976, entitled *Workers, Peasants, and Soldiers Criticize Lin Piao and*

Confucius,¹ containing sixteen short essays with such titles as “Innate Knowledge’ Is Utter Nonsense” (innate knowledge was a central concept in Wang Yangming’s philosophy) and “To Show ‘Benevolence’ to the Enemy Is to Betray the People” (“benevolence” is another translation of the central Confucian virtue, “humanity” [*ren*]). The opening paragraph of the “Publisher’s Note” to this collection reads:

Confucius was a reactionary who doggedly defended slavery and whose doctrines have been used by all reactionaries, whether ancient or contemporary, Chinese or foreign, throughout the more than 2,000 years since his time. The bourgeois careerist, renegade and traitor Lin Piao was a thorough devotee of Confucius and, like all the reactionaries in Chinese history when on the road to their doom, he revered Confucius, opposed the Legalist School and attacked Chin Shih Huang, the first emperor of the Chin Dynasty (221–207 BCE). He used the doctrines of Confucius and Mencius as a reactionary ideological weapon in his plot to usurp Party leadership, seize state power and restore capitalism in China.

Lin Piao (today written Lin Biao) had been Mao’s heir apparent, but his son was involved in a plot to overthrow Mao. The plot was discovered, and the whole family died in a mysterious plane crash while trying to flee the country. The pairing of Lin Biao and Confucius is an example of how the primary targets of criticism were potential opponents of Mao within the Party. If Confucianism had been virtually dead before the Cultural Revolution, those ten years left no doubt whatsoever.

After Mao died in 1976, his chief henchmen who supported the Cultural Revolution – called the Gang of Four, one of whom was Mao’s wife, Jiang Qing – were quickly arrested and thrown into prison. (Jiang Qing later committed suicide there.) In 1978, leadership fell to Deng Xiaoping, who soon began a process of liberalization and opening to the West. This included the gradual

rehabilitation of temples and monasteries, and permission to scholars to study Confucianism again, not as a feudal ideology but as a legitimate philosophical system that was an essential part of traditional Chinese culture. This loosening of restrictions on thought and scholarship was a gradual process that is still continuing. In 1982 a new constitution was adopted that recognized freedom of religious belief, although it placed limits on religious practice and reserved for the state the right to declare what was a religion. Only five religions have legal standing: Daoism, Buddhism, Islam, Protestant Christianity, and Catholicism. Confucianism is still not officially regarded as a religion.

The 1980s began the period of astounding economic growth that continues in China today. Private enterprise was permitted for the first time since 1949; the central planning that was one of the hallmarks of Communist rule was relaxed; and the government divested itself of many state-owned industries. Social restrictions were likewise relaxed; for example, people could travel around China and even overseas without permission from their work units. People began to imagine the possibility of being ruled by a government that was less insular and more accountable to its citizens than ever before. Since the 1990s Chinese people have largely given up their hopes for political reform, at least for the time being, and have concentrated on economic development.

Since they had been so deeply indoctrinated with Communist ideology since 1949, many Chinese began to experience a moral vacuum in Chinese society. This stimulated renewed interest in Confucianism. In the 1990s, with China undergoing astounding economic growth, there arose what was called “Confucius fever.” Hundreds of books, both scholarly and popular, were written on Confucius and the Confucian tradition. On the scholarly side, beginning in the 1980s, mainland Chinese academics were finally able to pursue research that was not confined to the narrow ideological mold of the Marxist theory of history and “dialectical materialism.” Today Chinese scholarship on Confucianism is fully up to the standards of Western scholarship. By this I do not mean to imply

that Western scholarship is completely free of bias; my point is that now we are at least playing the same ball game.

In terms of popular culture, “Confucius fever” is likewise going strong. The most dramatic example of it actually crosses the boundary between the scholarly and popular realms. In 2006 a professor of media studies at Beijing Normal University (Beijing Shifan Daxue), Yu Dan, gave a very popular series of TV lectures on the *Analects* of Confucius. She then published them in a book called *Lunyu xinde*, or *Reflections on the Analects*.² This book, published in 2007, became a huge best-seller in China, a real publishing phenomenon, with over four million copies sold in its first eight months in print.³ The book has been described as a kind of *Chicken Soup for the Soul* (or *Wonton Soup for the Soul*); that is, a comforting, non-challenging collection of bland moral clichés.⁴ Still, it demonstrates that people are searching for something, and that they now regard Confucius and Confucianism with some admiration and pride.

Even the PRC government has gotten into the act. High government officials have attended conferences celebrating the birthday of Confucius,⁵ and have acknowledged him proudly as a great contributor to a glorious Chinese tradition – exactly the opposite of the harsh anti-Confucian rhetoric of the early 20th century and the recent past. But this explicit government support must be understood in a political context. The ruling party has, over the past twenty years or so, been strongly promoting Chinese patriotism or nationalism. This occasionally gets away from them, for instance when people have taken to the streets to demonstrate against some perceived insult to China by Japan or the West. The 2008 Olympics in Beijing were an opportunity for them to show on the world stage, and they certainly took advantage of it.

In this context, it seems clear that the PRC government’s support of Confucianism is politically – even geo-politically – motivated. First, they are reclaiming traditional Chinese culture as one of the world’s great civilizations. In fact there is a wide-ranging strategy of claiming that Chinese civilization was the world’s *first*

great civilization. Second, they are claiming Confucius, the world-renowned philosopher whose ideas permeated traditional Chinese culture, as their own. For the past ten years or so the government has sponsored the establishment of “Confucius Institutes” all over the world. Along the lines of Germany’s Goethe Institutes and France’s Alliance Française, the Confucius Institutes are educational centers for the study of Chinese language and culture. This is part of China’s “soft diplomacy” to gain stature on the world stage. Third, China’s current president, Hu Jintao, has made “a harmonious society” (*hexie shehui*) his signature socio-political slogan. This is clearly an attempt to stifle dissent, which is constantly boiling up in local demonstrations against government confiscation of property and other local issues. The fact that “harmony” has been a Confucian watchword since the earliest times suggests that the government views Confucianism as a potential ally in their attempt to maintain “social stability.”

The latest manifestation of this agenda is actually quite startling. In January of 2011, a 31-foot tall bronze statue of Confucius was erected in Tiananmen Square. Actually it was on the edge of the square, in front of China’s newly renovated National Museum. The irony of this is hard to beat. Less than forty years earlier, Tiananmen Square had been the site of those mass rallies at which Mao Zedong was worshipped and Confucius was cursed. That very Confucius, who not so long before was Public Enemy Number One in China, was now regarded as a symbol of China’s greatness. Nevertheless, the statue in Tiananmen Square must have crossed a line for some in the Party, for during the night of April 20, 2011, the statue mysteriously disappeared.⁶

There is not a consensus on the question of the religious nature of Confucianism, although scholars in the field of religious studies generally understand it as a religious tradition. The problem is partly a semantic one and partly due to the particular character of Confucian thought and practice. One semantic question concerns the reifying connotations of speaking of it as “a religion,” given that it is not, at least since the demise of the imperial Chinese

examination system and court rituals, an institutionalized religion. But neither is Chinese “popular religion” institutionalized, yet no one denies that it is religious; it simply is not referred to as “a religion.” Confucianism can indeed be understood as an example of “diffused religion” (a term coined by the sociologist C. K. Yang in the early 1960s⁷), which is religion that is practiced in largely secular social settings. The settings for Confucian practice are the family, the community (interpersonal relations), and until the end of the last dynasty, the state (government).

Another semantic problem involves the Sino-Japanese words for “religion:” *zongjiao* in Chinese and *shūkyō* in Japanese, which are different pronunciations of the same Chinese characters (*kanji* in Japanese). This word was coined in the late 19th century by Japanese translators of treaties and Western-language texts and was later adopted by the Chinese. These translators felt that Christianity was a different sort of thing than the various Chinese and Japanese “teachings” (*jiao / kyō*), such as Buddhism and Daoism, and “ways” (*dao / dô* or *tô*), such as Shinto. Christianity demanded exclusive allegiance, while Buddhism, Daoism, and Shinto could be mixed and matched unproblematically by individuals. Christianity strongly emphasized belief in particular doctrines, while the East Asian traditions emphasized action more than belief. *Zongjiao / shūkyō* fit the bill, because *zong / shū* means “sect” and implies exclusive membership, and *jiao / kyō* (“teaching”) implies doctrine. *Zongjiao / shūkyō* therefore have connotations of a foreign, exclusive, doctrinal religion.⁸ When Chinese or Japanese people, then, say that Confucianism is not a “religion,” they of course are saying that it is not a *zongjiao / shūkyō* – which is correct if we understand that word as unpacked above. But when asked whether it is a *jiao*, like Daojiao (Daoism) or Fojiao (Buddhism), they are likely to agree, because in Chinese it is in fact called Rujiao.

The Confucian Way originated as a particular solution to a period of social and political chaos in ancient China. It developed into a religious humanism or humanistic religion, based on the belief that human nature is inherently good and that its goodness

is its connection to “Heaven,” the Confucian term for the absolute reality. Although it has not always been recognized and practiced as a religious tradition, it has profoundly shaped the cultures of China, Japan, Korea, and Vietnam. As of the beginning of the 21st century, the third generation of the “new Confucians” are the elder generation of Chinese and Chinese-American scholars, who have trained a large contingent of younger scholars, most of whom are Chinese, Korean, Japanese, Chinese-American, and Euro-American. This latest generation, for the most part, are less apt to be considered “Confucians” themselves; they are generally seen as scholars of Confucianism. However, since “Ru” really means “scholar,” the distinction is not a sharp one. Due largely to the influence of the third and fourth generations of Confucian scholars, the Confucian Way is increasingly being taken seriously as a significant contributor to the cross-cultural dialogue of religions and to comparative philosophy.

Notes

- 1 Beijing: Foreign Languages Press, 1976.
- 2 Yu Dan, *Lunyu xinde* (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 2007). It has been translated into English as *Confucius from the Heart*, trans. Esther Tyldesley (New York: Atria Books, 2009).
- 3 Sheila Melvin, “Modern Gloss on China’s Golden Age,” *New York Times*, September 3, 2007 (<http://www.nytimes.com/2007/09/03/arts/03stud.html>).
- 4 See, for example, Daniel A. Bell, *China’s New Confucianism: Politics and Everyday Life in a Changing Society* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008), Appendix 1.
- 5 See Wm. Theodore de Bary and Richard Lufrano, eds., *Sources of Chinese Tradition*, 2nd ed., vol. 2 (New York: Columbia University Press, 2000), 581-583.
- 6 Andrew Jacobs, “Confucius Statue Vanishes Near Tiananmen Square” (*New York Times*, April 22, 2011 (<http://www.nytimes.com/2011/04/23/world/asia/23confucius.html>)).
- 7 C. K. Yang, *Religion in Chinese Society: A Study of Contemporary Social Functions of Religion and Some of Their Historical Factors* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1961).
- 8 See Anthony C. Yu, *State and Religion in China: Historical and Textual Perspectives* (Chicago: Open Court, 2005).

SHOWDOWN AT KONG TEMPLE: MODERN POLITICS AND THE CONFUCIAN MATERIAL HERITAGE

James Flath

加拿大西安大略大学历史系的弗莱斯教授的论文《孔庙的争执：现代政治和儒家物质遗产》考查了20世纪人们对中国儒教的物化形态——孔庙的态度的历史变迁。位于山东曲阜的孔庙成了一个20世纪中国反对旧文化斗争的焦点，并且出人意料地成为一个“有争议的纪念地”并且留存下来。

Kong Temple, the spiritual home of Confucius, has always been subject to political intrigues, and even in the pre-modern era, China's scholar elite lamented the destruction of the 'ancient culture' (*siwen*) by politics. But these feelings had always been subsumed by the hope that, like the temple's ancient junipers that miraculously revived themselves after decades and even centuries of dormancy, Confucianism would eventually pull itself out of its funk. This aura of cultural power, supported by an incredible legacy of imperial patronage, had sustained the temple as a ritual centre for over 2,000 years. By the end of the Qing dynasty, however, politics had begun to undermine faith in Confucian worship and with the success of the 1911 Revolution, the support for Kong Temple narrowed to political factions seeking to bolster conservative legitimacy through appeals to sacred traditions and the dwindling influence of Confucius and his descendants. What remained of the aura suffered continual

erosion as the state-sponsored ritual structure was hollowed out and bent to the needs of self-serving warlords and the fragile republican state. In becoming what Pierre Nora refers to as a *lieu de mémoire* – a ‘site of memory,’ Kong Temple thereafter ceased to inspire and possess its audience, and was enlisted, for better or worse, as part of the national patrimony – a heritage object subject to the political process of heritage designation, protection, appropriation and exploitation that continues down to the present day.

The end of the dynastic system in 1911 placed Kong Temple in an awkward position. With the end of the Qing dynasty, the temple, and the lineage that maintained it, lost not just their principal means of support but also the balance of their political legitimacy. The State Sacrifices traditionally conducted at the temple in the spring and autumn were initially suspended by the Provisional Government, although Confucian supporters such as the Association for Confucian Religion (*Kongjiaohui*) soon found an ally in Yuan Shikai, who quashed radical dissent and restored the sacrifices. To support this edict, Yuan mandated the ‘Worshipping the Sage Code’ to govern the worship of Confucius and the maintenance of his relics, including an annual disbursement to support the direct costs of the sacrifice at Kong Temple, and guaranteed salaries for the temple guards, managers, custodians and ‘sacrifice officials,’ including the direct lineal descendant of Confucius who was to retain all his privileges as chief sacrificial officer and ‘Duke of the Sagely Posterity.’

Yuan’s imperial pretensions, however, quickly disintegrated, and within a few months of taking the throne in 1916, the dictator was dead. This was certainly a blow to anyone who may have hoped for a revival of orthodox Confucianism, and anti-Confucian radicals taking part in the New Culture movement were soon calling on China’s citizens to “beat the Kong Family Shop (*da Kong jia dian*).” But while the Confucian lobby was able to secure the instatement of the infant Kong Decheng as the new Duke of the Sagely Posterity in 1920, this renewed title did not come with state funding for the Kong family or for Kong Temple. With rent and tax from their

massive land endowments becoming difficult to collect by the mid-1920s, the Kongs were forced to beg and borrow the funds for temple maintenance and ritual performance from an increasingly dubious line of supporters, including the infamous Shandong warlord Zhang Zongchang.

In spite of these challenges, the Kong family and their supporters had thus far been able to retain at least the shades of imperial privilege by taking advantage of the divided national authority. But with consolidation of Kuomintang power, the Kongs increasingly found themselves subject to political realities that were beyond their control. In 1928 the 'Great Academy' (*Daxueyuan*) that served as the Nanjing Government's Ministry of Higher Education proposed a set of sweeping changes designed to secularize and nationalize the institutional forms of Confucianism that had survived to that point. These measures were to include the cancellation of Spring and Autumn Sacrifices, the abolition of the ducal title, the confiscation of Kong controlled land and unspecified 'reforms' to Kong Temple and cemetery. The ministry's initiative was eventually blocked by the powerful Minister of Commerce and Industry and Kong clansman H. H. Kung (Kong Xiangxi). But the debate, carried out in part through the press, had nonetheless cast Qufu and the remains of the Confucian institution in an unflattering light.

The sage and his descendants would suffer further damage to their reputation in 1929 when radical students at the Qufu Second Teacher's College organized anti-Confucian and anti-Kong family protests on the streets of Qufu, culminating in a deeply critical performance of the Lin Yutang play *Confucius Meets Nanzi*, in June 1929. Although Lin's treatment of Confucius was relatively benign, the Qufu performers played up the drama, making Confucius appear as a black-faced degenerate, and all within stones throw of his most sacred temple. Ten days later the students allegedly insulted the Japanese cabinet minister (and future prime-minister) Inukai Tsuyoshi and his traveling companion Zhang Ji, a KMT legislator who had been addressing a school assembly on the topic of 'Confucius as the root of the nation.' The Kong family charged

the school's headmaster with 'insulting the ancestor of Confucius,' pressing the Shandong Education Office to dismiss the headmaster and expel two student union leaders from the college. The writer Lu Xun would later refer to this case as a 'total victory' for the Kongs, but once again the Confucius family and institution were dragged through the national press: *Huabei fukan* commented that this was a case of "feudal forces attacking modern thought and art"; *Dagongbao* commented more charitably that "Confucius is being used by politicians to advance their agendas, just as he was used by emperors in the past."¹

Insult turned to injury during the Central Plains War of 1930 when Nationalist troops took shelter behind Qufu's massive city wall, prompting Yan Xishan to fire on the city indiscriminately, inflicting serious damage to Kong Temple and other ancient ritual sites within the vicinity. But serious as the physical damage was, it was known that in the past the temple had recovered from far worse – for the custodians and supporters of Confucius, the real damage was the irreversible violation of the temple's sanctity. It was part of local lore that throughout history, no matter how great the prevailing chaos, no army had ever dared to inflict damage directly on Kong Temple. In the 20th century the temple had more or less been able to withstand radical students and government meddling, but the mystique was shattered when modern militarists brazenly put their self-interest ahead of the need to protect the site.

In the 1930s the conservation logic began to shift decisively away from 'faith' and toward legal protection under a nationalist model. Since 1928 the Nationalist Government had introduced the 'Regulations Protecting Scenic Sites, Guji, and Antiquities' (*Mingsheng guji guwu baocun tiaoli*), a 'Regulation protecting the property of all Confucius Temples' (*Kongmiao caichan baoguan banfa*, June, 1929), a Committee for the Protection of Famous Historical Sites and Antiquities (*mingsheng guji guwu*) in Shandong, and the 'Antiquities Protection Law' (*Guwu baocun fa* – drafted June 1930, implemented July 3, 1931). While none of these committees, laws and regulations had managed to protect

Kong Temple from damage and depredation, they nonetheless established a mechanism for defining the role of government in defining and conserving heritage. In 1931 the Shandong provincial government assessed the temple's needs, produced a budget for a full restoration and launched a fundraising campaign. The campaign itself was a failure, raising only a small fraction of what was required, but the tone of the campaign is nonetheless interesting for what it indicates about the how the government rationalized the proposed restoration not out of respect for the sage but because the temple's maintenance was critical to national prestige:

The Confucius Temple in Qufu attracts visitors from all over the world. To promote culture, for more than two thousand years, Chinese governments have paid special attention to its preservation.... In antiquity, Chinese cultural relics were delicate and brilliant. Their fame even spread to Asia and Europe. If we permit their dilapidation, how can we promote education and advocate national glory?²

The project also served as a prelude to a more ambitious effort of the Nanjing Government to recreate Kong Temple as a Republican icon. In February 1934, Chiang Kai-shek announced his intention to set the nation on a path of neo-Confucian moral development through the New Life Movement. To mark the renewed commitment to Confucius, the Central Executive Committee designated 8/27 (lunar calendar) as 'Confucius Day' and created a national ceremony to be observed by various units of government, military, schools and other public organizations. The declared purpose of the ceremony was to promote awareness of the historical Confucius, to explain Confucianism, and to clarify the relationship between Confucius and 'the revolutionary thought of National Father Sun Yat-sen.'³

The main event was to be a modernized 'state sacrifice' at Kong Temple. Representatives arrived from every ministry and organ of the Nanjing and Shandong Provincial Government, not to mention students, common spectators and, for the first time, women (who

had traditionally been barred from entering the temple within three days of the ceremony). As observed by one reporter, the ceremony had a distinctly ‘modern’ flavor:

The participants of the ceremony fall into three groups according to costume. The first group is in military uniform. The second are elementary students dressed in white. The last are officials dressed in blue robes and a black jacket. We had no special permission so we could only stand in the eastern cloister, and were not permitted to approach the altar. The ceremony formally started at 7:00, and the procedure was as follows: 1) ‘su li’ (stand as a mark of respect), 2) Play music, 3) Sing (KMT) Party Anthem, 4) Offer flowers, 5) Read sacrifice text (祝文), 6) Ritual of three bows 7) Sing Confucius Memorial Song 8) Bow once, 9) Conclude ceremony and take pictures.⁴

For all the pageantry, however, little had been done to improve the material condition of Kong Temple. Fresh from the grand republican ceremony, Shandong Governor Han Fujun renewed his demand that the Nanjing Government provide repair funds. Remarkably, the Central Executive Committee of the KMT actually responded by drawing up plans for the repair and maintenance of Kong Temple and Confucius’ tomb, to be financed by a one-time pay out from the Central Government and ongoing funding from the provinces and municipalities to be contributed under a framework already established for funding the Sun Yat-sen Mausoleum in Nanjing. In 1935 the Nanjing Government ordered a general assessment of the condition of Confucian temples nationwide, and the next spring the party newspaper *Zhongyang ribao* carried the instruction that every province should re-establish their Confucian temples, prohibit their use as military barracks, and repair any damage that had been sustained through such misuse.

These investigations would include a thorough analysis of Kong Temple by Liang Sicheng. As China’s pre-eminent architectural historian, Liang’s mission was to construct a new awareness of

architectural heritage through education and scientific evaluation. In doing so he was proposing a new identity for ancient architecture, one that would demand a new form of conservation in which the emphasis would be not to recognize the ‘merit’ of the party that sponsored the restoration by giving it a ‘bright, new look’ (*huanran yixin*), but to respect the patina of time and the qualities of the ancient. He wrote in his Kong Temple study:

(in the past) the only goal was to restore collapsed buildings to make them splendid and grand palaces and mansions: those who would demolish the old ones and build new ones would be praised as possessing unrivalled merits and virtues. Today what we are seeking is to extend the longevity of the extant structure, unlike ancient people, who demolished the old structures and built new ones.⁵

Liang may simply have been concerned with preserving ancient architecture, but at the heart of his position there is a shift in values that emphasizes the work of anonymous craftsmen rather than the supposed merit of the sponsors of his own time. But if Liang thought that Kong Temple was about to receive a ‘bright, new look’ under the sponsorship of the rich and powerful he need not have worried. None of the support money promised by Nanjing ever materialized and Kong Temple was again plunged into limbo with the Japanese occupation in 1937. Kong Decheng and his KMT sponsors abandoned Kong Temple, and although they would make a brief return after the war, by 1948 the region was overrun by the People’s Liberation Army (PLA) and the former Duke could do little more than prepare for evacuation.

THE HOMELAND OF THE FOUR OLDS: NATIONAL HERITAGE IN COMMUNIST CHINA

When the People’s Liberation Army (PLA) entered Qufu in the summer of 1948, no one could have been certain about what attitude the Chinese Communist Party would adopt regarding the physical

relics of Confucianism. Supporters might have found hope in Mao's 1938 comments that "we should sum up our history from Confucius to Sun Yat-sen and take over this valuable legacy."⁶ They may have also been heartened by the fact that PLA commanders had banned the use of heavy artillery when laying siege to Qufu, allowing the defenders to leave the city and meet their executioners outside the city's South Gate. Once in control of the city, but still wary of the potential for counterattack and the ongoing militarization of local society, the PLA posted a bluntly appropriate directive outside the temple:

- 1) Do not fire weapons or shoot birds within the temple
- 2) Do not damage artifacts or trees
- 3) Do not defecate or urinate in the premises
- 4) Note the location of air raid shelters
- 5) Obey the instructions of the security guards.⁷

When the communist mandate began to stabilize in the early 1950s, the government adopted a more conventional attitude toward maintaining the historical relics. From 1949 Qufu had begun to receive annual maintenance budgets from the provincial government. In 1957-58 Kong Temple experienced extensive repair, so that when sinologist Joseph Needham visited in 1958, he found the temple in a state of "excellent preservation and carefully looked after. Much repainting and regilding had been done."⁸ These tentative steps suggest that Kong Temple was an unresolved issue for an administration that had not yet come to terms with history and material culture. But when the PRC celebrated its decennial in 1959, the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) shed its reserve, commissioning a series of high profile building projects that included a full restoration of Kong Temple in preparation for its grand reopening later that year. To mark the occasion Guo Moruo, then serving as president of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, made a carefully scripted visit during which he emphasized that the

temple was being maintained not out of respect for Confucius, but out of respect for the idea that Confucius and his relics could be appreciated as historical entities independent of modern politics.

In the following years this view of Confucius and his relics as historical entities moved toward political respectability, with the Three Kongs (Kong Temple, Kong Mansion and Kong Cemetery) joining an elite list of National Heritage Sites in 1961. By the end of that year Confucius was also coming into respectability as a topic of discussion at academic institutions across the country, including a conference on Confucius' thought organized by Liu Shaoqi and Zhou Yang at the Historical Institute of Shandong in Jinan. In light of its modern history, however, and in spite of Guo Moruo's inclinations, Kong Temple had come to represent not just Confucius but an entire class of conservative politicians ranging from dynastic emperors to Yuan Shikai, Chiang Kai-shek and now Liu Shaoqi. As the prevailing politics began to shift against Liu's faction, Kong Temple was about to be dragged into the midst of a major intra-party dispute.

Seeking to restore his authority, and presumably to prevent the revolution from taking 'the capitalist road,' Mao Zedong prepared to launch the Cultural Revolution to bring down such 'reactionaries' as Liu Shaoqi, and to destroy the remnants of the 'old society' that seemed to support them. In being associated with Liu and in standing as the #1 representation of 'old society,' Kong Temple was immediately imperiled, and in the autumn of 1966 the Communist Party Central Cultural Revolution Leadership Committee gave the Red Guards permission to gut the Three Kongs, leaving only the empty buildings for use as a museum of anti-Confucianism. The Red Guards carried out their work with dedication and by the end of the year the temple had been stripped of all its trappings and reduced to its bare architectural form. Although the violence would subside by early 1967, the Three Kongs would again fall under intense scrutiny when Jiang Qing and the so-called Gang of Four launched the 'Anti-Lin Biao, Anti-Confucius' campaign. But while the rhetoric of this movement was no less vitriolic than the 1966 campaign, the effects

on Kong Temple were less dramatic. Instead of seeking to destroy the last vestiges of Confucius' material legacy in order to declare the singular supremacy of Mao Zedong, in 1974 the radicals were more interested in using the Three Kongs as material evidence of the crimes committed by their 'reactionary' enemies.

When the political winds turned against the Gang of Four several years later, so did they turn in favor of Kong Temple. In May 1978, with Mao dead, the Gang of Four in prison, and Deng Xiaoping vying for control of the state, the embattled vice-premier received a strong gesture of support when Li Xiannian became the first senior leader to visit Kong Temple since Deng's own appearance fourteen years earlier. Li's brief stopover in Qufu represents a general turn toward rehabilitation and a regime under which ancient relics could once again be valued and conserved as independent historical artifacts. Kong Temple, however, had never in the 20th century been free of political association, and given the intensity of the attacks on Confucius and his relics in the forgoing decade, it would be naive to suggest that Li was simply indulging his curiosity. In backing Kong Temple and ordering the rehabilitation of the temple custodians, Li was effectively backing the reform policies that Deng would confirm at the Third Plenum of the Eleventh National Congress later that year. Having been the focal point of so many factional struggles culminating in the Cultural Revolution, Kong Temple now stood for rehabilitation, and through rehabilitation Kong Temple inevitably gained an association with the new politics of 'reform and openness' (*gaige kaifang*).

Initially the rehabilitation of Kong Temple and its associated relics was focused on material reconstruction and economic development. In 1979 the province restored substantial funding to the complex and reopened it to domestic and international tourism. By 1986 the temple had been fully restored and the statues of Confucius and his disciples had been returned to their seats of honor. Politics, however, were never far below the surface and through the 1980s and 1990s Kong Temple received high profile public visits from party elders like Deng Yingchao and Wan Li,

international leaders including Singapore President Lee Kuan Yu, party ideologues like Gu Mu and Hu Qiaomu, and political heavyweights like Zhao Ziyang, Li Ruihuan, Li Peng and Jiang Zemin. Of course even Jiang Zemin is entitled to see the sites of Chinese ancient civilization, but as with Li Xiannian's visit a decade earlier, these activities have to be understood as being, if not a form of patronage, then at least as politically motivated.

That politics, as Michael Nylan argues, circulated around the need for Chinese and 'Greater Chinese' authorities (i.e. Lee Kuan Yu) to establish an 'alternative modernity' that could differentiate East Asia from the Western developmental paradigm. In this atmosphere Confucianism could be presented as "a plausible unifying theory ... (that) might fill that vacuum and decrease the forces of regionalism, while forging the much-desired economic and political integration of 'Greater China.'"⁹ Under that political logic Kong Temple could be identified as historical evidence of the material progress that could be achieved under a Confucian managerial regime. These policies were usually implied rather than stated, although when the Three Kongs were nominated for recognition as a UNESCO World Heritage Site in 1994, this rationale was presented in explicit terms. According to the nominating committee, the complex should be valued not only for its 'outstanding artistic value', but also because it represented "China's progress in material civilization in terms of architecture", and because of the "huge impact" of Confucianism on "modern ideological and management systems."¹⁰

In suggesting that the roots of the present-day political economy were lodged in Kong Temple, the statement implied an uninterrupted continuity in Chinese material, ideological and 'management' culture from ancient times up until the present. Yet the statement also overlooks the fact that China had been deprived of any such consistent notion of progress, ideology or management, and that owing to its symbolic ties with political conservatism, Kong Temple's reputation and material condition shifted repeatedly from honor and integrity to ignominy and depredation, and back again – all depending on fluctuations across the political spectrum. Ironically,

this forgetting is made possible by the massive disruptions that essentially stripped Kong Temple of the last remains of its classical aura and left it thus exposed to political appropriation.

Pierre Nora's point is that an 'environment of memory' (*milieu de mémoire*) was 'perpetually actual' – evolving, unconscious, open to manipulation and appropriation, forgettable as well as memorable. *Lieux de memoire* on the other hand are described as the reconstructed remains of the past – produced through analysis and criticism, and void of any sense of the sacred, heroic or mythical.¹¹ In respect to Kong Temple, it might be argued that before the imperial Chinese social and cultural structure began to unravel in the 19th century, and perhaps as late as the first decades of the twentieth century, the temple had enjoyed a meaningful reputation as the pivot in a Confucian culture. But in losing the support of canonical texts, practices and associations, Kong Temple became subject to a different set of values dominated by politics and the negotiation of the site as a national patrimony. Because patrimonies tend to be contested by their heirs, and because of the temple's enduring materiality, it also proved capable of undermining nationalist histories and complicating its own heritage status. Ritual could be liquidated or appropriated, but the architectural complex could not be disassociated from its foundations, and so continued to create both opportunities and problems for those who sought to use the edifice for the promotion of their own initiatives. Each of these initiatives claimed the mantle of the nation but by virtue of its materiality, Kong Temple warped and derailed efforts to involve it in any notion of progress. The temple thus emerged less as a symbol of the 20th century nation than a model for its contestation.

Notes

- 1 *Kongzi jiazhu quanshu*, pp. 218-25.
- 2 Li Guannan 'Reviving China' PhD Dissertation, University of Oregon, p. 450
- 3 Letter from Central Executive Committee of Kuomintang to the National Government requesting a Public Proclamation on the Means to Offer Sacrifice to Confucius' June 1934 in *Zhonghua Minguo shi dangan ziliao xuanbian* pp.

- 530-31.
- 4 'Sacrifice ceremony for Confucius' birthday in Qufu' *Shishi yuebao* 4 (11), 1934.
 - 5 Liang Sicheng 1935, p. 1.
 - 6 Role of the Chinese Communist Party in the National War *Selected Readings from the works of Mao Zedong* 1967, 155-56 (in Kam Louie, p. 21).
 - 7 Dazhong ribao 1948/6/21, reprinted in *Shandong shengzhi: Kongzi guli zhi* 712.
 - 8 'Needham 'Archeological Study Tour in China, 1958' *Antiquity* 33 (130) 1959, p. 116.
 - 9 Michael Nylan, *The Five Confucian Classics*, 2001, 337
 - 10 UNESCO Report, 2003.
 - 11 'Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de Mémoire', Pierre Nora *Representations*, No. 26, Special Issue: Memory and Counter-Memory (Spring, 1989), pp. 7-24, p. 7-9.

LITERATURE IN CHINA: An Overview for 2008-2009

Ye Bai

中国社科院文学研究所研究员白烨教授的论文《文学在中国：2008-2009》回顾了2008-2009年度当代中国文坛蓬勃发展的景象（包括网络出版物），研究了网络文学和纸质文学的外在形态。他认为网络出版物应该受到更多文学机构的关注，因为对西方读者来说，它是一种能够打开视野的新事物。

PREFACE

China experienced an extraordinary and eventful year in 2008. Throughout the year the public dealt with a continuous barrage of major, unexpected and out-of-the-ordinary events as well as a vast array of complex issues, getting ready to host the Olympics in Beijing and dealing with the aftermath of the terrible earthquake in Wenchuan, Sichuan Province. Popular sentiment faced unprecedented emotional challenges, with emotions ebbing and flowing like the tides. The tremendous impact of the events made the year an unforgettable one.

As a mirror of happenings within society, literature can seek to reveal reality. Not surprisingly, the multitude of social and historical events in 2008 were reflected in and portrayed by increasingly diverse approaches in literature. This developing channel linking societal events and artistic activities has gradually and delicately transformed the country's literature. While the interactions and connections between the passion of literature and the emotional fabric of society may have been rare in the past, this year they became a fundamental component of literary development and progress.

I: DEVELOPMENTS IN LITERARY DIVERSITY

“Steady progress” and “rich harvest” are the words that capture the essence of 2008’s literary output. These terms represent the elements of stability and progress that have defined recent literary development and also highlight the richness of the harvest and its abundant variety. This variety has provided readers with new and different perspectives and resources, as well as offering fresh challenges for literary critics and observers. This has generated a mutually reinforcing interaction between creativity and literature, an interaction that keeps pushing each element forward.

For novels, the heavyweight of literature, 2008 saw a diversity and richness in topics and themes, and writers with varied backgrounds and artistic personalities who broadened the creative landscape.

Let us begin by taking a look at the field of traditional subject areas where many well-known authors and writers offered distinctive works that represent and signal breakthroughs in their own literary development.

Military themes: *I am the God Myself* by Yi-guang Deng and the *Academy Love Song* by Hua Chen follow military themes. The first depicts an awakening of consciousness in a struggle for individualism while the latter is a bittersweet coming of age story of ups and down in the military. Both are uniquely different from previously published novels on these themes.

Historical themes: *The Northern Ladies* by Li Ling vigorously portrays the political involvement of two peerless beauties in Mongolia during the Qing Dynasty. *Xi-Xia of Shi-Yang-Li* by Yi-ming Dang tells the story of rediscovering hidden historical sites that reveal how the Xi-Xia Dynasty came to its ultimate end.

Agriculture and rural life themes: *Xuan-Wu* by Aou Tu reveals how power is transferred within an operation, *Farmer Kingdom* by Zi-long Jiang is about perspectives in human transformation, and *Snow Ritual* by Pei-yuan Hu portrays the battle between righteousness and evil. These three novels focus mostly on quiet

transitions in grassroots power and each offers its own individual intrinsic and meaningful insights. *Landless Time* by Ben-fu Zhao with its imaginative writing style and profound views, describes a story set between city and countryside. *Because of Women* by Zhen Yan is about an innocent woman lost in lust who traps herself in a search for individuality and unbearable love.

There were also many distinguished and unforgettable works published on subject matter seldom previously written about. *August Rhapsody* by Kun Xu paints outstandingly fresh images of a city planner Li Shu-guang and the life of an architect. The author uses a unique style to portray how the younger generation associates and engages with the Olympic dream and the country's growing prosperity. *Masseuse* by Fei-Yu Bi describes for us the distinctive and real life world of a group of blind massage-therapists. *Palms Close Together* by De-fa Zhao portrays a group of younger generation monks and their challenges and inner torments as they struggle to make complex choices, and eventually to discover the meaning of life. *Miss Duo-He* by Ge-ling Yan is about a young Japanese lady's involvement in the lives of various Chinese families. It raises contradictory issues and complex matters about human nature during war-time. *Feng-Ya-Song* by Lian-ke Yan reveals the sorrow and agony in a relationship between a high school student and university professor. On a similar topic, *Professor* by Hua-dong Qiu portrays a restless mind racked by profound unease.

Several works by writers born after 1980 such as *A Short Time* by Jing-ming Guo, *May Queen* by Ge Yan, and *Lan-Ben-Jia-Yi* by Qi, Jin-nian represent enormous breakthroughs in their authors' creative writing styles. These outstanding works clearly go well beyond the classification of "young writers" in their literary achievement. In addition there were a number of surprisingly impressive works from other young writers, including *Nan-Piao* by Pei Pei, *The Tranquil Ya-Lu River* by Yan-zi Li, *Golden Cow River* by Jian-long Yang, *Xiang-Che* by Ping Ma, and *Ye-Nu* by Xiao-gang Liu.

The most compelling short stories and novellas in 2008 were ones that dealt with reality. *Paper Dove* by Shui-ping Ge describes parents dealing with a child addicted to spending his time on the computer. *State Order* by Shi-yue Wang, uses a flag-making factory to show how the enterprise brings perspectives from the outside world to the workers inside the factory. *Contact the Station* by Qiu-fen Ma is about how a farmer's complaints are mishandled by the city media. *Duo-Lai-Mi-Gu-Pai* and *Harder than Iron* by Shao-chong Yang explore the happenings at the bottom levels of government officialdom. *A Snowy Return Journey* and *Carving a Buddha Statue* by Xin-sen Nie present different perspectives and viewpoints on the disaster after a snow storm. *Daily Conversation* by Ye Qiao, *Basketball* by Jian Xiao, and *Mother's Green Ribbon* by Xin-yu Yan are also based on stories that occurred at the time of an earthquake disaster. While all these compositions closely depict reality, at the same time they also plant seeds which become rooted behind our conscious thoughts and inevitably touch our spirit. Whether to readers or to literature itself, these great creative efforts provide the richest of positive meanings.

In documentary literature, prose, and poetry, this year's subject matter included topics from history, reality, culture and relationships, often concentrating on prominent events such as the Sichuan earthquake and the preparation for the Olympics, as well as looking back at profound and memorable events from the last 30 years.

In documentary literature, it was the earthquake in Wenchuan, Sichuan that received overwhelming attention. The reports, written mostly by journalists for newspapers such as the Xinhua News Agency, provided close up descriptions of the events for their readers. Radio and TV stations also produced several documentaries including: "Victory Belongs to the Heroic Chinese People—An Up Close Look at the Wenchuan Earthquake Rescue and Relief," "Wenchuan Earthquake Relief in China," "A Xinhua Journalist's Journal During the Earthquake Rescue," "Earthquake Diary—from TV/Radio Reporters" and "Ten-days in Wenchuan."

A group of authors with military backgrounds wrote heroic stories about earthquake rescues for *The Wenchuan Catastrophe*. In *Moving Mountains* and *5.12 the Heartrending and Touching Moments of Wenchuan*, we get a close up view through the eyes of volunteers on the scene. We also have works by reporters including *The Survivors* by Xi-min Li, *The Children's Festival in the Ruins* by Ming-sheng Li, *Flowers of Heaven - Heartrending Life Memories from the Wenchuan Earthquake* by Yu Zhu, *Seven Shocking Days* by Si-yu Xiang, and *Rescue Stories* by Yu Zhao. These reporters and authors described the events and interviewed those involved in order to present and preserve genuine true stories from the rescue sites. The detail and accuracy of their reports help us understand this devastating event.

There was phenomenal prose written especially about the earthquake relief efforts that had extraordinary impact at the time and still continues to resonate strongly. Right after the earthquake, and still during the period of aftershocks, we read so many poignant stories through these reports including *Chanting from the Grass* by Jian-bing Wang, *Iron Metal - the Cry in the Wind*, *Mourning for the Ruins of Bei-chuan* by Xiao-juan Fang, *I am the Citizen* by Kang-kang Zhang, *Human Glory* by Ya-jun Chen, and *Nation's Mourning - Honor the Value of Life* by Long Li, as well as many more articles published on Internet blogs by anonymous writers. These works, in the way that they describe the sights and the sounds and the emotions, do so with a unique and novel perspective, and thereby provide an unforgettable and incomparably vivid historical record. The writing is ultimately a condensation of the thoughts and emotions of a nation.

The role of poetry in the aftermath of the earthquake was important and unique in how it gave vent to people's feelings and impacted what went on in their minds. After the earthquake, there were many expressive poems written describing touching scenes and articulating the compassion being felt. Many of these poems showed up on-line, on TV, on the radio, or in newspapers. One specific poem, published initially on the Baidu internet website and

titled “Hold Mommy’s hand, my child,” was printed in hundreds of newspapers. In total, there were over 15,000 earthquake related poems published and passed along on the Internet. Reciting poems became the most popular part of disaster relief events. Young and old, poets wrote, using calligraphy or printing, and contributed to different newspapers and literary periodicals. Publishers and magazines continued to receive submissions and were able to publish anthologies including *Special Earthquake Relief Edition of Poetry Magazine, Accompanied with Love – Wenchuan in 2008* and *Praise for Life*. The powerful outflow of poetry as a result of the earthquake captured the attention of those inside and outside the literary world. In a way, because of this devastating event, the unexpected boom in poetry has revived a passion for poetry and reopened a channel for poetry to reach the public.

This unexpected disaster with all its selfless rescues and the resulting bursts of human emotion, friendship and affection have helped this country’s people voluntarily connect and bond together to help each other. These powerful poems shone a path for people during their times of suffering, stimulating empathy, encouraging reflection and nurturing thoughts, becoming teaching materials and images for the entire country, and the rest of the world.

Regardless of differences in writing styles and focus locales, most of the writers headed in a similar direction, creating a significant and meaningful purpose from this traumatic event. Whether it was because of their own realization of social responsibility or their commitment to literature, the works of these authors have faithfully documented people’s accounts of these events, making them even more vivid. Furthermore, the personal experiences have allowed the writers to cultivate their own spiritual and emotional expression. Overall, the whole process has benefited literature, society, and the entire nation.

II: A RESHAPED PUBLISHING AND DISTRIBUTION ENVIRONMENT

In 2008, the literary publishing and distribution marketplace saw the emergence of three broad categories of works – traditional, market-oriented, and new media – with each category experiencing differing trends. The traditional category has continued to improve and has become more stable than ever. The most influential impacts, though, have been in the distribution of market-oriented literature and new-media literature, such as internet novels. Interestingly, throughout the tremendous structural changes in the industry, each area has been able to maintain its own importance and at the same time stimulate, motivate and interact with the other areas.

By using specialized marketing and media promotional tools the most popular works in two main groups can be made available to readers. The first group includes classic works and those with more serious content including Chinese classics, works by well known foreign authors, and those by contemporary local writers. The second group is made up of lighter literature on more casual topics such as office life, politics, science fiction, mystery, school life, and youth issues. Middle-aged literary mainstream readers and writers, including the critics, seem to pay more attention to celebrated novels and known, published writers. Younger readers, though, appear to show more interest in genre fiction from young authors. The result has created a confused situation for the public where the works that get the most attention and are most discussed among mainstream literary readers, writers and critics may not be as popular as other works that are latched onto by the general public, yet never get discussed within the mainstream literary world.

There were two major eye-catching industry developments in 2008. One was the growth of electronic literature, with its emphasis on genre fiction, and its move in becoming a top sales channel for distribution. The other, undertaken by Sheng-Da Literature Company, involved combining fragmented website resources and electronic development to create an authoritative and integrated

platform to capitalize on the new trends.

When internet novels first started to appear, there were no major differences from traditional and mainstream novels. As they developed as a literary form, though, changes inevitably began to occur. Internet novels gradually found their own nature, developing their own specialties and identities. These specialties and identities, together with the ramifications of internet publishing, led to the novels being categorized in different ways from traditional literature and mainstream novels. In 2008 the scale of change in genre classification extended to an unprecedented range of width and depth. Some of the most influential literary websites followed these methods and re-classified authors and their novels. A number of literary critics, from independent and literary websites, gradually began to move forward from using general classifications to using more detailed classifications.

In the distribution market, growth inevitably increased and popular topics frequently included mystery, science fiction, office life, martial arts and time-travel. According to 2007 statistics, genre fiction accounted for 45.1% of overall literary fiction. And, the quantity of genre fiction published on the internet is even more unimaginable. In the first six months of 2008 alone, the total amount of genre fiction published was over one hundred thousand titles. According to statistics provided by “China Book Sales Yearbook in 2008,” the 20 top-selling genre fiction titles accounted for half of the market. The topics typically were youth, science fiction, office life and politics. Genre fiction has provided great opportunities for new writers and attracted a tremendous number of readers. The particular writing style of genre fiction, attached and linked with reality as it is, has even begun to cause mainstream writers to become more observant of this form.

On June 20th, 2008, the researchers and creative team of the Chinese Writers’ Association conducted a seminar in Beijing entitled “Works of Cai Jun and Chinese Genre Fiction” to discuss four volumes of a mystery novel written by the young writer Cai Jun. This was the very first time mainstream writers from the Chinese

Writers' Association hand-picked an author from genre fiction to discuss openly in public. The critics at this seminar pointed out that,

genre fiction has had a very significant influence on readership and the impact on sales has been beyond what we could ever have imagined. We should take this opportunity to reflect and consider how, in light of these developments, serious literature can preserve its place in literary existence.

Since that event, there has been more attention paid to and increased focus on genre fiction. More critics have begun to participate in these discussions, something that had not happened prior to this event.

In August 2008 Zhejiang Province formed the first Genre Literature Association. The first edition of *Liu-Xing-Yue / The Illusion* magazine was also published in this province by a group of literary writers. The critical commentator He, Shao-jun wrote,

The essence of genre literature comes from literature itself, and the fundamental character of literature provides the communication pathway for both traditional and electronic literature. In other words electronic literature represents a scientific revolution in the development process of literature. Electronic literature is a brand new technology for the majority of us even though it does not affect how we associate with it and discuss it. But, if we really want to discover the essential meaning of electronic literature, we have to take further steps to understand the relationship between traditional and electronic literature. This magazine, *Liu-Xing-Yue / The Illusion*, has provided us with the accurate quintessence of electronic literature in genre literature. It presents us with an important platform from which to view cultural trends and broaden the viewpoints for young as well as mainstream readers.

The newly formed Genre Literature Association in Zhe Jiang province has not only received fixed funding each year; it also planned to hold an event for well-known genre fiction writers from the internet in the spring of 2009 at Chang-San-Jiao. The chief-editor of *Liu-Xing-Yue / The Illusion* magazine points out

In the past the public discussed light literature and electronic literature but now it does not seem to be appropriate in a way to define genre literature from these perspectives. According to Genre Film theory it is preferable to create an innovative definition in order to highlight the new significance behind it.

During the transition from electronic literature to genre literature, a number of literary websites also sought broader improvement. Several significant developments have profoundly extended the changes and now point towards even more extensive changes in future. The most important event occurred when Sheng-Da Literary Company was formally established, an event that generated tremendous feedback from the public.

On July 4, 2008, Shanghai Sheng-Da Electronic Development Company was officially founded in Beijing. Prior to its establishment, Sheng-Da invested significantly to combine various internet websites, including Chinese Net, Jing-jiang Net and Red Sleeves Net, into its “Electronic Literature Group.” The President of Sheng-Da Chen, Tian-Qiao, said,

We are taking a major step towards the center of the convergence in media. Not only has Sheng-Da developed a strong, independent operations center in literary copyright it has also added to that strength by combining information services and culture (the culture industry). It contributes in many fields including on-line interaction, image creation/PR, production, client development, resource accumulation and commercial innovation creating a new commercial model.”

Sheng-Da's CEO Hou, Xiao-qiang also explained that, the company generates the power to create an excellent environment for literary creativity. I am full of confidence about this freshly organized development and management approach. My colleagues and I will work together to construct a brand new outlook for electronic literary development and cultural transformation in the near future.

Some people have said that with the emergence of Sheng-Da's integrated approach to electronic literature, it is no longer a pile of individual fragmented pieces but has become a coordinated literary army.

Since Sheng-Da was established and began to operate many literary websites under this group (integration), it has developed authors and promoted their works in order to build a strong, competitive service. It also organized a novel competition for writers from thirty-one provinces and set the authors up on web sites to generate attention from new readers. The influence created by this organization has far exceeded what the traditional literary and mainstream efforts have produced. In fact, Sheng-Da has managed to combine website organization, agency operation, and copyright and publisher administration under one giant umbrella. This new operating model leaves traditional writing and distribution no choice but to face this fresh challenge and deal with the inevitable impact.

III: FACING THE PROBLEMS AND CHALLENGES OF NEW LITERATURES

During a period of transition and transformation, it is inevitable that new contradictions and challenges will have to be faced. It is paramount in this process of identification of new problems and the resolution of conflicts that literature gradually discover a new balance and build a path to further improvement. But when

incoming conflicts and issues are not paid attention to and dealt with seriously, then stresses build. From a macro point of view, there are four perspectives from which to explore these important issues.

1. There is an emerging concern that not enough attention is being paid to the new literary forms, especially with regard to an insufficient degree of literary research and criticism for market-oriented and new-media literature.

Since the mid-1990s, the publishing business, faced with an increasingly market-oriented culture, has shifted its practices and operations towards more market-oriented approaches targeted at mass readership and entertainment. This has changed the selection process for books to be published, from previously promoting small groups of well-known authors' works to now focusing on the more general mass market reader. Under these circumstances, rather than a small group of famous authors continuously taking the lead in publishing their works, youth literature and genre fiction have now stormed the stage and become extremely popular. With assistance from the media and the internet and the support of young readers, these two categories have become top sellers in the industry. Among the titles that have created a huge impact are *Du, La-la looking for a job* (office life), *Chief in Beijing* (politics) and *Ghost Blowing Light* (mystery/suspense). Even a few years after they were published, these works still remained best sellers with print runs of over a million copies. To build their reputations and future sale volumes, the authors have used their resources wisely and have worked with publishers to turn out sequels which have also become best sellers.

While literature is moving forward as it faces rapid change, there is one major element flowing against the waves and pushing it backwards. It is the absence of serious literary criticism. In recent years, considering the volume of market oriented literature being released, there has been very little involvement from literary critics commenting on these newly published works or on these up-and-coming authors. Two reasons explain this missing participation.

One is that mainstream critics lack enthusiasm for and show very little interest in popular works which they don't see as being worthy of serious attention. The other is that those who enjoy the works, the general public, do not have the background to provide high quality analysis and evaluation. But surely, being popular should not be seen as failure, and readers must have their reasons, be they cultural, social, or otherwise. There is an obvious need for comprehensive and convincing evaluation, analysis and comment from a literary perspective. Without the mainstream critics' participation, the general public cannot receive this input.

2. Multiple values and standards have caused confusion and a mixture of opinions, a situation that has been exacerbated by a lack of communication and tolerance.

With the opening up of public opinion in recent years, old ideas get modified constantly, new thoughts are generated continuously, and many diverse opinions exist simultaneously. But, at the same time, another problem has been created. Everyone can now raise their voices to promote their own ideas and hold fast to their own viewpoints. All individuals assume they are the ones who embrace the truth and therefore they cannot trust opinions that are different from their own. As a result, miscommunication and misunderstandings arise, and conflicts take place. This confusion often leaves those who are committed to pursuing long-term perspectives and ideas are being left out in the cold or having their influence diluted. This has made the literary environment less communicative, less respectful, and has created growing misunderstanding and dissatisfaction.

The emergence, and now prevalence, of the intertwining of marketing and media is not a simple matter, for each medium or marketing activity implicitly carries and transmits values that can have real but seemingly imperceptible effects on people's thinking. For example, the focus on profits and returns dominates how publishers select what to publish, with most attention being focused on the mass market, without thought for the principles of social or literary good. The "entertainment first" media (including paper, film, and internet) strategy of attracting eyeballs strives for a bigger

audience that can be converted into traffic, sales, and subscriptions, in an effort to receive the highest economic benefit. It has become profit-driven decision making. In the end, the so called “literary promoters” and “media executives” have in fact turned out to be nothing more than just “businessmen.”

This behavior and the content of current literature have had a profound impact on readers, not just on the surface, but also at a deeper level. Paradoxically, the abundance of views has heightened reader confusion. The fundamental literary concepts which were once firmly followed without question have now become bewildering and uncertain. For example, in literature, should “responsibility” overrule creativity; should entertainment dominate cultivation; should a balance be sought between commercial and social benefit; and should more concern be given to the intellect than to amusement? The arguments and miscommunication, with all sides operating in their own ways, have led to a lack of mutual understanding and communication and most notably a lack of proper literary harmony.

3. Readers need interpretation to assist literary comprehension, with different styles and topics needing different approaches. “Adaptation” and “satisfaction” cannot be the only approaches to meeting readers’ needs.

The reading of literature involves vast numbers of readers with very diverse tastes that can vary by age, background and interests. Generally, younger readers are likely to seek entertainment or catharsis in reading. Less educated readers tend to pick works that are exciting or on popular topics. White-collar readers are drawn to books on self-reflection or office life. Female readers are inclined to choose romance novels. These approaches likely satisfy the not unreasonable needs for many readers, but the result is inevitably to draw hierarchical differentiations, with readers at different levels of appreciation, with the mass market focused on the popular, or even the vulgar.

Therefore, satisfying the mass of diverse readers with different needs requires analysis and comment that is specific and with its own

flavor. To continue to focus only on “adapting to” and “satisfying” readers’ needs will certainly lead literature in a vulgarizing direction, with the publishing industry having no choice but to follow the lead of the popular market. This would inevitably affect the quality and overall future development of literature.

So, publishers faced with servicing the majority of readers need to include both ends (high and low) and sometimes have a preference towards more educated readers in their publication approach. By helping to set trends and educate the public, publishers can promote higher quality appreciation. This will assist in moving the public standard more towards the middle. In the end, this will benefit society and gradually give more attention to creativity and positive energy in building a society with a strong appreciation for literature.

4. Literary criticism needs adjustment and improvement, as well as greater understanding and support from the public.

Widespread concern with the existing status quo in literary criticism, from both inside and outside the literary scene, became a hot topic in 2008. The most urgent issue is how critics deal with a decreasing appreciation for literature, while at the same time endeavoring to improve a social sense of responsibility and enhance a sense of historical mission, under the current chaotic restructuring of the literary landscape. By acting as the intellectual’s conscience, the critic plays a very important role in promoting a sense of aesthetic appreciation, being observant and sensitive to societal changes, speaking out from a sense of justice and protecting essential virtue. Critics must set aside their preconceived notions, focusing more on the broader issues as opposed to the smallest of details. When facing contentious issues, they should say what should be said without consideration of the consequences. When dealing with controversial or hot issues, they should get to the crux of the issue and present a clear stand. They must adjust their attitude and broaden their professional skills in order to change the present role of criticism from that of a propaganda vehicle to that of an examination or research vehicle, towards recognition more than

criticism, and to a focus on wider issues instead of tiny details.

For example, in order to adapt to the unceasing changes in the current literary environment, especially regarding concepts, methods and language, critics must get rid of old-fashioned habits and continue to advance with the times. Some critics remain in the 80s with their thinking and feelings, remaining far apart from the current complexity of “the new era.” Their attitudes cause them to lag behind the present situation when looking at current issues, making their comments on current reality incorrect or out of line. Also, there are many active critics who were trained only in traditional literary theory and structure for many decades and have had very little chance to experience the ongoing changes and absorb new trends. When faced with the new phenomena, they feel rather irrelevant, inadequate, and helpless.

In literary criticism some quite complex issues have arisen that require comprehensive methods. For critics the complexity of the issues they encounter has increased and become more dynamic. In the past, critics dealt with a consistent literary tradition. But now literary criticism not only handles traditional and nontraditional mainstream literature, but also has to deal with marketing, the internet and interaction with other new-media. The current relationship between criticism and literature is one where there is a narrowing of criticism at the same time that the literary world is rapidly enlarging. This unbalanced and unequal situation presents the most difficult challenge to criticism. Resolving this issue will require public understanding and support from many areas.

Although literary criticism needs wide ranging support, above all it needs to expand its ranks, especially with new blood. Currently, critics come primarily from writers’ associations, universities, social science institutions, newspapers and periodicals and other publishing units. It may look like a team from a strong army but in fact it is more a collection of loose stragglers and disbanded soldiers. Critics simply do not have a reliable association to use to connect with each other. They may meet at a seminar, but once the conference concludes, the connections soon disappear. And, at

conferences or seminars, subjects and authors' works are normally chosen and handled according to a pre-meeting arrangement, with works often randomly arranged and passively dealt with.

Ultimately, it is essential to build a strong organized association of critics. The association would serve as a mechanism for effective communication and for ensuring a smooth flow and exchange of information. The organization would be able to focus on issues that require more detailed attention, with the resources that an association can provide. In this way, the association could organize groups more easily, helping to focus strengths to handle selected interesting or important topics. Furthermore, it could help to proactively discover and train talented new critics to be part of the group.

Currently, almost all active critics were born in the 40s, 50s and 60s, very few in the 70s and almost none in the 80s. As the average age of critics (increasing) and the average age of authors (decreasing) trend in opposite directions, it is vitally important to rejuvenate the ranks of critics to add more youth, dynamism and energy. It will require new steps and measures to discover and train new critics rather than relying on an unfocused approach. Attention will have to be paid to the quality of the background of critics. Specially designed programs to teach and educate students to become critics are needed at well-known universities and research institutes. They would conduct courses and hold events which specialize in training participants who are interested in becoming critics. These are all urgent agenda items that require immediate action.

Moreover, in order for literary criticism to be effective, it has certain needs, including communication tools and access to information providers. Most literary criticism is currently published in specialized literary-criticism magazines and newspapers and so its influence is basically limited to a small circle of society, with a correspondingly extremely limited impact on the wider public. The most influential media, including TV, internet and local newspapers, have almost no space for literary critics to express their opinions, leaving the general public almost deprived of access

to literary criticism. If there is room left in the media for literary critical expression, it is usually left to giving a reporter's critical viewpoint rather than providing a critic's perspective. And, if an article is cited, it will likely have been edited or revised using the reporter's own judgment. The result more often than not ends up misleading viewers and aggravating critics who are left feeling "hurt and offended." Yet the incredibly widespread influence of the mass media in disseminating information must lead us to reflect more profoundly on how we should coordinate our actions and use this resource more effectively in order to promote the missing function of literary criticism.

Literary criticism is not just about making critical comments. It is also a mechanism for examining literary, cultural and social issues. From this perspective, it is much easier to understand and support the value of criticism. It also helps us to take further steps to promote and expand the role of literary criticism in supporting societal progress and cultural development.

The literary scene in 2008 saw many new phenomena and a number of newly emerging issues. Gathering together to discuss these phenomena and issues helps us to perceive the current situation more clearly but at the same time inevitably reveals a few awkward points as well. As much as I would like to have put my subjective views aside for this article, it is, after all, a personal opinion to some degree. This needs to be specifically stated and for this I respectfully request the reader's kind understanding.

Translated by Sue-Anne Tu and Chris Hubberstey

Edited by Judith Maclean Miller and Susan Hodges Bryant

ABSENCE AND PRESENCE: Canadian Chinese writers

Judith Maclean Miller

加拿大滑铁卢大学的朱迪丝·米勒教授的论文《缺失和存在：加拿大华裔作家》是加拿大文坛主流学者对加拿大华裔作家的深刻探索。他们的作品跨越了漫长而苦难的历史并且融入了当代华裔加拿大人百舸争流的创作大潮中。这是一种关于家族、饮食和社区的意象既存在又缺席的文学。

I grew up in a Montreal full of diverse languages and cultures. I was Scots or Irish at home, depending on whether I was with my father or my mother. On the street, I was often considered French Canadian, part of the tribe that roamed the neighbourhood. At school, my seat-mates were Jewish. When I went to their homes, I was intrigued by different stories, different languages that I did not hear at home or on the street. At a summer cottage, quiet native men came to visit with my father, to show him handmade birchbark canoes and to talk with him about what was happening in the wilderness they all loved.

My Canada was a place of complex and varied identities, including my own. There was always room to add another dimension. But I knew that it was presumptuous to pretend to be Jewish or French Canadian or immigrant Finn, romantic as those identities seemed to me. I finally settled for something rooted in the culture of the Celts, in the displacement of the Scots who were shipped poor and proud to Canada, and in the rock of the Laurentian shield.

It was easy for me to read postmodern Canadian literature, with its fragmentation, shifting identities, refusal of closure—many-voiced and rich with experiences it called The Other.

So . . . these readings in Chinese Canadian literature began with acute discomfort over naming. Writing by Chinese people in Canada? That was the best I could come up with. But then, I quickly ran into trouble even with that. Who was “Chinese?” Someone from mainland China, certainly. Taiwan? Hong Kong? Someone born in Canada? Third generation Canadians? My experience of Chinese writers had been with ancient Chinese poets, with some early anthologies of Chinese Canadian writing and with Wayson Choy, Denise Chong, and Yan Li. I had always simply thought of the latter as writers in Canada.

As I approach this literary work, I am not a sociologist, an anthropologist, an ethnographer or a political scientist. I encounter it as a reader and a writer. The dialogic criticism of Russian linguist Mikhail Bahktin has always seemed to me useful, with its interest in multiplicities, heterogeneous voices, and dialogue with a text.

My sympathy for Chinese people in Canada widened and deepened when I read the stories in *Tales from Gold Mountain; Stories of the Chinese in the New World*, by Paul Yee. This is a lovely book, beautifully illustrated with paintings by Simon Ng.

Paul Yee, a third generation Canadian, writes in his Afterword that many Chinese Canadians want to forget the dreadfully difficult years when poverty-stricken people came to Canada from China in the nineteenth century, seeking money to help their families at home and finding exploitation, more poverty, injustice, discrimination and labour under terrible conditions in the mines and along the track being built for the new railway across Canada.

These tales sit somewhere in the space between folk tale, poem, non-fiction, fable and fiction. Yee says that he made up all the stories, but he based them in history and in old traditions of story-telling. In each tightly constructed piece, loyalty, generosity and bravery find ways to triumph over greed, injustice and prejudice. Yee wants to re-claim the stories of that time – and its heroes. He begins re-constructing this lost history through creative story-telling. This is a brave book.

In addition to recording the pain and struggle of the early times

in Canada, these pieces create the kind of magic which hovers around tales well told. The collection also includes, lightly, themes which show up again and again in Canadian Chinese writing:

“Don’t you know that too many have died here” (12)?

“She wept silently and drew her children close to her, but she told them nothing, for she wanted them to remember their father with love” (23).

“But this is a new land,” she cried. “Must we forever follow the old ways” (38)?

“But I will let your story die here, between you and me, because the truth about my brother would surely kill my mother” (56).

Individuals, under the pressures of their lives in a new land, are keeping secrets. Yee gives these negotiations and strategies of silence mythic significance. They create tangled plots and genealogies, spread across two countries: old China and new Canada.

Joanne Saul’s *Writing the Roaming Subject: the Biotext in Canadian Literature* analyses four pieces by Michael Ondaatje, Daphne Marlatt, Roy Kiyooka and Fred Wah. It includes a thoughtful introduction to the “biotext.” It is a term first used by Canadian poet George Bowering, seeking to name the hybrid genres of recent Canadian literature, especially those by writers struggling with displacement of one kind or another, seeking identity in a new place, developing it in the site which is a text.

Saul suggests that “biotext” is a useful term for what, at one time, was called autobiography—or more recently, life-writing. She describes the biotext as having elastic boundaries of genre, where poetry and prose forms intersect, where non-fiction can look like fiction and fiction can seem poetic. A poem can look a lot like prose. One piece may include some or all of the forms we have usually

thought of as separate.

This newly named genre resists closure, can be fragmentary and does not arrive at neat conclusions. Authors of this form are not presenting a tidy identity and ways of reaching it. They are often discovering identity as they write, and the reader participates in the search. Saul observes that these writers may be content to accept an unformed, open identity, where issues of race, culture, personal history, gender, family history, and social pressure swirl around a constantly shifting self. Yes, I find myself thinking. I have known about such shifting, complex identities for a long time.

Biotexts, Saul writes, do not describe successful attempts to fit into a culture. The subjects of these texts may even decide to stand to one side of a culture with its social norms and political pressures. Yes. Makes sense to me.

This book contains an extensive bibliography on issues of race, ethnicity, autobiography, and cultural criticism.

As I moved on to look at *Swallowing Clouds: an Anthology of Chinese-Canadian Poetry*, edited by Andy Quan and Jim Wong-Chu, I took with me the idea of “biotext,” with all its complexities and intersections.

It was comforting to find Andy Quan puzzling about his idea of Chinese-Canada, in his “Introduction.”

I would guess that every writer and reader of this collection will have their own idea of what it means. Me, I admit to ethnocentrism. For years, I thought of Chinese-Canada as my Chinese-Canada, North American born descendants of the villagers of Canton who arrived in Canada to build the railroad, or search for gold, or escape the famine of the early 1900s, all in search of a better life. (7)

Insofar as I had thought about defining such a term as Chinese-Canada, I would likely have agreed with him, although I was aware that Montreal had been a destination for people from many places which seemed, roughly, “Chinese.” I knew that the Canadian missionaries in China had insisted that Canadian government

policy recognize the People's Republic of China when many other nations refused to acknowledge it. I had read Norman Bethune's writing about China and biographies of him. I felt a strange affinity to these people so far away who were struggling to survive in a difficult world.

Quan, a third-generation Canadian, a poet, goes on to write:

But as I grew older and looked at the Chinese-Canadian "community" around me, I had to see how diverse a people we were. Not only from Canton, immigrants came from all parts of China, from Taiwan, and from bustling Hong Kong. (7)

Quang also noticed that people came from these places to Canada through other nations and cities, by way of other continents. He concludes that the poets in this collection are travellers and their descendants. His co-editor, Jim Wong-Chu, poet, anthologist, historian, radio personality, was born in Hong Kong and came to Canada at age three. He wandered North America until the late 1960s when he returned to Vancouver.

I enjoyed the writers included in this anthology. Their poems are adventurous in form and content. The language swings through all the changes from colloquial to formal. Line patterns and images intersect in complex ways on the page. The voices are multiple and acutely observant—wry, quiet, outspoken, outrageous, tentative. The imagery was more and more familiar. Rita Wong's "sunset grocery" is almost prose poetry in its listings of grocery store products. Her final lines about the household at night-time, noisy with the snoring of the dog and of her father linger in my memory: "the nights are noisy with all/the things never said in the day" (27). I recognize that noisy silence from the writings of Wayson Choy, Denise Chong and Paul Yee—that household full of the things not said.

Goh Poh Seng, in "Thinking of the Poet Tu Fu," takes me back into the ancient Chinese poetry that I discovered and loved early on in my reading of poetry.

These twelve centuries or more
 have really wrought little change;
 the condition of man remains
 much the same, much the same. (53)

There is something especially appealing about the repetition. I can see him shaking his head as he says this, in a direct address to Tu Fu. Seng juxtaposes that time and his own, including the homely details of his life and of his love. His poem is full of images from his home, overlooking the Johore Straits, images that would have been familiar to Tu Fu. His quiet, matter-of-fact attention to everyday detail and his lyrical tone fit into the traditions of ancient Chinese poetry, where meaning hovers in the spaces. I am glad to find them still alive.

Leung Ping-Kwan writes a poem called “Eggplants,” detailing the pleasures and associations of particular foods and wonders aloud:

Isn't it amazing our thoughts all travel from food
 To culture bonds, from reactions of the body and
 Cravings of the palate to our relations with the world? (161)

I smile, thinking of all the references to food which I have read and remembering a guest in my house from mainland China who told me proudly, “In our culture, food is an art.” I would agree with him. In these poems too, food becomes part of the art of remembering, of giving voice, of establishing identity and bonds.

In “from your belly into my belly,” Jen Lam learns from the women in her family that “the universe’s brilliance is faint/ when pressed against their struggled lives” (244). The imagery of her poem is telling:

they tread with quiet dignity
 skirts down to their ankles
 to hide the burden on their knees. (245)

Lam finds herself like and unlike the women of her family, where they all agree “that love is done not spoken” (244).

Not spoken. So much is not spoken. The sufferings of people’s lives, the hard work, the pain, the strange alliances made out of desperation—these themes echo over and over through these poems and other works I have read and am reading. Autobiography becomes fiction to hide truths which must not be spoken. Some of the moving out of silence into voice, it seems, is veiled behind reticence or courtesy.

This is a rich and wonderful collection.

Lien Chao’s *Beyond Silence: Chinese Canadian Literature in English* is a highly respected and insightful critique of Chinese Canadian literature. The silence she addresses is what she names “an imposed cultural silence.” This is silence on the macro level, where a society refuses a group of people the right to participate in public discourse, through laws as well as personal prejudices. Early settlers from China were marginalized because of their inability to speak the language, but Lien Chao suggests that it was more total than that.

The Chinese workers who built the railway, who came to take part in the gold rush, were not only silenced but utterly denied, as if they had never been. Their contribution to building the railway was not celebrated—or even spoken. Their gold rush stories were not shared. It was as if these hard-working pioneers had never been. None of these people had any individual identity; if they were seen at all it was only as a group. This is the vacuum into which Paul Yee writes his “stories of Chinese in the new world.”

Chao, who came to Canada in 1984 from mainland China, is herself a poet, a critic, an anthologist and most recently a short story writer. She observes that ignoring the early settlers from China has led to recurring tropes in Chinese Canadian writing: the collective self, the Gold Mountain milieu and the bone journey, the journeys to find and properly bury the bones of those early labourers. The silence imposed on the Chinese community did not mean that the community became mute. Silence, Chao suggests, is powerful. Behind the public silence, an alternative, mostly hidden culture

developed in chinatowns across the country, usually in Chinese. Stories were told to keep alive some memory of the collective history.

Gradually, these stories began to make their way into English, into the dominant culture. No easy task. “Breaking through the historical silence for contemporary Chinese Canadian writers means to construct the community’s unrecorded history in English, in the language that originally ordered the silencing” (Chao, 30). A grim irony.

I understand Chao’s point about the imposed silence, the damage of it, and the steps taken to break through it into voice. However, in *Swallowing Clouds*, as well as in other writers, I noticed another kind of silence: a personal silence, where family secrets were walled off, not voiced. They created fault lines in families and in individuals which had the potential to crack open into disaster and destruction—or into new order, new identities.

When I turned to Judy Fong Bates, to her novel *Midnight at the Dragon Café*, I was thinking about these silences, at least double—and maybe multiple.

The social or culturally imposed silence was quickly apparent. The narrator’s father can communicate very little with the customers who come regularly to his café. He is always pleasant, even deferential, careful to avoid trouble. His halting English and his silence mask his desperately hard work. As the novel progresses, his silence is also taped over his wife’s adultery, his son’s betrayal, his life in China, his plans for his family. He grows steadily weaker under the burden of the silences and the secrets.

In addition to all her father’s silences are the narrator’s own. She sees what is going on but participates in her father’s silence, observing it and his pain. She says nothing. For a long time. At school, Annie learns English, becomes at home in Canada, but she still keeps the family’s secrets—and her own. Often, she simply does not say, does not challenge discriminations against her. She suffers in silence, as does her father. Certainly, she does not burden her father with her problems or uncertainties.

Suffering mounts as silences multiply, until the point where Annie's best friend is unjustly treated and Annie explodes in fury at their unfair teacher. The consequences are disastrous, tragic.

Not long after that speaking out in school, Annie faces her family, voicing what she knows. "I had thought that things couldn't possibly be worse, and now they were. By confronting my mother out loud with what I knew I had betrayed her, but now I understood that I had betrayed my father as well" (302-3). Nevertheless, she has been faithful to a larger truth. Through all of this pain, she makes her way into voice, into writing.

Which came first: the imposed cultural silence or the personal keeping of secrets, refusing to give voice? Is there in fact, any connection between them? Is one made worse by the other? The keeping of personal and family secrets was not unknown to me. It was a question of pride among Scots and Irish families. One did not "wash the dirty linen in public." It was a while before laws imposed restrictions on English in Quebec. Voicing personal troubles is a fairly new phenomenon, a new fashion. Perhaps, I began to think, Chinese silence is not that unusual, although it is certainly many-faceted and a strong part, it seems, even of personal identity.

I found other motifs in Judy Fong Bates' novel which echoed those in the poems and in Paul Yee's stories. Food is an especially strong one. Annie's father, Hing-Wun Chou, makes his living running a restaurant. Food is the link to the *lo fun* (the other Canadians). It is also a silent critique of them and their eating habits. The family ate much better. Chou and his son argue about menus for the restaurant, until the son offers some more traditional Chinese recipes which are well accepted by his clientele. Annie observes, "Since moving to Canada my mother's concern about what we ate had grown almost into an obsession. Cooking was the only thing here that gave her real pleasure" (64). A reader understands that such an obsession is aggravated by her mother's social isolation in a small Ontario town. A great deal of time is spent on food, cooking for the restaurant, making beautiful meals for the family, growing vegetables.

Bates' book is presented as a novel, but knowing that she came to Canada as a young child and grew up in a series of small Ontario towns makes it easy to see her work as biotext – a hybrid form of memoir, autobiography, fiction, history.

Yan Li came to Canada from the People's Republic of China and has settled in Waterloo, Ontario. She showed me how close fiction can be to non-fiction, why sometimes it is impossible to write non-fiction or autobiography. I also learned from her how remarkably difficult it is to write in a new second language, especially in English. Her novels, *Daughters of the Red Land* and *Lily in the Snow*, suggest that many of the traditions and motifs I have found in this Canadian Chinese writing have made their way here from China, that secrets and family scandals as well as preferences for sophisticated food are not unique to Canadian families and that bitter hard work is not only the legacy of Canadian Chinese.

Laiwan was born in Zimbabwe and emigrated to Canada, to Vancouver, in 1977. Her poem, "notes toward a body II," reaches far beyond – or deep within – usual ideas of what a body is, or what makes up identity. Including x-rays and electron microscope photographs among her words, she makes the hidden, the inside, the secret, accessible through technologies as well as in her words. She reminds us vividly about shifting identities, intersections of voices and images, the permeability of all kinds of boundaries. Laiwan works with film as well as print, intrigued by energies of resonating presence and absence, which may exist at the same time, in the same space – an ancient idea of Buddhism – a kind of virtual reality which, she says, has always existed. Wonderful work.

I have read about and browsed in other anthologies and novels, listed in the bibliography below. I notice a movement from anthologies including several genres and cultures into anthologies of single genres, by Chinese writers in Canada, people from a wide range of places, including Andy Quan's "travellers" as well as the descendants of the early pioneers in Canada. It is a proud history, moving from silence in English into complex forms and genres, many-voiced. It mirrors the larger Canadian literary movement from

realism, through confession/self-exploration, into postmodernist complex forms enriched by tradition and experimentation, then on into what might be called neo-realism.

A new phase is developing in and beyond the biotext. A writer like Michelle Wan, born in Kunming, China, and living in Guelph, Ontario, can write about anything she pleases, setting her mystery novels about orchids in the Dordogne Region of France. However, even in her work, in her latest novel, one of Wan's major characters makes a visit to China, looking for evidence of an elusive orchid and in a remote mountain region, he encounters a community secret, silence, a bone journey.

Larissa Lai was born in La Jolla, California, grew up in Newfoundland and lived for several years in Vancouver. Her second novel, *Salt Fish Girl*, is set in nineteenth century China and late twenty-first century Canada. A mix of Chinese and European myths with folk tales, fantasy and science fiction, it explores the lives of women through time and the dangers of cloning, of the cyborg, as well as the frightening power of corporations. It is also about language and what happens when languages are forgotten, when a pearl in the mouth is not enough, in the "cavity from which speech comes. The dark and empty rooting place of language. A pearl, a seed, how little space it takes to record all that is essential to know about life" (206). Even in these linked worlds of the past and the future, there are family secrets to protect, strange alliances and unexpected off-spring, recurring images of food and of work. The pathos of this novel, as well as its mystery, lingers with me for a long time:

I thought, we are the new children of the earth, of the earth's revenge. Once we stepped out of mud, now we step out of moist earth, out of DNA both new and old, an imprint of what has gone before, but also a variation. By our difference we mark how ancient the alphabet of our bodies. By our strangeness we write our bodies into the future. (259)

There is a great deal of poetry, of insight, in Lai's writing, braided through memories of an earlier time and the imagined horrors of a world taken over by greedy multinational corporations. In Chinese mythology, Nu Wa is the goddess of order who created humans and saved the world from destruction. Lai's novel makes room for her in a new world.

This is a burgeoning literature. Critics are taking this writing seriously, exploring and codifying it as part of a larger literary scene, struggling to find ways to "name" it.

Through all the many forms and genres, the secrets and silences remain: as plot, genealogy, history, metaphor, leitmotif, image, theme, negotiation. Absent and present at the same time, they vibrate in the work, so that it is hard to see where one ends and the other begins. They are both: power and handicap, strength or limitation, establishing and dissolving boundaries of all kinds. Other motifs surround them: food, ghosts, work, isolation, loneliness, love, bones, family, burial, money.

Steadily stronger are the voices, moving into the silent spaces, bursting through layers of oppressions and difficulties, investigating secrets in extraordinary forms created to carry the intersections which become complex personal identities. I have come to think of these writers as simply here, wherever they came from, however long they have been here – or even more basically, as writers. As a reader, I appreciate their particular perspectives, skills and voices as well as the traditions which enrich their writing. I look forward to more reading, glad of these presences on my bookshelves, aware of the absences, the secrets, which haunt them.

A Selected Bibliography Arranged Chronologically

- Chu, Garrick, et al. *Inalienable Rice: A Chinese and Japanese Canadian Anthology* (Vancouver: Intermedia Press 1979).
- Yee, Paul Lee. *Tales from Gold Mountain; Stories of the Chinese in the New World* (Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre 1989).
- Lee, Bennett and Jim Wong-Chu, eds. *Many-Mouthed Birds: Contemporary Writing by Chinese Canadians* (Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre, 1989).
- Chong, Denise. *The Concubine's Children* (Toronto: Viking, 1994)
- Chao, Lien. "Anthologizing the Collective: The Epic Struggles to Establish Chinese Canadian Literature in English." *Essays on Canadian Writing* 57: 145-70, 1995.
- Choy, Wayson. *The Jade Peony* (Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre, 1995).
- Lai, Larissa. *When Fox Is a Thousand* (Vancouver: Press Gang Publishers, 1995).
- Li, Yan. *Daughters of the Red Land* (Toronto: Sister Vision, 1995).
- Chao, Lien. *Beyond Silence: Chinese Canadian Literature in English* (Toronto: TSAR Publications. 1997).
- Choy, Wayson. *Paper Shadows: A Chinatown Childhood* (Toronto: Viking, 1999).
- Quan, Andy and Jim Wong-Chu, eds. *Swallowing Clouds: An Anthology of Chinese-Canadian Poetry* (Vancouver: Arsenal Press, 1999).
- Laiwan, "notes toward a body II," in *Swallowing Clouds: An Anthology of Chinese-Canadian Poetry* (Vancouver: Arsenal Press 1999) pp. 146-151.
- Goellnicht, Donald C. "A Long Labour: the Protracted Birth of Asian Canadian Literature." *Essays on Canadian Writing* 72: 1-41, Winter, 2000.
- Lai, Larissa. *Salt Fish Girl* (Toronto: Thomas Allen, 2002).
- Chao, Lien and Jim Wong-Chu. *Strike the Wok* (Toronto: TSAR Publications, 2003).
- Bates, Judy Fong. *Midnight at the Dragon Café* (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 2004).

- Ty, Eleanor and Donald C. Goellnicht, eds. *Asian North American Identities: Beyond the Hyphen* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004).
- Choy, Wayson. *All That Matters: a novel*. (Toronto: Anchor Books, 2005).
- Wan, Michelle. *Deadly Slipper*. (Toronto: Doubleday, 2005)
- Saul, Joanne. *Writing the Roaming Subject: The Biotext in Canadian Literature*. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006).
- Wan, Michelle. *The Orchid Shroud*. (Toronto: Doubleday, 2006)
- Ty, Eleanor and Christl Verdun. *Asian Canadian Writing Beyond Ethnography*. (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2008).
- Chao, Lien. *The Chinese Knot and Other Stories*. (Toronto: TSAR Publications, 2008).
- Wan, Michelle. *A Twist of Orchids*. (Toronto: Doubleday, 2008).
- Choy, Wayson. *Not Yet: a Memoir of Living and Almost Dying*. (Toronto: Doubleday, 2009).
- Li, Yan. *Lily in the Snow*. (Toronto: Women's Press, 2009).
- Wan, Michelle. *Kill for an Orchid*. (Toronto: Random House, 2010).

THE MENZIES IN CHINA: an Unforgettable Family in Sino-Canadian History

Yan Li

加拿大滑铁卢大学孔子学院院长李彦教授在题为《明氏家族在中国——中加关系史上不能遗忘的家族》的论文中重述了明义士和他儿子明明德（曾任加拿大驻中国大使）的故事。明义士从一个传教士成为考古学家，而且在安阳发现了甲骨文，他的研究成果在中国得以发表。明义士尊重中国传统并把他对中国的热爱传递给了儿子。明氏家族是曾经被忽略而需要重新铭记的故事。

The Silk Road has usually been thought of as a route along which goods and trading parties travelled overland, but over many centuries, people have moved in other ways between China and the West exchanging ideas and work as well as goods. Among the significant travellers have been Canadian missionary families. They went to China to teach, but they learned a great deal from the Chinese people. They made important contributions within China and when China was cut off from much of the West after the establishment of the People's Republic of China, these missionary families maintained connections to China and influenced the Canadian government to create formal diplomatic ties with Mao's government in 1970. The first four Canadian ambassadors to China were sons of missionaries. The stories of these families should not be forgotten.¹

Christian missionaries entered China as early as the time of the Tang Dynasty, around 635, according to records engraved on a stone tablet preserved in Xian. Canadian missionaries joined the trend in 1887. Although most of the Canadian missionaries were

far less popular than the non-missionary Canadian Dr. Norman Bethune (who was the son of a Protestant minister), they too made contributions to Chinese life. The Endicott family, for example, earned a reputation as “the Red Missionaries.” Their sympathetic support for the communist revolution led by Mao won friendship between China and Canada after the founding of the People’s Republic of China. Many of the Canadian missionaries held values like equality and justice in human society. These were values also seen in the Land Reform Movement in China in the early 1950s. Here we have an example of values shared between Christianity and Mao’s ideology.

The name of James Menzies has been neglected and almost forgotten in Sino-Canadian history. It is a name that deserves a prominent position. This name came to my attention in 1988, not long after my arrival in Canada from Beijing, when I attended the annual conference of the Learned Societies of Canada in 1988 in Windsor. I happened to be seated next to an elderly gentleman, whose name was Arthur Menzies. He surprised me by initiating a conversation in fluent Chinese, with an obvious Henan accent. As it turned out, he had served as the Canadian Ambassador to China from 1976-1980, after diplomatic relations were established between the two countries in the early 1970s. Arthur Menzies was born in central China on Nov 29, 1916, and acquired his Henan accent from the people there. He was at a boarding school for missionary children that was about 60 miles from his home from age 5 or 6 until his early teens. His childhood years in China must have left deep impressions on him as the retired diplomat made the statement to me, when a dish of stir-fried rice was brought to the table, “Rice is no good. Your stomach never feels full with it. Only pastry stuff will do.” That was a strongly held belief of peasants in Henan, where wheat, rather than rice, remains the staple of the Henan diet to the present day.

Two weeks after our encounter, a news story appeared in the People’s Daily, China’s official newspaper, that caught my eye. It contained the name James Menzies. The name was mentioned briefly as the story recounted the archeological discoveries of the

oracle bones unearthed in Henan at the turn of the 20th century. Out of curiosity, I wrote to Arthur Menzies in Ottawa concerning this story and James Menzies. I wondered if there was any relationship between these two Menzies. Within days I received confirmation from Arthur Menzies that James was indeed his father.

The relations between James Menzies, missionary and archeologist, and his diplomat son, Arthur Menzies, intrigued me. It led me to begin digging into the activities of Canadian missionaries in China, something that was not well known in China, nor was there much information available. The result was my article in Chinese entitled "The Two Generations of Canadians in Sino-Canadian Relations," published in September 17, 1988 in the People's Daily. It gave a more detailed report on the contribution of James Menzies to archeology and the oracle bones. My visits to Arthur Menzies in 1996 led to my discovering some precious stories about the huge contributions made by this Canadian family.

For a period of 70 years from 1887 to 1957, around 1,000 Canadian missionaries arrived in China. Their footprints went as far as Sichuan, Guizhou, and the Tibetan areas in west China. North Henan, one of the poorest areas in central China, was the main beneficiary of Presbyterian missionary contributions in such fields as education, medical treatment, and women's liberation. They much improved the life of local people.

Born in Leamington, Ontario, into a wealthy businessman's home in 1885, James Menzies acquired his degree in Engineering from the University of Toronto. He then spent three years studying theology at Knox College. The motivation behind his China mission was further strengthened when he met Annie, a girl from Windsor, at the college. Annie made it clear that she was going to China and would only consider his proposal while there. For six months, Annie's letters from China knocked on James' heart and finally led him to step onto this mysterious land in 1910. A year later, Bishop William White,² running the Anglican Church in Henan, presided at their wedding in Henan.

As the first trained engineer-missionary from Canada, James

used his engineering skills to build homes and dig wells for the local people, receiving an annual subsidy of \$600 from the church, which was 1/5 of what he could have made as an engineer in Canada. Yet his collection of cultural relics in China and his contribution to Chinese archaeology came as an unexpected outcome and made him outstanding. While most missionaries went to China to convert the “heathen,” James, in addition to his evangelical work, became a self-trained archeologist. He put his new skills to good use becoming the first scientist to study the astonishing relics at the site of Yin, the last capital of the Shang dynasty, in the Bronze Age civilization that thrived more than three millennia ago.

After studying Chinese for three years with an old scholar who knew the classics by heart, James, fully prepared with a solid knowledge in ancient Chinese history and literature, was sent to work in Zhangde. There, in the spring of 1914 he stumbled on the site of the last capital of the Yin Dynasty. This happened when he was wandering around the fields along the Huan River on a white horse. Conversations between James and the local children incidentally led the young Christian missionary to this rarely-known historical site and a journey shifting away from his original evangelical goal. The classical Chinese he had acquired became an indispensable tool for digging into the mysterious codes engraved on the bones. Around that time, scholars in Beijing were already aware of the “oracle bones” appearing in the drug market as medicine, but their sources were kept confidential by business people. Ironically, James, as a foreigner sent by God to this reclusive corner, became the first scholar ever to find the exact site. His first book, *Oracle Records from the Waste of Yin*, was published by Kelly and Walsh in Shanghai in 1917, shortly after his son, Arthur, was born in the missionary compound.

According to Arthur, his parents went to China with the purpose to “convert the heathen,” totally unaware of the rich heritage of that land. Quickly, they found they had a great deal to learn. The Chinese teacher who taught James was Xiucan, a traditional scholar who had passed the first official exam for degrees, armed with

decades of Chinese classical learning. Instead of accepting James's gospel preaching, he lectured on his own culture, which surprised the Canadian student with its depth and aroused his great interest.

From 1917–20, James served as a Staff Captain with the Chinese Labor Corps which was recruited in North China by the British Army for service in France. He returned to Zhangde from 1921 to 1927, during which period he collected many fragments of oracle bones, pieces of pottery and bronze and became a self-trained archeologist. His son Arthur says,

I remember going several times as a small boy with my father to visit Xiaotun Village from which many of the oracle bones came. Dealers also came to our home, knowing that my father would take a keen and knowledgeable interest in their accounts of the places where the artifacts had been found. They knew that as a missionary he could not afford to buy whole bronze vessels, pots or large bone pieces that would command a good price in Beijing or Shanghai. They knew that he was not interested in doing business. But by paying small sums for inscribed bone fragments and bits of bronze and pottery, he could learn much from the visiting dealers. This was the basis on which he built his study collection.³

In the spring of 1927, foreign missionaries were advised to evacuate North Henan because of the Northern Expedition of the Nationalist Armies and the resulting civil war. James had sent to Tianjin for safe keeping the oracle bones he had collected that had the longest and most interesting inscriptions. But a large number of small fragments of inscribed bones, pieces of pottery and bronze, as well as a large collection of Chinese books were destroyed by the troops occupying the mission compound during the civil war.

James taught for a year at the College of Chinese Studies in Beijing and did rubbings on the oracle bones fragments that he had been able to send out of Henan. In December 1928 during the family's furlough leave, James' father gave him \$5,000 so that

the family was able to visit archaeological sites in India, Iraq and Palestine. James also spent several months in the summer and autumn of 1929 serving as a temporary surveyor at two sites near Jerusalem. This gave him “hands on” experiences in the most up-to-date methods of undertaking and recording the excavation of archaeological sites.

From 1930–32 he was again in Zhangde for a new beginning after an absence of over three years. In addition to his evangelistic and educational work, he began again to collect archaeological reference materials. In 1931, the Academic Sinica began a systematic excavation of the Shang royal tombs at Xiaotun. This activity gave James personal contact with leading Chinese archeologists who highly praised his unique contributions in this field.

In 1932 James was invited by Qilu University, a missionary-built university in Shandong Province, to assume the post of Professor of Archaeology. He arranged for his recently assembled collection of ancient Chinese pottery vessels and pieces of bronze to be shipped by cart overland from Zhangde to Jinan to form the beginning of the Qilu University Museum. He continued with his research work as an example to Chinese staff and students. He introduced the first introductory course on archaeological methods and another on Asian and Chinese archaeology. He lectured in Chinese to senior students on how he thought research into the oracle bone script should be conducted.

James found the five years he spent at Qilu University from 1932–37 some of the most challenging and rewarding of his career. He felt that he was making a worthwhile contribution to the archaeological research undertaken by a growing number of Chinese scholars, and at the same time interesting students in the new scientific methods of studying the origins of their own great culture.

James believed that his studies in the historical collections would help him to get a clearer idea of the formation of Chinese culture and thought, which was strategically important. I have read with great interest an article by James dated Nov. 21, 1936, during his furlough in Toronto.

This little note on the early Chinese conception of God may help you answer in a scientific way the common criticism of Missions that we should not foist our God and our religion on the Chinese. The answer is that God is their God as much as ours and that the Chinese can give evidence of this at a date to which we cannot even approximate. To those materialists who claim that we are merely propagating the superstitious ideas of the early Hebrews, we can point out that this idea of God among the Chinese long preceded any date we may give to Moses for the word was in such common use at 1400 BCE as to indicate a much earlier origin.

That the Chinese idea of God was exactly the same as the Biblical idea is not to be considered. It was the simple "all father" in Heaven. What it does show is that the fundamental conceptions of the early Chinese are a sound basis for the Christian religion and that the Chinese Missionary Enterprise can expect the same response from the 500,000,000 persons of Chinese race as this same gospel has found among us in the West. If the common world civilization, which is bound to come as the result of our material conquest of those physical barriers which have so far divided the world, is to provide a life worthwhile living it must also be inspired by the Spirit of Jesus Christ who alone demonstrated and explains the attitude of God to all mankind. God so loved the world that he gave His unique son so that everyone who trusts in Him may have abundant life.⁴

Following the invasion of the Japanese army in North China, James' academic life at the Chinese university was interrupted. After his effort to return to China was refused by the Missionary Board, he began to do research work in the Far Eastern Department of the Royal Ontario Museum in Toronto starting in 1938. In 1942, James completed the requirements for the Ph.D. degree, writing

his thesis on “The Shang Ge,” a study of the characteristic weapon of the Bronze Age in China during the period 1311–1039 BCE. This study was published by the Royal Ontario Museum in 1965, eight years after he had passed away.

Following the death of James, his wife, Annie, and son, Arthur, arranged for the transfer of the Chinese archaeological specimens, inscribed oracle bones, and books on Chinese archaeology and early history which James had brought to Canada to the Royal Ontario Museum in Toronto on the understanding that his study of the “Shang Ge” should be published and his collections of oracle bones and rubbings in Canada should be collated and published.

In all his academic life, James researched mainly oracle bone inscriptions and bronzes of the Shang Dynasty, leaving more than twenty works and papers in the field. His representative works have many original ideas, and have been highly regarded in academic circles. However, according to some resources, the potential for even greater achievements by James in this academic field was unfortunately blocked due to his relationship with his former friend Bishop White, as an article entitled “New respect for old bones” in *The Globe and Mail*, Jan. 19, 2008, suggests.

In 1996, almost forty years after James’ death, a Chinese language book entitled *Jia Gu Yan Jiu* (Research on Oracle Bones), the lecture notes used by him in 1933 at Qilu University, was published in China. This publication was significant because the original notes had been printed only for his students and few scholars knew this work. The book presented mainly the history of oracle bone study, such as how the oracle bones were discovered, the people who bought oracle bones and the numbers of bone pieces. The records about the process of discovery and of the persons who collected are especially important. His work was regarded as the most accurate and detailed on these issues. As China ushered in the Economic Reform Era, a more open atmosphere allowed people to examine the missionaries’ work more objectively.

By the end of the Qing Dynasty, the Chinese people were facing internal as well as external pressures. The arrival of the increased

number of missionaries had immense impacts on people's lives in such areas as women's liberation, the educational system, and medical care.

Arthur recalled an anecdote from 1925 when his father organized the church relief activities during the famine. When the local government treated James to a banquet when everything was over, a nicely cooked large fish was brought to the table. Having had no fish to eat for months, James chose the fish, only to find it was made of wood.

While James was engaged in his archeological researches, his wife Annie contributed to improving the lives of local people in more ways than one. Knowing that the church was not on good terms with the villagers, Annie was determined to improve the situation through home visits. She brought her little children with her and was calm in the face of curiosity from the village women, when they wondered and checked to see if the "little foreign devil" would pee the same way as the Chinese.

As a little boy, Arthur was taken with his parents during their evangelical trips, his father riding on a horse and his mother in the buggy. There was no electricity in peasants' homes and they would have to fight with mosquito and fleas under the oil lamp. Arthur remembered the scene when Chinese kids poked holes in the paper-sealed windows to peep at the "foreign devils."

My mother's personality was different from my father's. She was more easy going and humorous. As a 16 year old girl back in her hometown of Windsor, Ontario, she was determined to seek a more meaningful life when her parents asked her to quit school and stay at home to help look after her six younger siblings. Eventually she found her goal in China. She was active in work with women and children in the villages near the mission compound, and offered her famous 'hot bath' facility for them.

She could smell the bad odor from people in the church. Because it was cold, people couldn't afford to take a bath

in winter. Men smoked and never brushed their teeth for their life time. My mother offered a hot bath once a month for the children in the church school and provided free hot water and soaps, which were luxurious for the poor.

Annie's diary also described the touching moment when she helped an 87 year old Chinese lady, who had been blind for 5 years, to get medical treatment and have the cataracts removed from her eyes.

Besides organizing the local women into Bible study groups which provided the otherwise illiterate people with opportunities to read and write, Annie also set up a Sunday School and encouraged girls under age six to come with their mothers, who enjoyed very much singing "There Is Only One True God." In the church, men sat separately from women and children, to respect the local custom. Arthur's memory of Christmas in 1923, when he was only 7, was vivid and touching.

Early Christmas morning, I woke up suddenly hearing music like 'angels singing'. We jumped out of bed and rushed onto the veranda. It was dark but stars shone brightly and from far off a flickering trail of lights came our way. The girls from the mission high school were singing Christmas carols. We greeted them excitedly and continued to listen as they carried their candles, stopping at each house. The gift of song from the girls' school set the tone for the day. Excitedly, we opened our Christmas stockings. In the toe was a large orange – a once-a-year treat – as oranges did not grow in our part of China. Mid-morning, we all attended Chinese church. Then in the afternoon, there was a Christmas party for the village children who attended my mother's school. Each child received a gift – more than 50 girls all got celluloid dolls dressed in knitted outfits. These were sent to mother by a WMS group in Montreal. How thrilled those little girls were receiving a first-ever gift. The boys had mouth organs and mechanical toys. The church service was a gathering

of loving, joyful people.

During my interview, Arthur's mind was so drawn by the sweet memories in his childhood that he started to sing in Chinese hymns as well as nursery rhymes he had learned years ago in the village. "Little red fish, where are you?" At age 80, his voice was still clear and crisp.

Arthur Menzies spent his childhood in Henan, observing the deeds of his parents and absorbing the riches of the Chinese culture. He recalled his nanny, Madam Shen, a Chinese widow who stayed with the family and helped look after the three children of the Menzies.

Arthur became a diplomat after finishing his academic studies at the University of Toronto and Harvard University and served as Canadian ambassador in several Asian countries. It was the effort made by Arthur and many of the missionary children that resulted in the establishment of diplomatic relations between China and Canada in the early 1970s.

In 1976, Arthur returned to the land where he was born, as the Canadian Ambassador to China. During his four year term in China, Arthur was actively involved in projects promoting scientific and high tech exchanges between the two countries and contributed in new ways, to strengthen the ties built up by his parents' generation. In an article written by Arthur in November 17, 1977, he described his visit to Zhangde, his birthplace.

Last week I went back to visit Zhangde where I was born in the Canadian Presbyterian, later United Church of Canada mission compound. I left there as a boy in the spring of 1927 as a boy of 11, only returning once with my father in the summer of 1935. There has certainly been an enormous change from an old walled market city of a few tens of thousands to an industrial city of 430,000. A new larger railway station has been built. The city wall has been pulled down; only the southwest corner has been preserved as an historical reminder in a park. Liberation

Avenue is lined with department stores, theatres and office buildings.⁵

While touring the city, Arthur made an effort to look for the remaining buildings built by the Canadian missionaries and seemed to have found some in the modern hospitals and schools. He also discussed in detail his visit in the Waste of Yin/Shang Dynasty capital excavations.

As father identified the site of the Shang Dynasty capital in 1914 near the village of Xiao-tun, I had visited the area many times as a boy. I looked forward to visiting the area again. In the museum we were shown photos of some of the excavations and samples of some of the materials found in the tombs. We saw a good range of pottery, bronzes, jades, a few inscribed bones and various bone ornaments. Afterwards we were taken to a spot near a threshing floor where we were able to gaze on the fields which still had some cotton unpicked, but from which the grain had been harvested. We were disappointed to find that all of the excavations had been filled in again and one left open to give visitors some impression of the shape of the tombs and the palaces. I should like to go back and spend some more time there when an actual excavation is in progress.⁶

Half a century had elapsed since Arthur bid farewell to his birthplace. He saw improvements of life there under the Communist government, something his parents worked hard to bring about. He says,

The standard of living is simple but not low. Many attend the theatre or stroll in the parks. All are dressed adequately. There is adequate medical care at very cheap or no price and middle school education for all.

The Menzies family has left deep foot prints in the history between Canada and China. From this family has come an engineer,

a missionary, a social worker, a military officer, an archeology professor, a library researcher, and a diplomat. The contributions made by this family in Sino-Canadian history are significant. They should be acknowledged and remembered.

Notes

- 1 See also Alwyn Austin, *Saving China: Canadian Missionaries in the Middle Kingdom 1888-1959* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1986), and Linfu Dong, *Cross-Culture and Faith: The Life & Work of James Mellon Menzies* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006), and Song Heng, *Canadian Missionaries in China* (Beijing: Dongfang Publishing House, 1995), for some fine academic studies of Canadian missionaries in China. My own research on the Menzies family began from an accidental meeting of Arthur Menzies (1916–2010). I was able to meet him on more than one occasion and he generously provided me with material/documents that are quoted here. He had planned to attend the Renison Conference in May 2010, but died in March of that year.
- 2 Bishop William White (1873–1960) went to China as an Anglican missionary in 1897. He learned mandarin and served in various places in China until he became a bishop in the Henan area in 1912. He remained in Henan until 1934. He then returned to Canada where he established a program in Chinese studies at U of T and gave a large collection of Chinese artifacts to the Royal Ontario Museum. See also Fang Hui, *Dr. James Menzies and His Collection of Chinese Art* (Jinan, Shangdong University Press, 2000).
- 3 The information contained here was conveyed to me by Arthur Menzies when I visited him in the 1990s. I took notes during those visits and he also shared with me some documents including family letters and diaries. My notes, documents, and personal letters are kept on file in my office at the Confucius Institute.
- 4 This is a quote from a document obtained from Arthur Menzies, his son, and is kept in my files.
- 5 This material also comes from a document I obtained from Arthur Menzies.
- 6 Again, this material is found in a letter received from Arthur Menzies, on file in my office.

RENQING, PRIVATIZATION, AND KINDLY POWER IN POST-MAO CHINA

Jie Yang

加拿大西蒙弗雷泽大学人类学系的杨洁教授的论文《人情、私有化和自然权力在后毛泽东时代的中国》探索了当代中国从社会主义计划经济到国家资本主义过渡时期面临的挑战。它分析了从国有企业到跨国合资企业在转变过程中“人情”的作用和“人情”的滥用，还有在这个过渡时期围绕着工人们发生的事情。

Scholarship on China's privatization focuses more on state policies of privatization and technologies of constructing self-enterprising and self-animating subjects' ideal for a market economy (cf. Yang 2007; Zhang and Ong 2008) than on the strategies individuals adopt to cope with the crippling effect of privatization and to survive or thrive in the market. Workers who are still at work or laid off from state-owned enterprises are not as passive as described by most scholarship on the effect of privatization; they optimize or even loot resources at State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs) for personal gain. This essay examines the process of privatizing a state-owned enterprise through an international joint venture in Beijing's northern suburb, and the ways that both management and workers mobilized resources and life experiences (such as emotions, connections, and knowledge) at SOEs to cope with the impact of privatization.

The legendary *guanxi* (social connections) and *renqing* (human feelings) nurtured at SOEs are retooled as a vital resource for self-interest and self-governance and as a new "structure of feeling" (Williams 1961, 1977) for management to sustain stability and for

workers to survive in the market. The highlighting of *renqing* in crippling privatization is a way of exercising kindly power, which is a unity of contradictory practices: dismantling the socialist job security and workers' livelihood while downplaying or mystifying such destruction through "benevolent" *renqing*-based measures (see Yang 2010).

RENQING AND SOCIAL EFFECT IN PRIVATIZING A STATE-OWNED ENTERPRISE

China's urban reform was launched in 1984 with state-owned enterprise reform as its crux to invigorate ill-performing SOEs.¹ The purpose of the reform is to allow SOEs to clearly define property rights and responsibilities, separate government from management, and establish a modern enterprise system, so that SOEs can be responsible for their own profits and losses, and get on the track of growth through independent operation under market mechanisms. Massive sell-off of small and medium enterprises was carried out between 1997 and 1998. The consequent round of mergers, bankruptcies, and buy-outs by private capital generated mass unemployment. SOEs have been marginalized as a historical anomaly (Rofel 1999) compared to the dynamic new market economy. Such marginalization not only devalues the contributions of workers to China's planned economy but also legitimates their downward mobility in the post-Mao era. The tremendous pain and hardship of this process have been exacerbated by the lack of an effective social security system or trade unions. During this period, a watch factory in Beijing's northern suburb started to downsize its labor force and to look for an investor through an international joint venture in order to survive on its own.

The 1997 Asian economic crisis derailed the economy of this watch factory where I conducted field research beginning in 2002. It was the time when watch movement production was greatly reduced due to the drastic decline of orders from Southeast Asian countries.

The factory had to implement “a long holiday” (euphemism for layoffs) to downsize its workforce. Layoffs were named this way by management to accord with the unique *renqing*-oriented, socialist culture at SOEs. The use of such a euphemism was supposed to care for workers’ “face” and feelings and was considered by management to be part of the practice of *renqing*. Finally, only less than one third of the workforce (about 500 workers and officials) was called back while the rest of the employees (about 1200) were “off duty” (*xiagang*).² The implementation of mass layoffs through “an extended holiday” in this factory in fact made workers feel more frustrated and vulnerable than the actual impact of unemployment. For the majority of the workforce, their “holiday” was extended from three months to five months, eight months, and then forever. Workers had an illusion that they would be called back for work some day.³ However, in the process of such mass layoffs, about 200 young migrant workers were surreptitiously recruited into the workforce through informal channels. Since 1997 the expectation of resuming their factory jobs and the frustration of being mistreated by management delayed workers’ efforts to search for new jobs in the market and led to a series of worker protests, vandalism and looting factory resources for personal benefits.

In Beijing, the ideal model for privatizing SOEs is through joint ventures with foreign companies. Such a joint-venture pattern not only transforms (privatizes) property rights, but also increases foreign direct investment. Thus, in July 2003, this watch factory together with 103 other state-owned enterprises in Beijing was advertised in major newspapers (the *Workers’ Daily*, the *Beijing Daily*, and the *Beijing Youth Daily*) in order to attract investment from home and abroad. “Packaging” SOEs as compelling “commodities” in these advertisements shows the state’s determination to privatize SOEs and push them into the market. The initiation and negotiation of the joint venture at the watch factory was entirely a project undertaken by management, while workers as the *de facto* owners of the enterprise were ostracized from the agenda. This international joint venture shows how privatization alienated workers from the state.

To fulfill the tasks assigned by the Swiss Company, the joint venture company, management made every effort to measure up to the Swiss standards, even sacrificing its own standards. Thus workers were given an extra workload in addition to their own quota. This just intensified the exploitation. Many of the workers had to spend extra hours on work, laboring on machines late at night or taking their work home. Due to the non-transparency of management and the lack of support from workers, the joint venture was doomed to failure. However, despite the failure, the two senior factory leaders (the director and the party secretary) still got their annual salaries by manipulating the factory's progress reports. The process of privatization benefits the managerial class while victimizing the working class and other groups of lower strata.

Moreover, management often invoked the discourse of *renqing* to conceal the devastating effects of privatization. One compelling example of such *renqing* practices that management highlighted is that while watch products had been unprofitable since 1997, management did not close down the factory, but instead turned it into real estate and rented out most of the buildings to its neighbouring university to pay workers' salary and sustain social harmony and stability. Indeed, management claimed that the way they implemented layoffs and other measures of privatization was sustaining *renqing* and socialist ethics and maintaining "social effects" (*shehui xiaoyi*) rather than pursuing "economic effects" (*jingji xiaoyi*) — keeping workers at work to appease them and to sustain social stability rather than enhancing profit.

Renqing was also playing a part in management's implementation of the labor contract system. Although the labor contract system which serves to terminate guaranteed lifetime job tenure and give new recruits terminable employment contracts was carried out in China in 1986, this contract system was "unexpectedly" introduced at this factory in 1997 in order to downsize the workforce. One of the laid-off workers complained:

No one really took the contracts seriously. To sign five

years, ten years, or without fixed term didn't seem different. You know, here people know each other so well and no one thinks about who could take the contract seriously—people usually cared about each other's "face." But all of a sudden, management introduced the contract system in 1997. At that moment I almost forgot I had signed a five-year contract several years ago. At that time I had no legal consciousness, just signing my name on a piece of paper without reading what was written, then I was told my contract was to expire in 1998, and I had to go. They (management) seemed to have long designed such a trap, to trap us...

Management seemed to take advantage of workers' illusions about of the continued practice of the *renqing*-based, socialist collective ethics and of their entitlement to negotiating and bargain with management in order to facilitate mass layoffs and enforce the contract system.

Renqing served, some felt, as a mask or camouflage for intensified exploitation and manipulation in the privatization process. Indeed, as Comaroff and Comaroff (2001) argue, one of the crucial dimensions nation-states engage in with capitalism is the fetishism of the law, of the capacity of constitutionalism and contract, rights and legal remedies, to accomplish order, civility, justice, and empowerment. This brings about a new awareness of contractual relations. For example, lending money to one's friends or neighbours now requires a note with both parties' signatures on it, which confounded many in this community. But they have to learn to adopt a new structure of feeling and re-adjust their emotional world to correspond to a market economy. The Chinese society seems to have gradually shifted from "a society based on acquaintances or social connections" (*shuren shehui*) to "a credit society" (*xinyu shehui*). In everyday life, the substitution of oral agreement or mutual trust with signatures to identify oneself partly shows the prevalent contractual relations and the new social order,

and partly shows the emergence of a new system of responsibility, which has been scaled down from institutions to individuals.

RENQING AND KINDLY POWER

Management's invocation of *renqing* during the process of privatization is on the one hand to highlight the "benevolence" and "good intention" of the government, and on the other hand, to attend to the still significant role familial and *guanxi*-centered social ethics play in everyday life and market success.⁴ Indeed, as Liang Shuming suggests, Chinese society is neither individual-based (*geren benwei*) nor society-based (*shehui benwei*), but relation/*guanxi*-based (Gold, Guthrie, and Wank 2002: 10). *Renqing* is constructed and circulated through *guanxi* practices. Indeed, the life pattern in this community facilitates information exchange and *guanxi* construction. In an investigation of the percentage of kin/relatives working at the same enterprises in seven Chinese cities (Liu 1995), people who have relatives at the same enterprise make up 38.7% of the total employees, and those who have direct relatives make up 34% (see also Zhang 2001).

Although this percentage is fairly high for an ordinary enterprise, the percentage of relatives in the watch factory is much higher. The reasons may include the following: first, the geographical isolation of the district during the early years of the factory provided its employees more opportunities to find marriage partners within the same enterprise. Second, the enterprise has encouraged inter-marriages through factory policies with a purpose of economizing factory resources, as in housing. Those whose spouses also work in the factory are given priority in housing distribution. Third, almost all migrant workers were recruited into the work force through informal channels, mainly through the employees – their family members, relatives, friends or acquaintances in rural areas. Such a pattern of recruitment has complicated and expanded *guanxi* networks and *guanxi* practices.⁵

The coexistence of the socialist redistributive system and the market does not reduce *guanxi* practices, but has nurtured new ways for the powerful to obtain more resources from the market. *Guanxi* and *renqing* often collapse the bureaucratic boundary at the factory and help to establish market mechanisms, by re-writing pre-existing policies and revitalizing the mobility of human capital.⁶ *Guanxi* practice of this kind serves as a catalyst for changes in the restrictive system, and constitutes a form of resistance to the social control exercised through the work-unit system.

RENQING WEI: A STRUCTURE OF FEELING

Although management legitimated privatization measures as *renqing*-based practices, workers complained about the anti-working-class privatization policies as a lack of *renqing* at the factory. *Renqing* thus becomes a contested value which both management and workers attempt to redefine and mobilize for their own advantage or purposes. Yan Yunxiang (1996) defines *renqing* as a system of ethics that guides and regulates one's behavior when dealing with others. He suggests that the system of *renqing* has three structural dimensions – rational calculation, moral obligation, and emotional attachment – and any of these three elements can be emphasized in actual practice. The discourse of *renqing* somehow works as a new structure of feeling (Williams 1961, 1977). As an analytic category and a methodological tool, a “structure of feeling” is useful to capture the delicate change in human feelings within broader social changes. It is defined as “social experiences *in solution*, as distinct from other social semantic formations which have been *precipitated* and are more evidently and more immediately available” (Williams 1977: 134). It is social experience, actively lived and felt. Structures of feeling are common to different classes, and yet serve the interests of some classes better than others.

The structure of feeling in a society, as Williams contends, becomes evident in moments of transition, of change. By depicting the socially reflexive experience, the structure of feeling captures

the significance of change and the dynamics of change in a cultural system without reducing them to any pre-given material structures such as structural determinism. As the social structure changes, new means are perceived and realized, while old means appear empty and artificial. At the point where change is felt and becomes conscious, it is often in tension with old ways of articulation. Thus with orientations to new material structures, people have to find acceptable ways to orient themselves emotionally in new situations. This method thus emphasizes the meaning not as something which is there, but which is actively made and lived. The watch factory in Beijing seemed to appropriate the normative discourse of *renqing* in order to organize people's feelings and the meaning-making process in a transitional period in China; management uses the *renqing* discourse to define the "good intention" of its various privatization measures and to regulate the way the individual communicates and gives meaning to the new social structure she/he finds her/himself in. There are multiple ways to attach one's feelings to the material structures. But *renqing* of this kind is a hegemonic structure of feeling that is invented and defined by enterprise management, not a structure of feeling in which ordinary people spontaneously communicate their authentic feelings.

It may be difficult to trace emotions and feelings, but they may become clear when such feelings are instituted in organizations and in the very process of change. The structure of feeling captures something at once "firm and definite" yet operative in "the most delicate and least tangible parts of our activity (emotion)." This is something between ideology and discourse. It is in one sense "the culture of a period," but culture conceived as "an aesthetic-individual experience," "the particular living result of all the elements in the general organization" (Williams 1961: 63-65).

Williams emphasizes discursive frames and social forms as major factors or containers for the scrutiny of change through the structure of feeling. Indeed, *renqing* is most easily identified and constructed in rituals — the kind of social form that emphasizes *renqing* and downplays market ruthlessness. Here *renqing* refers

to both ordinary people's practice of *renqing* (e.g., encompassed in gift-giving) and management's re-contextualization of such *renqing* within its power contour. For example, to appease workers amidst intensified exploitation in the process of privatization, before the 2002 mid-Autumn festival (a traditional Chinese festival for family reunion), the factory gave each worker twenty fish and 100 yuan cash as gifts and a symbol of *renqing*. When I asked one of the workers why management did not just give workers cash-150 yuan (the same value as both the money and fish), he said, "It sounds so good, full of *renqing wei* (the colloquial form of *renqing*, literally translated as "sense of *renqing*")." Also, fish has an auspicious connotation of wealth, as in the proverb *nian nian you yu*, "There is always something left over for the New Year." Here, the *yu* "leftover" in *nian nian you yu* is the homonym of the Chinese *yu* "fish." Further, the ritual of distributing fish is a ritual of *renqing* and matters more than the actual money value. Indeed, the fish-distribution was a big fuss in the factory, which involved efforts from both management and workers. Management had to put the fish into more than 500 individual plastic bags, drive back from the fish pool, and then inform each workshop, which would further inform each worker. Each workshop had to send people to get their shares and divide them into different piles for each work team. The team leader had to confirm their fish, count the number of bags, and take the workers there for further distribution. It was such a big event that for the whole afternoon a discourse on fish was circulating in the factory. Some suspected that the fish were too small and might not taste good; some said that such fish should be cooked right away, as it would not be delicious after being frozen; some suggested that they should immediately send the fish to their friends and relatives as gifts which would save them money for other gifts; some suggested sending the fish to their parents-in-law and ask them to help with cleaning up the fish, and so on.

Anyway, the management's *renqing* discourse through fish distribution seemed to reproduce a whole set of *renqing* practices among workers so that the "socialist" *renqing* that management

advocated was then infiltrated into workers' discourse and emotional world. But the practice of *renqing* is not only a market strategy – the factory purchased the fish from one of its most important clients to exchange favors – but also attempted to pacify workers amidst an intensified workload and exploitation to stabilize society. However, such *renqing* practices were not immune to workers' critique. One of the doorkeepers at the factory commented:

I heard the reason that American soldiers were so dedicated to the Iraqi war is that they were paid very well. If the factory pays us well, management does not need to perform those perfunctory, useless *renqing*, and we would work hard. The way they tried hard to show *renqing* is to conceal the fact that they did not pay workers well or treat us fairly or humanely; they owe us something.

The discourse of socialist *renqing* also refers to the kind of flexibility, inertia and low efficiency nurtured through years of the planned economy, which has generated particularistic ties (*guanxi*), satisfied individual needs, and fulfilled self-interest at the expense of the public interest.⁷ For example, a woman, after working at a private company for half a year, returned to the factory. Despite the meager income, the major reason for her return was that at the watch factory, there was *renqing wei* while in private companies it was too cold, empty of *renqing*. She gave the following example:

One morning, I was one hour late for work, because a passenger on the bus I boarded found her wallet missing, and the bus driver had to drive the bus directly to the bus company in order to identify the thief. I explained the situation to my supervisor, but he still fined me 100 yuan following company's rules. This really annoyed me. Too devoid of *renqing wei* (*Tai mei you renqing wei le*). I left immediately. Here, if you say you have something to do, you can be absent the whole day let alone one hour. Leaders are “sympathetic and understanding” (*tong qing da li*).⁸

While this woman enjoyed the *renqing* and flexibility at the factory, she complained of the low salary at this soon-to-be private enterprise. She thus made full use of her connections and of *renqing* practices at the factory and worked secretly for one of her former coworkers' private company, making extra money to complement her low factory salary.

Indeed, the factory party secretary indicated that the practices at SOEs follow the order of *qing* "human feelings," *li* "rationality," and *fa* "law" while the private sector orders them in reverse: law, rationality and human feelings. Here *qing* means *renqing*. *Renqing wei* was supposed to be basic socialist ethics (at least nominally) and one of the defining features of the relationship between the party-state and its subjects in a state-owned enterprise, as workers were de facto owners of the enterprise. Dependent and inefficient practices nurtured over years at the socialist workplace were supposed to signify part of *renqing wei*. In the process of privatization, by tightening up factory regulations, the dislocation of such inefficient work styles at a state-owned enterprise would dilute the so-called *renqing wei*, undercut workers' emotional world, and eventually re-orient their structures of feeling to those suitable in a market economy.

RENQING AS ENTREPRENEURIAL CAPITAL

Ong and Zhang (2008) suggest that privatization intensifies individualization and self-interest and constitutes an ongoing process of private responsibility, requiring ordinary Chinese to take their life into their own hands and to face the consequences of their decisions on their own (Ong and Zhang 2008: 16). Privatization in this watch factory community has not seemed to have caused the rise of self-interested practices. For example, this working class community has recently witnessed the emergence of several urban cooperatives, collectively owned and managed by laid-off workers who were former co-workers or "iron brothers" at the watch factory. A laid-off worker, Li Qiang, was re-employed to manage the factory's

laundry stall and he subsequently transformed the stall into a souvenir store, then into a bigger trading company. This appeared to be a success story illustrating the state's objective of reconstructing the subjectivities of laid-off workers for entrepreneurial capitalism. But Li indicated that his long-term plan was to recruit his former co-workers at the factory to work *with* him so that he could concentrate on market expansion. He was apparently a capitalist in the making, but he insisted that he would prefer to manage and even own his company collectively with his trustworthy "iron brothers" rather than become the sole boss. This contradicts or, at the very least, adds an unexpected twist to the view of most Reemployment Service Centers that layoffs are an opportunity for entrepreneurship and that workers should become "bosses of their own." The establishment of urban cooperatives shows the emergence of new collectivism in the wake of privatization in this community.

In 1998, the factory subcontracted its workshops as a way to implement market mechanisms and to prepare for privatization. However, such a subcontracting system, rather than enhancing efficiency and profit, produced more labor disputes and provided workshop leaders more opportunities to practice *renqing* for their own benefit, increasing their allocative power. Since the late 1990s, several workshop leaders, after finishing their contract, have left the factory and established their own enterprises or joint-ventures with township or village enterprises nearby. But they all have been in regular contact with their previous workshops, from which they borrowed equipment or money, lured skilled workers to work for them, and shared the same brand with the factory's products. Another workshop director, Wang Jian, had longed to leave the factory in order to concentrate on his own enterprise. He changed his job history from being a cadre to a worker in his *dang'an* (personal dossier) so that he could retire five years earlier. (According to state policies, a cadre retires at 60 while a worker retires at 55.) While still working for the factory, with the help of his factory friends, he faked reports to devalue some of the equipment so that he could purchase it at a very cheap price for his own company. Therefore,

state enterprise and various *renqing* practices become an important resource for entrepreneurial capital.

CONCLUSION

Privatization is not a scattered or provisional measure but a well-planned, state-orchestrated experiment, degrading the working class and establishing the middle class. But the discursive emphasis on *renqing* in privatization provides the government with an opportunity to exercise its kindly power and “benevolent” rule. Such hegemonic governance is perhaps one of the reasons that economic restructuring, privatization, with the consequent mass unemployment and new urban poverty in China have been described as a peaceful revolution (Hu et al. 2002). *Renqing* is not only claimed by management as a means to highlight Chinese characteristics and socialist advantages in the face of unemployment and urban poverty, thereby distinguishing China from cold, *rational* capitalism; it also serves as a cushion for privatization’s softlanding.

The socialist workplace and labor are no longer prime sites for the creation of value or identity (Sennett 1998). In the Chinese context, economic restructuring has transferred the center for production and family income from the state sector to the private sector or market. In the early 1990s, Deng Xiaoping even advocated “consumption as a motor force of production” (Dirlik 1996: 194). As consumption became the dominant ideology/practice of the late twentieth century, there was a concomitant eclipse of production. Indeed, as Comaroff and Comaroff (2001) suggest, the emergence of consumption as a privileged site for the fabrication of self and society, of culture and identity, is closely tied to the changing status of work under contemporary conditions. Privatization is thus contributing to change and some confusion in the social fabric of China.

Notes

- 1 China's planned economy accumulated huge state assets under the dominant ideology that "the more state economy, the stronger China is." Statistics show that China has about 190,000 SOEs and more than 10 trillion yuan (US\$ 1.2 trillion) worth of assets. The SOE sector employs about 70% of the labor force in Chinese industry. In 1978, SOEs generated about 78% of the industrial output while by 1997 the SOE share had fallen to about 27%. In 1997, 46% of SOEs were operating in deficit.
- 2 According to the factory management, there have been three major waves of unemployment in urban China. The first wave was in the early 1960s. After a massive recruitment of labor to cities during the Great Leap Forward (1958–60), in 1962, those who entered cities in 1958 and who were recruited to work in 1958, had to return to their native places. According to some factory people, this movement was called "62 *ya*"- "62 forced return." At this factory, disabled workers were also asked to leave during this movement, and only several women stayed as they married factory employees. The second wave was *youthua zuhe* "the optimization grouping" in state enterprises in the early 1980s; women were the first to be excluded from efficient work teams, and reoriented to the service sector or domestic sphere. This change did not affect the factory that much, because at that time the factory was still expanding its production. The third wave by the end of the 1990s has impacted this factory significantly.
- 3 To relieve the threat of laid-off workers on social stability, in 1994 the Labor Department began the pilot 'Re-employment Project' in 30 cities and in 1995, took it nationwide. These projects mobilize public resources to provide re-employment for laid-off workers with government assistance. In state-owned enterprises, Re-employment Service Centers were established as a transitional measure to pacify those laid-off and arrange jobs for them, and most of the centers were closed in 2003 to signify the final transition to a market-oriented employment system.
- 4 Workers have no alternatives to bargain with the management. Although they are unionized once joining the workforce, the trade union, headed by the deputy party committee secretary, serves the management and is totally under the Party's control. The dualism of leadership (the Party and the executives), and the pyramid-like institutional order leave little room for workers to negotiate with management for their own interests. The avenue to channel their complaints or to secure benefits or rights is to cultivate informal *guanxi* with superiors voluntarily or involuntarily to seek protection and to guarantee their interests and well-being.
- 5 *Guanxi* can wind its way into a market economy (Yang 1988). Indeed, some flourishing industries are even primarily based on this legendary practice, e.g., the multilevel marketing (Jeffrey 2001) and the insurance industry. Many insurance agents successfully mobilize and manipulate the insecurity

and uncertainty of workers in the process of privatization to sell insurance to workers. Further, to stimulate consumption, *renqing* has recently been commercialized by mass media through advertising new fancy gifts (commodities) in ways that essentialize the affective/emotional aspect of *guanxi* for profit—a kind of marketing emotion.

- 6 For example, since mid-1980s, there had been a policy to restrain labor mobility from the *danwei*: *no one* was allowed to leave the factory unless they returned their factory house, because many employees (especially those technicians and engineers) aspired to pursue entrepreneurial jobs in the private sector over working in the declining watch factory. If one person wanted to leave, his/her spouse had to leave as well and hand in their highly subsidized factory housing. As an alternative strategy, some couples then filed fake divorces in order for men to leave the factory so that their wives could keep their factory work and factory housing. But later on, this policy was cancelled because of a shop official's strong *guanxi* connection. A former workshop director Yuan Guang made this breakthrough with his own *guanxi*. Thanks to his powerful cousin who headed another big state enterprise which provided this factory with natural gas, Yuan left the factory and worked as an entrepreneur in South China without handing in his housing or jeopardizing her wife's factory job. This kind of *guanxi* practices, by re-allocating factory resources, constitutes an important part of the political economy.
- 7 “Dependence” and “inertia” nurtured by the command economy cannot be redressed immediately. For example, meetings and reports constitute an important part of the managing style, and meetings not only provide an opportunity to exchange information and to solve production bottlenecks, but also constitute a major site to develop delicate delaying tactics and *guanxi* practices.”
- 8 It does not mean that everyone thinks of state enterprises are full of *renqing wei*. This woman is special because of her prestigious status as an accountant and her important *guanxi* network in this factory. Most of the ordinary workers believed that the *renqing wei* had been attenuated in this factory and diluted by recent privatization and corruption.

Works Cited

- Comaroff, Jean and John J. Comaroff. 2001. "Millennial Capitalism: First Thoughts on a Second Coming," in *Millennial Capitalism and the Culture of Neoliberalism*, (eds.) Jean Comaroff and John L. Comaroff. Durham & London: Duke University Press. Pp. 1-56.
- Dirlik, Arif. 1989. "Introduction," in *Marxism and the Chinese Experience*. (eds.) Arif Dirlik and Maurice Meisner. M. E. Sharpe.
- Dirlik, Arif and Zhang Xudong. 1997. "Introduction: Postmodernism and China." *Boundary 2*, 24 (3): 1-18.
- Hu, Angang, Cheng Yonghong, Yang Yunxin, et al. 2002. *Kuoda jiuye yu tiaozhan shiye: Zhongguo jiuye zhengce pinggu (1949–2001) To Expand Employment and Challenge Unemployment: Evaluation of China's Employment Policies (1949–2001)*. *Zhongguo Laodong shehui baozhang chubanshe*.
- Kipnis, Andrew. 2003. "The Anthropology of Power and Maoism." *American Anthropologist* 105 (2): 278-288.
- Liu, Dehuai. 1995. "Dangqian zhongguo qiye zuzhi de chuantong tezhenq," (The traditional characteristics in contemporary Chinese enterprises) in *Shehuixue yanjiu Sociological Research*. Issue 5.
- Ong, Aihwa and Li Zhang. 2008. "Introduction: Privatizing China: Powers of the Self, Socialism from Afar." In *Privatizing China: Socialism from Afar*, eds. Li Zhang and Aihwa Ong, 1-19. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press.
- Rofel, Lisa. 1999. *Other Modernities: Gendered Yearnings in China after Socialism*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Sennett, Richard. 1998. *The Corrosion of Character: The Personal Consequences of Work in the New Capitalism*. New York: WW. Norton.
- Williams, Raymond. 1977. *Marxism and Literature*. Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Williams, Raymond. 1961. *The Long Revolution*. Columbia University Press.

- Yan Hairong. 2003. "Spectralization of the Rural: Reinterpreting the labor mobility of rural young women in post-Mao China." *American Ethnologist* 30: 576-94.
- Yan, Yunxiang. 1996. *The Flow of Gifts: Reciprocity and Social Networks in a Chinese Village*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.
- Yang, Jie. 2010. "The Crisis of Masculinity: Class, Gender and Kindly Power in Post-Mao China." *American Ethnologist* 37 (3): Forthcoming
- Yang, Mayfair Meihui. 1988. "The Modernity of Power in the Chinese Socialist Order." *Cultural Anthropology* 3 (4): 408-427.
- Zhang, Yi. 2002. *Guoyou qiye de jiazuhua* (The family tendency of state-owned enterprises). *Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe*.

EDUCATIONAL CHALLENGES IN CHINA

Glenn F. Cartwright

加拿大滑铁卢大学瑞纳森大学学院校长高德兰博士的论文《中国教育的挑战》探索了邓小平在1983年提出的“三个面向”的提法。他认为，这种对现代化教育的追求是为了适应世界的发展和开放的未来。它关注在过渡时期中国教育所面临的挑战，并指出了计算机在全球教育的中心地位。

In 1983 Premier Deng Xiaoping (1904–1997) suggested that education in the new century must promote modernization, foster a world view, and gear its citizens for the future.¹ He envisioned new education for modernization, for the world, and for the future. Though somewhat awkward, these three “fors” have come to be known as the “Three Fors Inscription.” It was a way of speaking of education for modernization, which is a process; for the world, which is a place; and for the future, which is a time. In short, he was speaking of *process, place, and time*, hence my remarks and reflections will focus on these three notions.

I. EDUCATION FOR MODERNIZATION: A PROCESS

I begin with the process. Deng Xiaoping understood that education was not a *product* but an ongoing *process* necessary for modernization. Decades ago, one of the first books education students were advised to read was *The Process of Education* (1960) by Harvard University Professor Dr. Jerome Bruner.² Few beginning education students had a firm concept of education, and probably fewer still envisioned it as a process. Bruner’s astounding claim was that “*any subject can be taught effectively in some intellectually*

honest form to any child at any stage of development.” In other words, if we could just get down to a baby’s level, we could teach complex subjects like mathematics in an intellectually honest form. Does this sound at all like the great philosopher Confucius? Though Bruner’s claim was somewhat of an exaggeration, his controversial book stimulated thinking about education. But it was his notion of education as a *process* – rather than a product or an end – that seemed new. Education was seen as a dynamic progression which battered the ancient beliefs that education was a “thing” one could possess. Even our old language betrayed that previous style of thinking: people would say “He was educated at Oxford” as if education were a product one acquired at graduation after which further acquisition ceased.

It was also Bruner who wrote a half century ago about iconic thinking – the idea that people can learn and think in pictures or icons – and that such analogical representations become metaphorical due to their functional similarity to the structures and actions being modeled. The icon of a briefcase on a computer screen reminds the user of a real briefcase, and this in turn suggests it can be used metaphorically for carrying computer files home. It was Bruner’s recognition of the benefits of iconic thinking that later formed the philosophical basis of human-computer interface development, first at the Xerox PARC (Palo Alto Research Center), and later at Apple Inc., with the Macintosh’s iconic “desktop” user interface. What is remarkable is that iconic thinking had already been known in China for thousands of years and formed the basis of the Chinese written language.

In English, the word “process” has another meaning. When a line or queue of people march or move together – they are said to “process” in a procession. One can never get anywhere without moving – without processing in this sense. To get anywhere, to arrive at a new place, requires movement.

Education is a process that generates movement – movement of thoughts and words, knowledge and wisdom, ideals and values. Education helps us move forward and therefore creates the

momentum required for modernization. Deng Xiaoping knew that modernization required movement fuelled by education. However, modernization is more than new industrial processes, more than new machinery, more than new factories and buildings. It also means new thinking, new concepts, and new exploration. Modernization implies not only the renewal of the physical plant but the renewal of human resources by re-equipping populations with the cognitive tools and skills required for success in the world of tomorrow.

Modernization is an on-going process that is never completed because all new things become old and the process must start again. Rather than an end goal, modernization is a process by which we come to view the world with new eyes and new thinking and new ideas. To be successful, new education must necessarily include modernization, for education and modernization go hand in hand: both are rooted in movement; both bring us to a new place.

II. EDUCATION FOR THE WORLD: PLACE

Decades after his pronouncement, it is clear that although the broad, expansive process of education that Deng Xiaoping envisioned needed to be rooted in a place, its focus had to be the world.

Futurists often say “Think globally, act locally.” Applied to education, this may be reworded: “Teach locally, educate globally!” At a time when the rest of the world knew little of China, Deng Xiaoping understood that true education transcended nationality and geography. He knew that new education must equip citizens to achieve the highest standards of global competence, not only so that they could look after themselves, their families, and their societies but also so that they could add to the world’s progress, increase global well-being, and become full participants in the advance of humanity.

Deng knew that the world was becoming a relatively smaller place. As its size shrinks, citizens with a worldwide understanding are able to compete more effectively, live more comfortably, and contribute more meaningfully.

Enter the computer! The rise of the computer in the last half

century promised to help us with some of these goals. Individual computers have amplified human intelligence, and their interconnection now forms a rudimentary nervous system for the planet. This means that each individual contributes much like a nerve cell in a giant global brain and in doing so can help influence the entire world.

Today, students routinely post their papers on the world-wide-web (www). The power of student scholarship in the electronic world is that their work becomes instantly available around the planet for others to extend and use in their research. This places a new and important responsibility on students and elevates previously mundane class assignments from routine busy-work to meaningful global exchanges. The web makes assignments real, gives students a sense of purpose, and motivates them to do their best work. What a forward, positive change!

Globally, the computer network is growing. Though we have called it the "World Wide Web," it is possible to view the network as analogous to a mechanical harvester. It now seems increasingly likely that the computer's ultimate contribution to society will be to harvest human intellectual activity. If this is correct, it is good news for nations with large populations in that, for the first time, the computer presents a new way of harvesting the skills, attributes, and abilities of the citizens. This is fundamental in the information age, and the key lies precisely in using the computer as an electronic harvester: developing the skills of the population and marshalling them toward greater productivity. To improve a nation, we must improve its people.

This idea is not new, for as Asoka Mehta writing about India pointed out decades ago,

. . . we are dealing with a land, a society, and a people who have suffered the effects of erosion. Where then do we begin? In my opinion, the only way to solve the problem is not to remake our soil or our society, but to remake our people. The whole process has to be reversed. We cannot

hope to remake our economy if we don't improve our people.³

How we do this depends on our perception. Here are two examples. Two of the greatest natural resources of the new century are water and nervous tissue – that is, human brains. Traditionally, both of these have been undervalued. Let's look at two examples, the first from Canada, the second from China.

Canada has only slightly more than the world average of fresh water per unit of surface area but because it is the world's second largest country in area, this gives it 20% of the world's fresh water. It also raises serious issues involving production of drinking water, harnessing of water power for hydroelectric generation, resource management, quality control, distribution of both hydroelectric power and fresh water within both Canada and United States, and consumption inside Canada and beyond. In Canada, these are often seen as problems, but in fact, they are remarkable opportunities, opportunities that Canada has yet to fully address. It is similar when we look at China.

With the world's largest population, China has the largest number of human brains and therefore the greatest amount of nervous tissue. At least 20% of the world's fresh student minds live in China. Educating these student brains raises logistical and other issues similar to the management of Canada's water problem: production, harnessing, resource management, quality control, distribution, and consumption. By production here is meant the creation of educational materials. The harnessing of brainpower, the management of ability, the quality control of educational delivery, and the distribution of such a large pool of human talent – the largest talent pool in the history of the world – are China's great challenges in the new century. An additional 20-25 million new students are expected in China by the year 2020.⁴ The task is straightforward: educate 20% of the world's students efficiently and economically to the highest standards of global competence. Again, this is not so much a problem as it is a challenging opportunity!

If necessity is truly the mother of invention, then China will find new ways of educating large numbers of students, invent new ingenious ways of instruction, create new methods of educational delivery, improve content management, stabilize quality control, and develop advanced evaluation and assessment procedures. Looking at the great changes that took place during the Tenth Five-Year Plan (2001–2005) and the extensive programming for the Eleventh Five-Year Plan (2006–2010) convinces me that China will emerge as a leader in efficient, modern, progressive education that will be a model for the world.

The key, of course, is resource utilization, and in the information age the resource is people. Rarely in history have people been considered a natural resource, except in times of war when large armies proved more successful than small armies. The computer provides the means of utilizing that natural resource, and nations with large populations may well find themselves rich beyond counting if they can harvest these human resources using the computer. What had once been a burden of overpopulation may well turn out to be a human gold mine. Why the change?

The reason is that the world is moving away from a production society towards an information-society, where it is information and ideas that are bought and sold. As John Naisbett (1982) observed, “with information as the strategic resource, access to the economic system is much easier.”⁵ He then went on to say that “information is an economic entity because it costs something to produce and because people are willing to pay for it.”⁶

But ideas do not originate in computers; they originate in people. It follows that a nation rich in people can be a nation rich in ideas. Ideas, information, and knowledge collected and packaged appropriately are what will sell in tomorrow’s marketplace. The computer can, and must, be used as a medium to develop, collect, and distribute these new ideas.

To accomplish this, new skills must be developed in the population or at the very least in a significant subset of the population. Such programs of development cannot be accomplished

by individual educators or by institutions working in isolation, nor can they be implemented solely by government policy without the cooperation of those intimately involved with the technology. Only an integrated approach will work.

We must come to conceptualize the computer as catalyst, network, and harvester. At the most basic level, the computer is a catalyst for the development of the central nervous system at higher levels it improves the skills and abilities required for effective education. In a network, it provides the opportunity of linking individuals together, amplifying their brainpower, cumulating their thoughts, and multiplying their abilities. Seen as a harvester, the network can be used to gather the thinking output of a nation, a priceless commodity in the information age.⁷

China has already made tremendous progress if the number of its people on the internet is any indicator. For example, by December 2009, 28.7% of China's citizens were internet users and they had created 3.23 million web sites. And by February 2010 there were 384 million internet users in China, of whom 346 million were using Broadband. Thus China is already number one in the world in terms of the number of internet users.⁸

III. FOR THE FUTURE: A TIME

In addition to occurring in a particular place, education must also be for a particular time. Deng Xiaoping said that education was for the future, the third "for" of his "Three Fors Inscription." The future is uniquely situated on the time continuum. It starts now and moves forward. It is not just another year or another century the way past years or centuries have been. The future has quite different characteristics from the past. For example, as Deng Xiaoping wisely knew, though we cannot change our past, we can change our future. It is in this way that the future differs most from the past.

The future is not just something that happens to us, something

over which we have no control – in fact, we construct our future. Unlike the past, the future has unlimited possibilities, and it is we who create them, choose them, and live in them. New education must prepare students for life in the future. Though it has become a cliché to say so, it is in the future that they will spend the rest of their lives. Using new techniques like Virtual Reality, education can help prepare students by creating multiple scenarios which can be explored, visited, examined, and then chosen or rejected. In this way, students can make choices about their lives in the future and actively help to plan them.

The growth of information technology and its application to education is a case in point. Many of us who were involved in educational computer applications during the past three decades were nonetheless surprised by the rapid growth of information technology, its spread around the world, and the sheer immensity of the database. Just a few months after the start of the World Wide Web, there were millions of web pages available. Many asked, “Where did they come from?” Why do people wish to put their knowledge on line, available to others, usually at no cost? Why do people enjoy surfing the Web?”

One reason for the Web’s popularity is that it is a model of the human brain. Our brains work by association: think of one idea and it stimulates another. This is analogous to clicking a link on a web page. Human thinking is not horizontal but vertical. The web is also vertical, hence its human appeal.

A second reason is that web authoring promotes a sense of sharing, a spread of valuable knowledge, and a feeling of powerful accomplishment. While many people fear the future, and fear change, in fact the future should be comforting to us so long as we have some measure of control over it by virtue of the choices we make.

IV. CONCLUSION

The passage of nearly thirty years has shown the wisdom of Deng Xiaoping. His “Three Fors Inscription” is a vision that has

endured and will continue. His vision is a gift to all of us: a guide for educators, and an insight into the future. It is a challenge for present and future generations. As Deng Xiaoping might have said, “the future starts now!”

Notes

- 1 Initially presented at the International Education Forum in Beijing, PRC, on the occasion of the 20th Anniversary of Deng Xiaoping’s Inscription for Beijing Jingshan School in September 2003, it has been slightly revised for publication here. In 1983, Deng Xiaoping had announced that education ‘must promote modernization, a world view, and gear citizens for the future.’ This view came to be shortened to “The Three Fors.” In Cartwright’s view, the “three fors” became the themes of “modernization, the world, and the future,” in his reflections on education with special reference to China.
- 2 Jerome Brunner, *The Process of Education* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1960).
- 3 R. Aron, ed., *World Technology and Human Destiny* (Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press, 1963), p. 131.
- 4 See Glen Cartwright, “Technological Webwork: Cultural and societal implications,” a paper presented at the Technology and Development Seminar. Jaipur, India: University of Rajasthan, 1985.
- 5 See John Naisbett, *Megatrends* (New York: Warner Books, 1982), p. 15.
- 6 *Ibid.*, p. 36.
- 7 See Cartwright paper (1985) cited above. This paper is available from the author.
- 8 See *Internetworldstats* 2010. Retrieved May 14, 2010, from <http://interworldstats.com/asia/cn.htm>.

SPIRITS IN CHINA

中国酒文化

Norman Smith

本章论证了酒在中国漫长而复杂的历史进程中，在本地习俗与外来影响的交织中，在国家酒政和民间文化相互咬合中所发挥的历史性作用：首先叙述了酒在中国的起源与发展；然后从正负两方面考察饮酒习俗的社会效应，并简要概述了不同时期的国家酒政。

In one of the most celebrated scenes of the iconic *Romance of the Three Kingdoms* (San guo yanyi), warriors Liu Bei, Guan Yu, and Zhang Fei swear an oath in the Peach Garden to defend their homeland, solemnizing their pledge with sacrifices, a feast, and “wine for libation.”¹ While the dramatic event might not have actually taken place, its prominence in the novel underlines the significance of alcohol in Chinese culture and stands in stark contrast to widely-held views that Chinese cannot or do not consume alcohol. Understandably, given the history of imperialism and wars against drugs, another intoxicant, opium, has until recently attracted more scholarly and popular attention than alcohol in China, the location of the first drug war in modern history, the Opium War (1839–42). But alcohol has had a far longer and more wide-ranging presence in Chinese societies than opium. This essay argues that alcohol has played historic roles in cultural practices and state policies, in a lengthy and complex interweaving of local and foreign influences. Received interpretations of alcohol’s origins in China and subsequent development will be recounted. Then positive and negative narratives surrounding alcohol consumption, and state approaches to it, will be outlined.

In the 2009 book *Yin jiu shihua* (History of Wine Drinking),

the editor Gong Li argues that “wine poses the core of all Chinese custom.”² Similarly, Xu Xiaomin has labelled alcohol the “water of history.”³ These assertions underline increasing recognition of the depth and breadth of the history of alcohol, or *jiu*, the standard Mandarin pronunciation of the character used to refer to all forms of alcohol, from hard liquor to grape wine and beer. The character has been found on oracle bones that date to the origins of Chinese writing. Significantly, Zhou dynasty (1045–256 BCE) writing of the word *yi*, to cure, was composed of two parts, with the lower half being the character, *jiu*,⁴ illustrating the long existence of *jiu* and understandings of positive, healthful consumption of alcohol in Chinese culture.⁵

Not surprisingly, the circumstances surrounding the discovery or invention of alcohol in China are hotly contested. In *Minjian yinshi xisu* (Popular Food and Drink Customs), Xuan Bingshan details a history of over 5000 years while citing a saying that argues for a much longer durée: *jiu yu tiandi tongshi* (alcohol and the world are contemporaries).⁶ Gong Li defends a history of over 6000 years, noting that it is now generally held that alcohol was discovered rather than invented.⁷ Chang Chiung-fang pushes the date of human use to over 7000 years.⁸ Archaeological excavations have yielded alcohol-related implements 8000 years old.⁹ Zhu Baoyong has demonstrated how *li*, an early form of beer also referenced on oracle bones, was being produced in China at approximately the same time that it was in Neolithic Babylon, circa 9500 BCE.¹⁰ In 1937, archaeologist Wu Qichang mused that crops had been planted “at first not for the purpose of food but for brewing of alcoholic drinks; eating food actually stemmed out of drinking the alcohol.”¹¹ Wu thus envisioned a history dating to over 10,000 years, with a transformative impact on human socio-economic development. Debate over these dates results from not only the expanding parameters of historical research but also awareness of China’s *jiu wenhua* (alcohol culture) and the desire to legitimize claims to expertise for domestic consumers and producers, and foreign markets.

The earliest alcohol history is shrouded in myth. Alcohol's "invention" has long been associated with the names of Yi Di and Du Kang, two figures supposed to have lived in the Xia dynasty (2070–1600 BCE). Yi Di is argued to have produced alcohol for her father, Yu the Great, the founder of the dynasty.¹² Yi's position in popular narratives was secured by arguments that she made *huang jiu* (rice wine) and *laozao* (a beverage of fermented glutinous rice). Far more popular, though, is Du Kang who, in recent times at least, has been accorded more credibility. Du is believed to have been the son of the fifth Xia king and traces of his life in historical records have long been posited as proof of his existence, and that of alcohol. His association with alcohol has been so extensive that his name is now synonymous with *jiu*. Du is even linked with alcohol in proverbs; for example, *heyi jie jiu / wei you Du Kang* (To relieve worries, only Du Kang will do).¹³ Both Yi and Du attest to the long relevance of alcohol in Chinese culture, although it is doubtful that either invented alcohol.

Alcohol's earliest historical stages may ultimately prove impossible to plot, but the subsequent development of various forms of alcohol has been outlined with some precision. By the Zhou dynasty, four kinds of alcoholic beverages were known and considered "an indispensable part of every feast, many meals, and important ritual occasions of both Shang and [Zhou] periods."¹⁴ Alcohol was so valued by the Zhou court that 60% of the 4,000 workers in the king's residential quarters handled food and alcohol; this number included 110 alcohol officers, 340 alcohol servers, and 170 specialists in the "six drinks."¹⁵ By the Western Han dynasty (206 BCE–9 CE), millet, wheat and other cereal-based forms of alcohol had overtaken *li* in popularity and by the Wei dynasty (386–534), alcohol use had spread to the masses, who frequently produced their own.¹⁶ In the Tang dynasty (618–907), popular cereal-based beverages were joined by rice and grape based counterparts as extension of the Grand Canal enabled the spread of varied technologies.¹⁷ The development of distillation has been dated to the Song (960–1279) and Jin (1115–1234) dynasties.¹⁸ Some

have credited Taoist alchemists who were trying to create pills of immortality while others, including the Ming (1368–1644) doctor Li Shizhen, date distilling later to the Yuan dynasty (1279–1368), from whence, Chang Chiung-fang has argued, it travelled westward to Europe, to inspire the invention of vodka.¹⁹

Grape wine has a lengthy history in China, dating to the Western Han dynasty and the Silk Road travels of Zhang Qian (d. 114 BCE). In 138 BCE, the emperor, Han Wudi (r. 141–87 BCE), sent Zhang west on a diplomatic mission, where he was introduced to grape wine. Although grape wine was known from then, it did not enjoy wide-spread popularity until several centuries later in the Tang dynasty. Tang consumers esteemed grape wine produced in the Silk Road city of Liangzhou (present-day Wuwei, Gansu); it was reported that the celebrated beauty Yang Guifei (719–756) drank it from a jewelled cup.²⁰ Contemporary literature is replete with references to wine, how it appealed to all classes of people and was available in monasteries, hostels, and shops. The Tang Taizong emperor (r. 626–649) was even rumoured to have produced seven varieties of grape wine in his palace.²¹ The cosmopolitan Tang era witnessed exponential growth in the variety and availability of wine, and left lasting impressions across Chinese cultures.

Alcohol has long had a presence in formal rituals, less-structured observances, and daily life. Alcohol was used in the most symbolic state rituals performed by emperors and other elites.²² Alcohol features in activities for most major festivals, including the Lantern Festival, Spring Festival, Tomb Sweeping Day, Dragon Boat, Moon Festival, Double Ninth, and in ceremonies of veneration for one's ancestors. The depth to which alcohol penetrated Chinese culture is attested to by the proverb, "without wine, there is no li (etiquette)."²³ Alcohol is considered by many to be an essential element of a banquet. Leisurely consumption led drinkers to variously compose poetry, play music, or engage in finger-guessing games. In terms of health, alcohol was credited with combating rheumatism and exhaustion; increasing blood production and circulation; improving mental well-being, appetite, digestion, and

complexion; and expelling wind.²⁴ In the Han dynasty, Wang Mang wrote that alcohol was “the oldest of a hundred medicines” (*bai yao zhi zhang*).²⁵ One’s physical strength might be augmented by consuming alcohol, as demonstrated by the legendary examples of the Han dynasty’s founder, Liu Bang (r. 202–195 BCE), who killed a giant white snake while intoxicated, or by Wu Song (of *Shui hu zhuan* [The Water Margin] fame), who killed a tiger with his bare hands after drinking 18 bowls of alcohol.²⁶ Alcohol also served political purposes. In the Han dynasty, for example, the court sent domestically-produced alcohol as tribute to the Xiongnu.²⁷ The Tang dynasty Princess Wencheng (d. 680) married the Tibetan King Songtsän Gampo (d. 649), and controversy still surrounds arguments that she took rice wine brewing technologies with her to Tibet.²⁸

The popularity of alcohol was underscored by literati famous for drinking. Arthur Cooper has argued that, during the Tang, “among specially talented people, drunkenness was universally recognized as a state of perfect, untrammelled receptivity to divine inspiration.”²⁹ Even earlier, in the Jin dynasty (265–420), the Seven Sages of the Bamboo Grove drank wine while socializing, writing poetry, and playing musical instruments. The most famous of them, in terms of alcohol consumption, was the “drunken ghost” (*zui gui*) Liu Ling (221–300), whose love of drinking is immortalized in the poem “In Praise of the Virtue of Wine.”³⁰ Liu famously once shocked visitors who found him naked – he explained that he considered the universe his home, and his house his clothes; he turned the table on his guests by asking what they were doing inside his clothing!³¹ Tao Yuanming (365–427), one of China’s most famous poets, was poverty-stricken yet famed for entertaining guests, no matter how lofty or humble, with alcohol, often made by his own hand.³²

During the Tang dynasty, alcohol and cultural production forged links that have stood to the present, especially through the “god of wine”, Li Bai (701–762). Li boasted that he would gladly trade his prized possessions for wine:

My flower-dappled horse, my furs worth a thousand
 Hand them to the boy in exchange for good wine
 And we'll drown away the woes of ten thousand generations!³³

Li's love of wine and his extraordinarily rich contributions to China's literary canon helped establish the belief that wine could not only "drown away" one's sorrow but it could give impetus and expression to artistic ability. Li's works so often relate to drinking, in fact, that the writer Guo Moruo (1892–1978) calculated that 17% of Li's poems relate to alcohol.³⁴ Li's contemporary Du Fu (712–70) named him one of the "Eight Immortals of the Wine Cup".³⁵ In a poem, Du described Li as capable of "producing 100 poems after drinking a whole dou [10 litres] of wine (*dou jiu shi bai pian*)."³⁶ Du also recounts how, under the influence of alcohol, Li declined an imperial summons, excusing himself as the "god of imbibing." Li's death was even linked with alcohol, as he is alleged to have drowned while drunkenly reaching out from a boat to grab the moon. This view of Li's death provided a high-profile foil to positive alcohol narratives.

Despite the benefits of alcohol consumption outlined above, "excessive" or "reckless" use was scorned. The most negative association with alcohol must be attributed to the last Shang king, Dixin (r. 1075–1046 BCE), and his wife, Daji (d. 1046 BCE). Dixin is credited with having created a "Wine Pool and Meat Forest" upon which canoes floated, around an island on which trees with branches made of meat skewers were planted. As the king and his (often naked) guests lay about the allegedly five square kilometre pool or drifted aimlessly upon it, they simply filled their cups in the pool and reached upwards to pick the roasted meat; on occasion, he was rumoured to have 3000 people crouch by the pool to drink like cows upon command.³⁷ This behaviour has earned Dixin a place in the halls of the most decadent of China's rulers, blamed for the destruction of the Shang dynasty; his name is synonymous with alcohol abuse, extravagance and waste. But Shang alcohol consumption had an even more sinister side to it – the bronze

vessels in which alcohol was popularly contained poisoned it, as the tin in the alloy dissolved in the drink.³⁸ Beyond such dangers, alcohol also came to be popularly associated with the “nine-fold harm,” which included impairment of intellect and morals; predisposition to physical illness; shortening of life span; the decline of sex performance and fertility; passing on of inherited defects; and increased risks of criminality and suicide.³⁹ Long-standing warnings about alcohol consumption were underlined by famous examples ranging from Dixin to the very end of the imperial period in the Qing (1644–1912). During the Kangxi reign (1661–1722), for example, Han Tan, president of the Board of Rites, reputedly drank himself to death. One Qing official, Yu Huai, described drinking parties in Nanjing that went on until guests vomited and passed out on the ground.⁴⁰ Such behaviour was said to harm individuals, destroy families, and risk the very foundations of the state.

Both positive and negative understandings of alcohol consumption led to official efforts to control or prohibit it, although no regime was ever entirely successful in eradicating alcohol. The first ruler to whom prohibition has been attributed is Yu, founder of the Xia dynasty. As the popular story goes, his daughter Yi Di brewed an alcoholic drink, which she then presented to Yu. His enjoyment of it led him to warn, from what many have believed to be the very beginnings of alcohol production, against alcohol and the dangerous over-indulgence it could inspire.⁴¹ Yu’s warning and Dixin’s infamous “Wine Pool and Meat Forest” ensured that by the Zhou dynasty it was widely believed that “overindulgence in food and drink is a sin of such proportions that dynasties could fall on its account.”⁴² Zhou rulers issued edicts prohibiting commoners from drinking wine, only allowing the “ritual” use of wine, a stipulation that left considerable leeway in application of the law. They established an organization to supervise the production and use of alcoholic beverages for the imperial family and for sacrifices to gods or ancestors. During the Qin (221–206 BCE) and Han dynasties, alcohol was alternately restricted and banned. Perhaps the most famous law regarding alcohol was promulgated during the reign of

Wang Mang (9–23), when Premier Xiao He forbade three or more people from gathering to drink “for no reason.”⁴³

Through the latter imperial era, alcohol policies continued to reflect state aims and ambitions. Monopolies were mainstays of the Tang, Song, Yuan, and Qing dynasties. During the Song, debate over prohibition raged through the court even as alcohol tax revenue became more important to it.⁴⁴ Fang Fei has argued that the strictest prohibition in the last millennium was implemented during the fifth year of the Jin dynasty’s Hailingwang reign (1149–1161) as alcohol was strictly forbidden, with the death penalty prescribed for violators.⁴⁵ Yuan rulers subsequently mandated the use of alcohol in sacrifices and then loosened restrictions with a monopoly under which production reached new heights, with large-scale facilities centered in present-day Xinjiang and Taiyuan.⁴⁶ Certain centres became especially famous for their production, including Shaoxing, Zhejiang. The fame of Shaoxing rice wines was truly remarkable, as they commanded high prices and were exported since the Ming dynasty. In the late Qing, it was estimated that there were 2000 wine shops in the area, with annual production reaching 70,000 tons.⁴⁷ Shaoxing wines remain hugely popular to this day. The final years of the imperial period were marked by German construction of beer-making facilities at Qingdao in 1900, a city now internationally famous for its beer. Japanese and Russian breweries were constructed shortly thereafter in the Northeast, now one of the leading beer producing regions in the world.

The collapse of the Qing dynasty in 1912 did not result in markedly different state or societal approaches to alcohol. In 1915, Yuan Shikai’s Beijing government established an alcohol monopoly, and alcohol remained an important revenue source for administrations throughout the warlord era. In June 1927, Chiang Kai-shek’s Republican government apparently modeled its own “Temporary Regulations on State Monopoly Sales of Tobacco and Alcoholic Beverages,” closely on Yuan’s Beijing model.⁴⁸ With the start of the Anti-Japanese War in 1937, taxes on alcohol became an even more important source for much-needed revenue for the

resistance; taxes were raised by 50% and more.⁴⁹ In the 1930s and 1940s, alcohol's significance as a revenue generator was undeniable for the Republican government. Alcohol industries may have declined during the early years of the People's Republic, but since the start of the reform era they have rebounded, perhaps to their greatest extent ever.

Despite widespread belief to the contrary, alcohol has played significant, varied roles in Chinese history. It continues to do so. Alcohol inspired cultural production yet it is alleged to have contributed to the death of one of China's greatest poets. Alcohol played roles in spiritual activities and funded military campaigns. Positive and negative narratives of alcohol consumption derive from Chinese and foreign influences – whether they be Silk Road travels, Yuan monopolies, or the introduction of beer – and they represent the long-term ability of Chinese culture to integrate local and foreign practices.

In recent decades, alcohol's significance within China has attracted increasing recognition, as are China's achievements in alcohol markets, at home and abroad. China is now the largest producer of beer in the world.⁵⁰ A beer from the Northeast, Xuehua (Snow), currently ranks as the number two selling beer in the world; it is 49% owned by the South-African based company SABMiller, demonstrating on-going local-foreign connections in China's alcohol industry. Chinese wines regularly win awards in international competitions, and have been doing so since the Wujiapi brand won a gold medal in Singapore over a hundred years ago in 1873.⁵¹ Annual production of Maotai, one of the most popular Chinese wines, is in the millions of tons and it is now argued to be the most popular alcoholic beverage in the world.⁵² These commercial achievements and a plethora of new publications on the subject all point to the need for deeper understanding of spirits in China and their place in Chinese culture and history.

Notes

- 1 Lo Kuan-chung; C.H. Brewitt-Tayler, transl., *Romance of the Three Kingdoms* (Rutland: Charles E Tuttle Co., 1959), p. 5.
- 2 Gong Li. *Yin jiu shihua [History of Wine Drinking]*(Beijing: Zhongguo da bailiao quanshu chubanshe, 2009), p. 78.
- 3 Xu Xiaomin, "Ganbei through the Ages," *Shanghai Star* (May 29, 2003), accessed at: <http://app1.chinadaily.com.cn/star/2003/0529/cu18-1.html>
- 4 Zhu Ruimei, *Yin jiu qudian [Interesting Quotations of Drinking Alcohol]* (Taipei: Shixueshe chuban gufen youxian gongsi, 2004), p. 88.
- 5 Zhu, *Yin jiu qudian*, p.88.
- 6 Xuan Bingshan, *Minjian yinshi xisu [Popular Food and Drink Customs]*(Beijing: Zhongguo shehui chubanshe, 2006), p. 87.
- 7 Gong, *Yin jiu shihua*, p.85.
- 8 Chang Chiung-fang, tr. Chris Findler, "Two Thousand Years of Tippling," *Taiwan Panorama* (June 7, 2002), accessed at: <http://www.sino.gov.tw/en/print.php?id=200269106072e.txt&table=2>
- 9 Xu Gan Rong and Bao Tong Fa, *Grandiose Survey of Chinese Alcoholic Drinks and Beverages*, accessed at: <http://www.sytu.edu.cn/zhgjiu/umain.htm>
- 10 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 11 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 12 Jiang Hai, *Jiu de gushi [The story of alcohol]* (Jinan: Shandong renmin yinshuachang, 2006), 5.
- 13 Xuan, *Minjian*, p. 87.
- 14 KC Chang, *Food in Chinese Culture: Anthropological and Historical Perspectives* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1977), p. 30.
- 15 Chang, *Food in Chinese Culture*, p.11.
- 16 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*. Jiang Hai dates the popularity of drinking among the masses to the Zhou dynasty. See Jiang, *Jiu de gushi*. p. 6.
- 17 Chang, *Food in Chinese Culture*, p.119.
- 18 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 19 Chang Chiung-fang suggests that the Mongols took this technology to Russia, where beets were substituted for cereals, in the creation of vodka. See Chang, "Two Thousand Years of Tippling."
- 20 Chang, *Food in Chinese Culture*, p. 122.
- 21 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 22 For example, see Jianfei Zhu, *Chinese Spatial Strategies: Imperial Beijing 1420-1911* (London: Routledge Curzon, 2004), p. 217.
- 23 Chang-Hua Wang, William T. Liu, Ming-Yuan Zhang, Elena S. H. Yu, Zheng-Yi Xia, Marilyn Fernandez, Ching-Tung Lung, Chang-Lin Xu, and Guang-Ya Qu, "Alcohol Use, Abuse, and Dependency in Shanghai" in John E. Helzer and Gloria J. Canino, eds. *Alcoholism in North America, Europe, and Asia*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992), p. 264.
- 24 K. Singer. "Drinking Patterns and Alcoholism in the Chinese" in Mac Marshall,

- ed. *Beliefs, Behaviors, and Alcoholic Beverages: A Cross-Cultural Survey* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1979), p. 315.
- 25 Li Zhengping, *Zhongguo jiu wenhua [Chinese wine culture]* (Beijing: Shishi chubanshe, 2006), p. 308.
- 26 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 27 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 28 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 29 Arthur Cooper, *Li Po and Tu Fu: Poems, Selected and Translated* (Harmondsworth, UK: Penguin Books, 1973), p. 25.
- 30 Jiang Hai argues that Liu Ling was the first to be named a “drunken ghost.” Jiang, *Jiu de gushi*, 15.
- 31 Gong, *Yin jiu shihua*, p. 120.
- 32 Zhu, *Yin jiu qudian*, pp. 254-55.
- 33 Cited in Chang, “Two Thousand Years of Tippling.”
- 34 Xu, “Ganbei.”
- 35 The other members are: Cui Zongzhi, He Zhizhang, Jiao Su, Li Jin, Li Shizhi, Su Jin, and Zhang Xu.
- 36 One dou is about 10 litres. Hellen Zhou & Shannon Roy, “New Wine, Old Stories,” *Beijing This Month* (August 1, 2004), accessed at: <http://www.btmbeijing.com/contents/en/btm/2004-08/cover/wine>
- 37 Jiang, *Jiu de gushi*, p. 31.
- 38 Xu, “Ganbei.”
- 39 Xu, “Ganbei.”
- 40 Chang, *Food in Chinese Culture*, p. 278.
- 41 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 42 Chang, *Food in Chinese Culture*, p. 10.
- 43 Fang Fei, “Jin jiu jin du” [Ban Alcohol, Ban Gambling] *Shengjing shibao [Shengjing Times]* (February 10, 1936), p. 5.
- 44 During the Xiaozong reign (r. 1162 to 1189), alcohol taxes were not collected. Feng, “Jin jiu jin du,” p. 5.
- 45 Feng, “Jin jiu jin du,” p. 5.
- 46 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 47 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 48 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 49 Xu and Bao, *Grandiose*.
- 50 <http://www.abc.net.au/news/stories/2008/07/16/2304758.htm>
- 51 In 1876, Wujiapi wine won its first gold medal in Singapore. Pieter Eijkhoff, “Wine in China: Its History and Contemporary Developments,” 136, accessed at: <http://www.eijkhoff.nl/Wine%20in%20China.pdf>
- 52 The May 2008 edition of *China Economic Review, Vin & Spirit*, cites annual sales volume of 520 million 9-litre cases. See http://www.chinaeconomicreview.com/cer/2008_05/Pouring_a_big_one.html

DAOISM AND CHINESE MEDICINE

Ning Wang

加拿大布洛克大学王宁教授的论文《道教和中医药》是基于道家传统和中医健康之间关系的一种信息丰富的研究。其核心是把养“气”或生命元气作为通向健康和长寿的秘诀的道教观点。虽然他对道教的迷信倾向作出了批评，但是他还是列举了中国道教在中医饮食、修炼以及性行为等方面的许多贡献。

Although there have been debates over a number of issues surrounding Daoism – the interpretation of *Daodejing* and *Zhuangzi*, their versions, and which texts of later times can be categorized as Daoism – scholars generally agree that the following ideas, notions and teachings should not be excluded from Daoist philosophy. All things in the universe arise from the formless and ineffable *Dao*, the “Way” of life and law of nature; *Dao* is the creator of heaven and earth, the only substance that is unchanging, eternal, invisible, and thus it cannot be fully described in words. The body of a human being, no more than dust and dirt of the greater whole is, nevertheless, a vessel of *Dao*, the embodiment of *Dao*. Therefore, human beings should not attempt to change the “way” things in the world are arranged; that being said, the natural order and harmony created by *Dao* need to be followed by human beings. Meanwhile, one should free oneself from the conventions of existing culture and society, be unconcerned with all the temporal affairs of politics and business, resign oneself to one’s lot, and live adaptably with nature, in order to acquire real spiritual freedom and achieve total identification with *Dao*. Such notions and teachings are generally considered as the key components of philosophical Daoism, or proto-Daoism, which was founded by Laozi (Lao Tzu) and Zhuangzi

(Chung Tzu) in the fifth and fourth century BCE.¹

For the Chinese public, Daoism exerts its influence primarily in two ways. The first is through religious Daoism (*Daojiao*). The founder of proto-Daoism, Laozi, by no means intended to be a religious leader, or to transform his philosophy into a religious belief. But the natural deity aura of proto-Daoism made its way easily into the Chinese religious traditions. Though the various sects of *Daojiao* emerging in the Eastern Han period (25–220) had their own immediate founders, they all claimed Laozi as their founding figure. Most importantly, they all believed that since Dao is everywhere, so the deities and all kinds of supernatural beings (such as spirits, ghosts, celestial beings) brought about by Dao are also everywhere, attaching themselves to material object – trees, rocks, clouds, lights, land and stoves. Such notions suited the spiritual need of individuals who were deeply concerned about mystical forces and the supernatural world. For the general public in the imperial period, supernatural forces were omnipresent, usually unseen but nonetheless real, and profoundly affected one's life, fortune and fates. Although the Chinese masses might know little about Laozi or Zhuangzi, religious Daoism laid the foundation for Chinese popular religion and facilitated mysticism in Chinese society.

The second way to link Daoism to the Chinese masses is through its concepts of health and life, its teachings in longevity, and the influences of Daoist masters upon traditional Chinese medicine. Based on the notions that a human being is a microcosm of the universe, that the human body is the vessel of Dao, and is thus to be properly taken care of, the founders of Daoist philosophy – Laozi, Zhuangzi and the author(s) of *Guanzi Neiye*² – provided a fair amount of discussion on how to adapt to nature, how to live a healthy life, and how to maintain vital functions of the human body. Laozi said, “For ordering humanity and serving heaven, nothing is as good as being sparing (frugal). For only if you are sparing (frugal) can you, therefore, follow the Way... He who has the Mother (Dao) of the state will last long. This means that the

roots are deep and the stalks are firm, which is the Way of long life and everlasting vision.”³

Zhuangzi advised human beings “to be pure, clean, and mixed with nothing: still, unified, and unchanging; limpid and inactive, moving with the workings of Heaven; this is the way to care for the spirits.” “Just go along with things and let your mind move freely. Resign yourself to what cannot be avoided and nourish what is within you – this is best.”⁴ These teachings have been used by Daoist followers as a philosophical platform to develop a wide spectrum of ideas and norms concerning health, longevity (what Daoists call “immortality”), and thus deeply affected traditional Chinese medicine.

Before we move to the linkage between Daoism and traditional Chinese medicine, it is important to note that what Laozi and Zhuangzi focused on was primarily an outlook on life, a philosophy of life, rather than the techniques of health. They both believed that one should live in a natural way, free from all forms of restraint, convention, or rule, live in a state without any wish, desire, lust, or pursuit of success, fortune or fame; living without worry or struggle is the best way to live life and maintain health.⁵ Only when arriving at the state of being known as *qingjing wuwei* (non-doing or being one with the flow of life) can one achieve *yangqi* (saving one’s vital energy), *yangxin* (resting one’s mind), *yangshen* (nourishing one’s spirit), and *yangxing* (refining one’s soul). The natural result of these cultivations and accomplishments is *yangsheng* or the nourishing life. To Laozi and Zhuangzi, the way one preserves health – conserves energy, stores vigor, nourishes spirit, and builds up physical strength – would not merely lead one to live one’s allotted span of life, but also help the person accomplish spiritual freedom and perfection.⁶

Guanzi Neiye (*Guanzi: Inward Training*), another proto-Daoist text, provides supplementary but concentrated narratives on cultivation of the human body and spiritual strength. It is concerned with the training of the internal energy systems of the human body so as to produce a refined and potent form of the vital

energy (*qi*). It believes that by guiding the energy of the human body, it is possible for the body to become more aligned with the vital energy of the cosmos and in so doing the practitioner of inward training will “attain the Dao.” It also suggests control of human emotions, eliminating desires, shunning external temptations, as well as moderate diet as the way to build vital essence.⁷

An important medical text that is aligned with proto-Daoist teachings is *Huangdi neijing* (*Inner Classic of the Yellow Emperor*), which was originally printed in the Han Dynasty. The text suggests that principles of nature should be closely followed. By doing so, one could achieve longevity without loss of physical and mental faculties. To the author(s), “The men of antiquity understood the Dao. They led their lives in accordance with the rules of *yin* and *yang* (the two opposite but mutually complementary cosmic forces), and know the techniques to access nature. They ate and acted moderately, and no one dissipated strength through unseemly behavior. Thus they preserved their strength and lived out their years.”⁸ By interpreting how the natural effects of diet, lifestyle, emotions, environment, and age lead to diseases, and how to stay in balance and health by understanding the laws of these natural forces, *Huangdi neijing* provides a link that bridges the proto-Daoist principle of nature and traditional Chinese medical theory. So it has been considered the foundational medical text that reveals Lao-Zhuang’s philosophy for an ideal model of life.

Over the centuries, Chinese practitioners have followed in part the Lao-Zhuang teaching paradigm that “a good life is following nature,” that to “prolong life, attain Dao” and have developed both practical and theoretical aspects of a health preservation framework.

Important elements of this health preservation tradition include the following views: human lives are precious and should be preserved by all means; a human being lives through the *qi* (vital energy) of heaven and earth, and thus one’s life rhythm needs to fully match the regular patterns of the seasons; the basic premise of health and longevity practices is to maintain the sufficient

supply of *qi* and *xue* (blood); diseases/excesses through activities in everyday life should be avoided. They discussed, developed and refined various health preservation and longevity regimens, which significantly contribute to the richness of Chinese medical tradition. These regimens include, in general, dietetics, drug therapy, Qi cultivation techniques, methods of meditation and visualization, therapeutic gymnastics, sexual yoga, acupuncture, and massage. The following sections will discuss several aspects of traditional Chinese medicine that are closely related to the teachings of proto-Daoism and the alleged “Daoist arts.”

I. DIETETICS

Daoist attitudes towards the nutritional roles of foods often varied according to the time period being examined and the different schools of Daoist medical teaching. Some early Daoist texts even advocated avoidance of grain consumption. In the *Zhuangzi*, for example, there is a record that an immortal “doesn’t eat the five grains but sucks the wind, and drinks the dew.”⁹ How are we to understand this saying? Some take it literally and superstitiously, but others take it metaphorically. The influence of such sayings upon later Daoists and health practitioners is hard to measure. *Huainanzi* (a Daoist volume of the Han Dynasty) put it that “Those who eat *qi* achieve spirit illumination and are long-lived; those who eat grains have quick minds and are short-lived.”¹⁰ People in Han and Wei-Jin periods particularly liked to talk about *bigu shiqi* (rejection of grains and absorption of *qi*), which mainly dealt with the techniques of eliminating five grains (rice, millet, barley, wheat and beans) and other foodstuffs from the diet and replacing them with *qi* cultivation and herb substances.

Some other Daoists believed that cooking things was a form of processing and decay: meat decomposes in the intestines, grains rots in the stomach, and digestion is nothing but a form of decay that causes death. Therefore, they preferred to take herbal plants that stayed whole and depended on the intake of pure, cosmic

qi.¹¹ However, we should not take these teachings literally, but as metaphors for healthy living. Many more Daoist practitioners believe that the consumption of foods is a natural process that serves to replenish and maintain the vital force of life; the right kinds of food could be used for prevention and cure of diseases. The Chinese in the post-Tang period preferred well-formulated and moderate diets, with the notion that “dietetics helps more than medicine.” However, the folk belief that “while people eat five grains, how can they avoid illness?” remained entrenched for centuries. In case of some sickness, healers might suggest patients stop meals for one or more days, in order to help clean inner orbs (*zangfu*), and to expel impure gross *qi* (*zuoqi*).

Chinese healers generally agree that the selective consumption of certain foods best facilitate absorption of nutritional “heavenly blessing,” and is thus foundational for longevity. Famous texts such as *Qianjin yifang* (*Recipes Worth a Thousand Gold Pieces*), *Shiliao bencao* (*Materia Medica for Foodstuffs*) and *Lao lao xuannian* all expressed a preference for proper diets. *Qianjin yifang* puts it that “food can dispel harmful influences, support the internal organs, refresh the spirit and replenish the *qi* and blood.” It also suggests that to cure a disease, try first dietetics; if dietetics does not help, one can consider pharmaceutical treatment.¹² Even from a prophylactic perspective, eating the right kinds of foods is more desirable than taking medicine to prevent disease. Furthermore, Chinese healers and therapists tend to believe that human organs become weaker due not only to lack of certain nutrition but also to a loss of equilibrium between *yin* and *yang*, the two crucial forces in the body, and that by selective consumption of either yin foods (which have a calming and cooling effect) or yang foods (which have an energy inducing, valor increasing effect), the yin-yang balance can be maintained or regained, vigor restored, and disease prevented.

Along these lines Chinese healers have gained a rich clinical and experimental experience with countless foodstuffs, and successfully established a regimen of nutritional health care, or nutritional therapy in dealing with physical weakness, chronic diseases and

aging.

Some dietary regimens seem complicated and materials are hard to come by. For instance, there is a fancy recipe called Yangchun Baixue Gao (Jelly of Spring Snow) consisting of Indian poria cocos, euryalis seed, yamaimo root, lotus seed, mixed with rice, glutinous rice, and sugar to make a small jelly-like cake that is taken by elderly or young women to enhance the vitality of spleen and kidney systems.

But most foodstuffs are ordinary and thus easily accessible to the public. As Chinese therapists focused more on improving the overall function of the human body than on curing disease, they suggested absorption of all the “heavenly essence” embodied in various foods. Therefore, Chinese dietetic regimens include a wide spectrum of materials from various plants and vegetables to insects and animals. Green tea and green bean are suggested to resist heat stroke; black bean and red bean make porridge to strengthen kidney essence for winter; mutton resists cold; dates help nourish blood, especially beneficial to women.¹³

Various foodstuffs are carefully categorized according to their qualities of “cold, cool, warm and hot,” which, when applied properly, can help patients to strengthen the organs, modify the existing imbalance of yin and yang in the body, improve the immune system and self-healing ability, and overcome various diseases or inclinations to certain diseases. For instance, if there is a heat syndrome (dry mouth, acne, deep yellow urine, etc), then cooling foods will be suggested, such as watermelon, mulberry, banana, pear and mushroom. If a cold syndrome is shown (cool extremities, fear of cold temperature, diarrhea after eating cold foods), then warm foods are recommended, such as ginger, garlic, green onions, deer meat and walnuts. Varying elements – such as people’s age, physical constitution and mental states, and the change of seasons – are considered when diets are suggested. In general, foods eaten in spring should be stimulating and neutral; in summer, people should eat something that has calming and cooling effects; in fall, foods to be eaten should serve to retain fluid;

in winter one should eat food that stimulates and warms the body. As a general rule, seniors are discouraged from eating crabs and persimmon (considered cold in nature) during winter, children and pregnant women should avoid eating turtles in the spring, and young men should avoid eating deer meat in summer. If the lung is affected and coughing occurs, white pears, lily bulbs and ginkgo seeds are of good help. If the heart and the spleen system are deficient, cinnamon, lentil and lychee are suggested. Such dietetic regimens are mostly not based upon pharmacological studies, but on trial and error and prove rather helpful.

2. DRUG THERAPY

Drug therapy, especially herbal therapy, has been considered the primary therapeutic means in the Chinese medical tradition. Since all things are created by *Dao*, human beings, wild species and various natural products of the world are all seen as being interrelated and mutually complementary. Many different natural products are considered to have medicinal effects for human beings. Hence Chinese drug therapy is a natural, though selective and scrupulous, extension of dietetics.

Ancient Chinese healers experimented on wide ranges of plants, herbs, insects, animals, and minerals to make therapeutic drugs, intending to cure disease, to improve vital function of the body and to facilitate longevity. So far, more than 11,000 herbs, 1,500 animals and insects, and 80 minerals have been incorporated into the Chinese pharmacopoeia, although the majority are rarely used. Approximately 530 are in common use today.¹⁴

Normally, Chinese drug prescriptions come in the form of herbal compounds, made up of five, ten, or more ingredients (in some cases, combined with animal and mineral products), to clear heat, remove toxicity, harmonize organs, and help restore the microcosmic imbalance of the body. For example, the common cold is best treated with Cold Effective Pills (*Ganmao ling wan*), based on *isatis root* (banlangen), *evodia* (plant extract), chrysanthemum

flowers, *vitex* (chaste berry), lanicer flowers, and menthol crystals. It helps the immune system, neutralizes and eliminates the invading wind pathogens, relieves acute flare-ups, and reduces fever. There are also Asthma Relief Pills (Pingchuan wan), containing armeniaca, codonopsis root, licorice, eleagnus fruit, ficus leaf, citrus peel and cordyceps fungus, in order to support lungs and kidneys, break up phlegm, and stop coughs.¹⁵

Chinese physicians and healers are conscientious about the usage of drugs. Around the year 500, a renowned Daoist thinker and physician Tao Hongjing compiled *Shennong bencaojing jizhu* (*Shengnong's Materia Medica & Its Full Annotation*), the first known collected pharmacology in Chinese history. In this work Tao listed 730 drugs and classified them into seven categories: plant, insect & animal, fruit, vegetable, grain, mineral, and those without actual usage. Most drugs he identified have such alleged effects as replenishing *qi*, making the body lighter, preventing aging, prolonging life and even forestalling hunger. Such drugs, therefore, can be taken for a long period of time because they show no toxicity. Tao also specified some other drugs that could be used for attacking diseases, but are highly toxic, and should not be taken over an extended period of time.¹⁶ Similar to Tao Hongjing, other practitioners such as staunch Daoist herbalist Sun Simiao realized that the nature of many medicinal drugs is hard and violent, thus could easily harm human bodies if applied carelessly in minor cases.¹⁷ In such classics as *Bencao Gangmu* and *Shennong Bencao Jing*, authors provided useful ideas about what kinds of herbs are too powerful to be taken often.¹⁸ While Chinese drug therapy is well developed, prescription and suggestion were cautious and restrained.

It is noteworthy that based on the notion that different forms of life, species and natural products in the world are interrelated and mutually complementary, Chinese pharmacologists and physicians held that the human body can benefit from nutrition taken from specific parts of animal organs and plants, which have particular therapeutic effects on corresponding parts of human body. Herbal

soups made of certain tree roots are considered to be effective in dealing with sores in legs and feet; some kinds of tree branches used in making soup provide cure for arm numbness; walnuts help with functioning of the human brain, as the walnut kernel is similar to the shape of the human brain. Along this line, animal parts and insects were widely used for medicinal purposes: consumption of sheep lung nourishes the human lung, eating fish eye moisturizes the human eye; horn of buffalo is for strengthening human bone, and deer kidney is for improving human kidney.¹⁹ Certainly many animal-based prescriptions were not grounded in such a “matching consideration” but they were allegedly able to harmonize the function of human organs: bovines’ pancreases are used for dealing with diabetes, pig heart for treating insomnia, bear’s gall for relieving inflammation and internal heat, cricket (after proper processing) for improving the function of the human bladder. Such therapeutic wisdoms have spread into the public either in popular treatises or through oral transmission for generations, and in many cases have turned out to be surprisingly effective.

Another form of drug-making endeavor turned out to be problematic and even lethal – the effort to make elixirs/pills of immortality. Chinese alchemists and physicians in the pre-modern period displayed great enthusiasm in making immortality pills. Daoist and alchemist Ge Hong (283–363), for instance, said, “Through breathing exercise and gymnastics, by taking herbs and plant medicines, you may extend your years, but you will not avoid death in the end. Only taking the divine elixir will give you long life without end and allow you to live as long as heaven and earth.”²⁰ Ancient Chinese, especially those living before the Song Dynasty, surmised that gold and jade can last forever just because they absorb the essence of heaven and the earth, and that synthetic “gold,” which is made from the combination of a variety of heavenly essences (through roasting or burning), has the same effect. If human beings ingested such synthetic “gold” (*Jindan*), immortality could likely be achieved. This belief prompted Daoist priests and alchemists to experiment on a wide range of materials to make

immortality pills.

From the Han dynasty to the Tang dynasty, numerous Chinese physicians and herbalists were at the same time the alchemists; some alchemists were invited to live in the imperial court and made pills for emperors and their families. The alchemical efforts involved materials such as cinnabar-mercuric sulfide, mica, ruddle, realgar, and sulphur. The ganoderma mushroom (*lingzhi*), bezoar, and ginseng root were also considered to have supernatural influences on health and longevity, and were thus introduced by Daoists to make immortality pills, according to various recipes.

It is undeniable that alchemy was indispensable for the birth of modern inorganic chemistry. However, products in the early stage of experiment were often poisonous and lethal. Deaths from taking the pills were not uncommon. It is said that five of twenty-one emperors of the Tang Dynasty died of taking “golden pills.”²¹

3. QI CULTIVATION

The term *qi* has multiple meanings in the context of Chinese philosophy and medical culture: it refers to the air (breath) people inhale and exhale, and is also interpreted as the “vital energy” or universal medium, the central force that sustains both the human body and the cosmos. To Daoist philosophers, the *qi*, invisible but far from mythical, is a streaming, penetrating and expanding energy/force that fills all, the foundation of all. As the human body is considered a micro universe with vital energy *qi* traversing and circulating, its functioning, similar to that of the macro universe, simply could not be sustained without *qi*. *Zhuangzi* held that “Man’s life is a coming-together of breath (*qi*). If it comes together, there is life; if it scatters, there is death.”²²

Qi is said to function in the following way: it circulates in the conduit system (meridians) of the human body together with *xue* (blood and body fluids), supplies the various organs, protects and sustains the inner sphere of the body, and makes the body vigorous. If the *qi* gets stuck at some point(s), acupuncture, cupping, taking

drugs or other therapeutic means need to be used to facilitate the qi circulation.

To many Chinese, the most important way to facilitate qi circulation is the controlled cultivation of qi through breathing exercise, so called “expelling the old and taking in the new” (*tugu naxin*), to consciously and rhythmically inhale refined, vital qi while exhaling impure gross qi, and to direct qi to various inner orbs, in order for inner orbs to function well. This is the basic rationale for how various Qigong movements work. A Daoist text *Baopuzi* held that “Human beings live in qi, and qi occupies stations in human beings...Whoever can guide the qi will nourish his body on the inside and protect himself against harmful influences on the outside.”²³

Another role of qi exercise is to dissolve/repel excessive emotions. Ancient Chinese held that human beings generate seven different emotions – joy, anger, sadness, brooding, sorrow, fear and shock – as well as various human desires. These are internal factors that cause ailments, simply because when one is preoccupied by any of these emotions/desires, his/her vital energy (qi) and body fluids (xue) will not circulate smoothly throughout the body, which will likely lead to physical unfitness, malfunction, and even disease. According to a well-received notion, for instance, anger harms the liver orb, excessive joy harms the heart orb, sadness harms the lung orb, brooding harms the spleen, and fear harms the kidney. *Huangdi neijing* says, “brooding, fear, joy and anger ... these elements would lead to exhaustion of the five orbs, and the lack of xue and qi,” and eventually lead to the disorder of yin and yang.²⁴

The notion that emotions and desires are the origins of health problems had philosophical roots in Laozi. He considered it important to maintain one’s vital energy or life force. This is apparent in his teaching of *wu-wei* (not acting) “no desire,” and “no competition,” which are natural ways to “nourish the spirit and conserve qi.”²⁵ It is the best way to live a life, and to achieve a high degree of alignment to the cosmos.

Later Daoists such as Zhang Daoling of the Han period also talked about *yangqi* and advocated avoiding excessive emotions.

However, their points on *yangqi* were not the same as that of Laozi, but focused on performing breathing exercise to discipline one's temperament and foster moral character. To the Han and post-Han Daoists, qi cultivation, even aiming to achieve good health and longevity, must be accompanied with an ethical program – confession of wrong doing and the cultivation of good moral behavior. As health was considered the result of moral purity and the reward from heaven, illness was connected with one's moral failure, inappropriate conduct and even one's ancestors' bad deeds; therefore, healing was believed possible only through the confession of wrong doing and penance.²⁶ We can see that Daoists, though having varying focuses, placed great emphasis on the mind and conflicted emotions as a cause of disease; therefore, qi cultivation is not merely a physical revitalization but also spiritual purification and regeneration. Accordingly, various qi cultivation curricula, either by redirecting qi to orbs or by suppressing desires, would help harmonize physical function, pacify the mind and build spiritual strength, and consequently lead to the elimination of the roots of diseases.

Breathing exercises also turn out to be a feasible healing method for various health problems. Qigong (qi exercise) practitioners particularly seek to use qi to deal with chronic diseases, such as arthritis, asthma, hemiplegia and diabetes. Although the notion of qi cultivation can be traced as far back as the 4th century, it was not until the 20th century that the craze for qigong prevailed. Especially since the late 1970s, qigong schools have flourished across the People's Republic. Hexiang Zhuang (Crane Pattern), Dayan Gong (Wild Goose Gong) and Menhua Zhuang (Plum Blossom Pattern) are among the most popular qigong sects. Practitioners undertake different activities, including various exercises of absorbing, guiding and circulating qi throughout the body, receiving the outer qi emitted by the qigong masters, performing gymnastics, practicing quiet meditation and visualization, or engaging in voluntary or involuntary trance-like states of body movement. Many qigong practitioners claim to have attained a state of strength and vigor,

whereas others view such practices with suspicion.

In the 1980s, Chinese scientists found that qi resembled infrared rays, electron-magnetic waves, static electricity, magnetism or the flow of tiny subatomic particles. This discovery proved that the concept of qi does have a materialistic basis, and it lent a degree of support to the qigong movement.

4. SEXUAL CULTIVATION—ARTS OF THE BEDCHAMBER

Finally, we turn to what were known as “arts of the bedchamber.” They sought to redress the often contradictory and confusing notions about sexuality that existed in pre-modern China. The masses tended to emphasize sex as the means of reproduction and, in general, promoted strict control of sexual desire and engagement (*jieyu*). Some Daoist schools understood sexuality as the most important way of integrating yin and yang, and thus tried to connect sexual energy with flowing *qi* in order to attain Dao. Some practitioners of “Daoist arts (*Daoshu*),” however, advocated that sex as a crucial way to enhance the physical strength and vitality of men, and thus developed elaborate teachings about sexual cultivation.

A key point to understanding sexual cultivation is the term *jing*. Jing at a metaphysical level refers to the “essence,” the source of vitality of the human body. Transformed from qi, jing is one of the most important forces for life sustenance and physical growth. At a physical level, it refers to the sexual and reproductive fluids of both sexes, thus representing the origin of life. From both perspectives and in both forms, jing has been considered limited, extremely precious and, like qi, it must be carefully stored and conserved. Deficiency of jing causes physical weakness and disease (whenever jing is lost, the brain and the bones of body become weakened, and health problems such as dizziness, susceptibility to infections, tuberculosis, anemia and kidney failure occur), and depletion of jing leads to death. Although jing can be rebuilt and replenished from absorbing qi and taking dietary nutrition, many Chinese are led to believe that jing must be carefully preserved, that the maintenance

of jing requires strict control of sexual desire and regularization of sexual encounter, and that excessive sex drains jing and is thus physically harmful. Texts such as *Hanshu* and *Lushi chunqiu* express ideas like “lust injures life” and “those who abandon themselves to sexual pleasure... will fall ill and harm their lives.”²⁷ Novels in the Ming and Qing period, such as *Jin Ping Mei (The Plum in the Golden Vase)* and *Rou Pu Tuan (Playing Mat of the Flesh)*, told numerous stories of playboys that died of debauched lives due to jing exhaustion.

For other Daoist therapists, however, the pursuit of good health and longevity does not demand celibacy or avoidance of sexual activities. Rather they see sexual intercourse as achieving the union of yin and yang, projection and reception, male and female. Such exchange of the cosmic polarities is the foundation of the universe as well as the foundation of the birth of life or reproduction of the human species. On a practical level, sex is considered one of the most important ways to facilitate the flow of qi and to strengthen the sexual energy of both men and women; therefore, one can enhance one’s vitality and attain longevity by cultivating proper sexual techniques. This became known as the arts of the bedchamber (*fangzhong shu* or *fangshi yangsheng*).

Other Daoists believed that sexual techniques could help achieve health benefits such as improving eyesight and hearing, and facilitating digestion. However, it is questionable if those who have achieved good health truly benefit from these sex practices, and there is no evidence to show “converting the sexual fluids into nourishing substance” was ever accomplished. From a philosophical perspective, many of these “arts of the bedchamber” seem at odds with the “living with nature” or “going along with the flow of nature” paradigm advocated by Laozi and Zhuangzi.

CONCLUSION

It is recognized that the Daoist emphasis on human-nature relations and the principles of nature have had an impact upon traditional

Chinese medicine. Following Laozi and Zhuangzi, who considered the human body as the residence of Dao and advocated the human being's alignment with nature, Daoists of different schools and Chinese healers invented a wide spectrum of therapeutic regimens in order to keep the human body healthy and vigorous, to preserve its harmonious function, and to fend off real or potentially harmful influence. The Daoist themes of harmony between humans and nature, interrelations among human, wild species and natural products, as well as mental purification and spirit illumination, are all reflected in the principles of dietetics, drug therapy and qi cultivation. Many Chinese therapists, herbalists, and authors of medical texts claimed Daoist norms in establishing their medical framework. When prescribing treatment – dietetics, drug therapy, qi cultivation, or therapeutic gymnastics – they would prefer to connect their formula to Laozi, Zhuangzi and *Huangdi Neijing*. They are concerned with mental purification and spiritual nourishment, and considered daily habits and activities to be undertaken in a rhythm matching the patterns of nature. Medical texts not only aimed at dealing with disease, but also provided general rules for a good life, including the regulation of clothing, food, sleep, hygiene, activity and movement, and various prohibitions.

Needless to say, however, the flow of Chinese medicine did not always manifest Daoist influence. According to Laozi, the best way to live one's life is to align with nature, passively adapt to nature, follow the rhythm of nature, and harmonize daily routine. These ideas unquestionably provided philosophical guidelines for Chinese medicine and health practice. However, the search for elixirs by alchemists led to experimentation on a wide variety of medicinal products; they actually went far away from what Laozi and Zhuangzi taught about health and life.

It is also understandable that not all the Chinese medical heritage reflects Daoist influence. Confucian norms, principles and terminology, too, exist in the Chinese medical tradition. The ideas that the heart is ruler of the body, that the functions of the human body are a counterpart of the administration of the state, and that

the principle herb in a concoction is “emperor” and thus needs to be assisted and reinforced by a number of minor herbs to make a perfect drug all reflect the norms of Confucianism.

Notes

- 1 The figure of Laozi (Lao Tzu) is said to have lived in the 6th -5th century BCE and Zhuangzi (Chuang Tzu) in the 4th century BCE. Recent scholarship tends to regard Laozi as a legendary figure though there is some evidence for seeing Laozi as an older contemporary of Kongzi (Confucius 551–479 BCE). Zhuangzi is regarded as an historical person.
- 2 The *Guanzi Neiye* (c. 300 BCE) is a Chinese text from the Jixia Academy at Linzi that contains a section on “Inner Cultivation” that was important for Daoist thought and that influenced Chinese medicine. See the *Guanzi jiaozheng* (edited version of the *Guanzi*), translated with annotation by Yin Zhizhang and Dai Wang (Taipei: Shijie shuju, 1962). See also Harold Roth, *Original Tao: Inward Training and Foundations of Chinese Mysticism* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999). It contains excerpts from the *Guanzi Neiye*.
- 3 *Lao-tzu, Te-Tao Ching*, translated with an introduction and commentary by Robert Henricks (New York: Ballantine Books, 1989), pp. 140, 168. See also Wing-tsit Chan, *The Way of Lao Tzu* (Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill, 1963), p. 205.
- 4 Chuang-tzu, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu* translated by Burton Watson (New York: Columbia University Press, 1968), chapter 15, p. 169, chapter 4, p. 61.
- 5 See Lao-tzu, *Te-Tao Ching, op.cit.*, Chapters 8, 16, 19, 44, 46, 55; Chuang Tzu, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu, op.cit.* Chapters “Discussion on Making All Things Equal,” “The Master of Nourishing Life,” “The Great Master,” “Understanding Life.”
- 6 Lao-Zhuang’s ideas were echoed by later Daoists. For instance, the Tang dynasty’s Sima Chengzhen believed that health practices are themselves the preliminaries for the attainment and realization of the Dao. See Ute Engelhardt, “Longevity Techniques and Chinese Medicine,” in Livia Kohn (ed.), *Daoism Handbook* (Leiden & Boston: Brill, 2000), p. 80.
- 7 Guanzi, et al., *Guanzi jiaozheng (edited version of Guanzi)* translated with annotation by Yin Zhizhang and Dai Wang (Taipei: Shijie shuju, 1962), pp. 269-272.
- 8 *Huangdi Neijing (Inner Classic of the Yellow Emperor)*, translated, with annotation by Yao Chunpeng (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2009), p. 3.
- 9 Chuang-tsu, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu*, chapter 1, p. 33.
- 10 Liu An, et. al., *Huai nanzi neipian quanzhu quanyi (Full Translation of Huai*

- nanzì) translated, with an introduction and commentary by Xu Kuangyi (Guiyang: Guizhou renmin chubanshe, 1993) p. 371.
- 11 Livia Kohn, *Health and Long Life: The Chinese Way* (Cambridge, MA : Three Pines Press, 2005) p. 146. Sun Simiao clearly shows his inclination in taking herbal plants such as *lingzhi* and *tianmendong* to sustain life and to achieve immortality. See Sun Simiao, *Qian jin yi fang jiao zhu* (*Recipes Worth a Thousand Gold Pieces*) translated with an introduction and commentary by Zhu Bangxian (Shanghai: Sanghai guji chubanshe, 1999), pp. 42-43.
 - 12 Sun Simiao, *Qian jin yi fang jiao zhu*, pp. 368-9.
 - 13 See Meng Xi, *Shiliao bencao* (Renmin: Weisheng Chubanshe, 1984), Chapter 3.
 - 14 Meng Xi, *Shiliao bencao*, Chapter 3.
 - 15 Livia Kohn, *Health and Long Life*, pp. 149, 156.
 - 16 Engelhardt, “Longevity Techniques and Chinese Medicine,” in Livia Kohn (ed.), *Daoism Handbook*, p. 78.
 - 17 Sun Simiao, *Qian jin yi fang jiao zhu*, Chapter 26.
 - 18 See, for instance, Li Shizhen, *Bencao gangmu*, p. 44-45.
 - 19 Sun Simiao, *Qian jin yi fang jiao zhu*, pp. 99-100. The notion of interconnection between humans and animals is also manifested in the Wu Qin Xi, the “Five Animals’ Exercises” authored by Hua Tuo of the late Han period. Based upon his observation of animals and their special attributes, Hua Tuo suggested that human beings pattern upon the physical movements of tiger, deer, bear, ape and birds, such as “bear hanging” and “bird stretching,” therapeutic gymnastics performed in order to keep the body healthy and vigorous.
 - 20 Ge Hong, *Bao pu zi nei pian quan yi*, 92. While some Daoists understand immortality as endless physical life, the more common Daoist understanding is that virtue or goodness is immortal.
 - 21 www.stnn.cc 2008-12-23.
 - 22 Chuang-zsu, *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu*, Chapter 22; Watson, 235.
 - 23 Ge Hong, *Bao pu zi nei pian quan yi* (*Book of the Master of Simplicity*), translated by Gu Jiu (Guiyang: Guizhou renmin chubanshe, 1995) p. 147.
 - 24 *Huangdi neijing*, pp. 190, 226.
 - 25 Lao-tzu, *Te-Tao Ching*, Chapters, 8, 16, 44, 46, 57.
 - 26 Engelhardt, “Longevity Techniques and Chinese Medicine,” in Livia Kohn (ed.), *Daoism Handbook*, p. 76.
 - 27 Ban Gu, *Hanshu* (*The Book of Han*) (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1962) p. 1779. See also Engelhardt, “Longevity Techniques and Chinese Medicine,” in Livia Kohn (ed.), *Daoism Handbook* p. 102.

“EVIL MONKS?” BUDDHISM ALONG THE SILK ROAD

Whalen Lai

美国加州大学戴维斯分校黎惠伦教授的论文《邪恶的僧侣？丝绸之路的佛教》探讨了一个南北朝时期鲜为人知的僧伽家族（450-650）的故事。这是一个被德国社会学家马克思·韦伯称作“庙宇资本主义”的历险行为。但在这里，它用自己独特的佛教事例，把家庭（和刑满释放犯）和僧伽/庙宇的领地联系起来。在这一背景下，它给人们带来“邪恶僧侣”的观念，因为这些僧侣为了物质利益抛弃了他们的真正使命，不过黎教授对中国佛教史上的这一阶段的描绘为我们提供了更加错综复杂的画卷。

I. INTRODUCTION

In *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*, Max Weber, the German sociologist, presented the case of how, as an unintended consequence, capitalism in Western Europe arose out of the work ethic of Protestant Christians, especially the Puritans. These inner-worldly ascetics worked hard and, in avoiding frivolous expenditures, ended up reinvesting their earnings in their business as capital for further growth. But Weber also noted as a precedent, the case of monastic capitalism. This resulted from monks leading an ascetic life, embracing work as part of their spiritual training as in the case of Benedictine order, thus fostering a wine business. A Chinese parallel has also been noted and studied. It is the story of Buddhist monasteries that prospered materially and contributed much to the economy of medieval China.

Manuscripts discovered in the early twentieth century in the caves of Dunhuang in northwest China, often written on the backside

of copied *sutras* or Buddhist texts, have yielded samples of signed contracts made between temples and their serfs. That such a temple manorial system survived in Dunhuang during the T'ang dynasty (618–917) suggests, at first, a Silk Road Buddhist innovation that flowed from West to East. But closer scrutiny shows that it was a Buddhist innovation started in the Central Plains during the Northern Wei dynasty (386–534), which then spread westward to Dunhuang where these T'ang documents happened to survive.

The “temple manor” system is traceable back to T'an-yao (c. 430–480). He remained courageous during a time of persecution under Emperor T'ai-wu (446–52). After the persecution ended T'an-yao petitioned the new Emperor Wen-ch'eng in 460 to set up “Sangha households.” It was part of his concerted program to revive the Three Jewels: the Dharma (Teaching), the Buddha, and the Sangha (community). Translations of new sutras helped to replenish the Dharma; producing more Buddha images helped to glorify the Buddha. Sangha households were a means to enlarge the Sangha. This involves farming families who promised to pay a fixed amount of grain to the Sangha (monastery). As household members to the monk family, the grain paid to the monastery was used to feed the poor farmers, especially during times of famine. Any remaining grains were held as revenue of the monastery. It was a system that was immensely successful.¹

The “temple-manor” or “Sangha-household” experiment began during a time when there was a complex two-way traffic between Dunhuang to the West, Liang-chou on the northwestern border, and the Central Plain of China to the East. It was based on Buddhist precepts, especially those monastic and lay precepts for moral conduct and the virtuous life. It began as a new and innovative set-up with little or no precedent. It occurred during the transition from a nomadic economy to a sedentary agrarian economy; from a cult of relics and holy men to a culture of temples and the written word. Looking at the Sangha-household or manorial capitalism phenomenon will allow us to better appreciate the multi-cultural nuances too easily lost in overly broad East/West comparisons.

As we will see, the allegations against the monks and how evil they had become arises after a century (460–560) of successful practice of this new manorial capitalism. In noting how this complaint came first from within the Sangha, we will uncover a Weberian irony. The complaint is not directed at monks corrupted by wealth. It is about how ascetic monks pledged to a life of poverty and chastity could somehow generate material circumstances seemingly so very contrary to their intentions. The Sangha or the “community of monks” became well endowed. The poor monk who daily went about with his begging bowl was now, to all appearances, living rather comfortably. He is no longer materially or literally poor.

The classic example from Buddhist sutras of the “poor in spirit” is the lay Bodhisattva Vimalakirti, but he is not a farmer but rather a merchant of Vaisali (an Indian trade city). This worldly saint outwardly lives in clover with his wife and children. For he knows that “true poverty” is not physical but that being “poor in spirit” is to have a mind unblemished by dualities. His name, Vimalakirti, means the untainted one. The story of how poor monks became highly productive citizens – who sometimes did get too wealthy and worldly for their own good – will be retold below and put into a cultural context quite specifiable in terms of time and space along the whole extent of the Silk Road.

II. A DETOUR BACK TO THE BEGINNINGS OF BUDDHISM

But before we turn to that story, we need to go back to India in the 5th century BCE and the remarkable figure of Siddhartha Gautama. The story goes like this: raised as a prince, the young Siddhartha was shielded by his parents from the suffering of the world. But one day outside the palace grounds, he came upon a man diseased and ill, then upon one old and wrinkled, and finally upon a funeral procession of one who had died. He also saw a wandering ascetic or holy man. These events left the young prince badly shaken because he was not aware of the suffering that there was in the world. These

are known in legend as “the four passing sights.”

Siddhartha was so shaken by these events that he determined to abandon his princely estate and to follow the way of the ascetic, or wandering holy man. He thus abandoned his wife and new-born child, left the palace, and determined to find an answer to life’s suffering. After several years of practicing the difficult austerities of the ascetic, he abandoned that path and finally resolved to remain seated in meditation under a *bodhi* tree until he either died or gained an answer to his question concerning suffering. After a night of meditation, Siddhartha gained his long-sought insight, his enlightenment. He became the “Awakened One,” the Buddha. He woke up to the truth of life.

He then journeyed from Bodh Gaya where he had achieved Enlightenment to Sarnath, near Varanasi/Benares, the holiest city of Hindu India, where he gave his famous first sermon. Here he articulated the “Four Noble Truths.” The first noble truth is: Life is *dukkha*. The term *dukkha* is often translated as “suffering,” but the term is richer. It speaks of the unhappiness, the deep dislocation that pervades life. It leads to the second noble truth: the source of *dukkha* is *tanha*. The term *tanha* is translated as “craving desire” and points to the way in which human beings are attached to things. The third noble truth is that there is a way to overcome *tanha*. And that way is the fourth noble truth, the *Eight Fold Path*: Right Views, Right Intention, Right Speech, Right Action, Right Livelihood, Right Effort, Right Mindfulness and Right Concentration. It is this way that can lead to the overcoming of *tanha* and to attaining *nirvana* and overcoming suffering. His is the Middle Way – between the extremes of indulgence (Siddhartha’s princely life) and of excessive discipline (the ascetic way) – and it is the Path that the Buddha taught for the remaining fifty years of his life.

Later Buddhist *sutras* or sacred writings began to appear. They came to constitute a body of teaching that revolved around the Four Noble Truths. The practice of the Buddhist Way was now elaborated and encapsulated in these many, many sutras. They would become touchstones for those practicing a Way that

led beyond life's suffering. Through the Middle Way, one could overcome attachments and come to an enlightening insight that could transform one's life.

The fortunes of Buddhism were greatly enhanced when the great Indian ruler Ashoka (304–232 BCE) converted to Buddhism. It began to move beyond India: south into Sri Lanka and northwest into Central Asia. By the first century of the common era, the Buddhist teaching had made its way from Central Asia along the Silk Road into China. It was carried by traders and traveling monks who spoke of the Awakened One and his message. Though initially puzzled by this teaching that made such little notice of family commitments, Buddhist teaching began to make inroads into Chinese life and culture.

Becoming a Buddhist meant taking refuge in the Three Jewels: the Buddha, the Dharma (teaching), and the Sangha (the community). Over the coming centuries the situation of Buddhism would rise and fall depending upon whether or not Buddhists were in or out of favor with the ruling emperors of China.

III. MAHAYANA PRECEPTS AND THE AGE OF TRUE/ SEMBLENCE/DEGENERATE DHARMA

The kind of Buddhism that flourished in China would belong to the Mahayana (Great Raft) tradition. It eventually affirmed that all sentient beings possessed a Buddha nature and that all could achieve enlightenment; it tended towards universalism. It was deeply shaped by the moral precepts and teachings concerning the *Bodhisattva*, one who vows to strive for the enlightenment of all sentient beings. The Bodhisattvic ethical teachings came to China in the *Bodhisattva Sila Sutra* (or *Praktimoksa*), the *Upasaka Sila Sutra*, and a third text compiled in China known as *Brahma Net Sutra*. These texts taught the moral code and virtues that guided those who followed the Buddhist Way; they included 10 major precepts and 48 secondary precepts. The 10 major precepts include prohibitions against killing, stealing, lying or false speech, alcohol,

stinginess & abuse, anger and resentment, and sexual misconduct. The 48 minor codes include care of the sick, slander, starting wildfires, disrespecting teachers and friends, and handling money. Given these codes and teachings, one wonders how economic inequities could creep into the life of Buddhism in China. But isn't this situation a familiar one in the Christian West? There too the Church came to be well endowed while the poor could be left unfed.

That familiar situation led the *Upasaka Sila Sutra*, a text of moral guidance, to include teaching concerning a merit producing action known as the "field of poverty" – it was a donation to be used to aid the poor. This in turn inspired a later (517–520) Chinese text called the *Hsiang-fa chueh-i ching* (Sutra to Resolve Doubts in the Age of the Semblance Dharma), or the Sutra "To Aid the Widowed and the Orphaned." This text renamed the "field of poverty" the "(merit) field of compassion." Here, assistance to the materially poor became an obligation and an expression of Buddhist compassion.

The other development that stood behind the emergence of the Sangha-households was the question of the times in which people lived. Was this the age of true dharma, or of the semblance of dharma, or of degenerate dharma? There was an old tradition within Buddhism that spoke of a time when the true dharma – the teaching of the Buddha – would begin to be corrupted and then degenerate. Was this now?

More than a century after the Sangha-households had been initiated by T'an-yao, Hsin-hsing (540–594) taught that China had entered the age of degenerate dharma. He had suffered persecution in 574 when the Northern dynasty again persecuted Buddhists. Yet rather than urging, as did some of his contemporaries, that the moral code of the *Bodhisattva Sila* be relaxed, Hsin-hsing urged the redoubling of effort and practice. These efforts would be based on the recognition of the Buddhahood inherent in all and expressed in charitable work. In urging the pious to donate non-stop to the welfare of all, Hsin-hsing helped to create what in the Three Stages Sect he founded would be known as the "Inexhaustible Treasure

(merit-store).”

While the earlier *Upasaka Sila Sutra* did not tie its program of charity to any eschatological time-table, the later *Hsiang-fa chueh-i ching* did. Some assumed that the Age of the True or Authentic Dharma had passed and that humanity was now in the Age of the Semblance Dharma. But the later Three Stages Sect (c. 580) would presume that we lived in the Age of the Degenerate Dharma instead. The changing time-table of the Dharma is the context for understanding the tradition of “evil monks.”

IV. EVIL MONKS?: THE RISE AND FALL OF THE SANGHA-HOUSEHOLD

Here we focus on these increasingly widespread complaints in sixth-century Northern China about “evil monks” and inequities within the Sangha, complaints that arose during a time of eschatological or end-time anxiety. The Chinese sense of this internal corruption of the Sangha is a continuation of similar complaints lodged against the Indian Sangha in Northern India two centuries earlier. In China, as in India, a decline or degeneration in the Dharma was often blamed on the monks; this is because as the custodians of the Dharma, their impurity or failings would corrupt the Dharma.

The King also plays a key role here. Ashoka (304–232 BCE), the great Indian ruler, had earlier enriched the Sangha. As with Emperor Constantine (272–337), such royal patronage would change the character of the faith involved. World-renouncing Buddhism became world-conquering, but politicizing is a double-edged sword. Royal patronage furthers the faith; but withdrawal of such favors would mean state persecution instead. There were stories of evil rulers as well as stories of a *Cakravartin*, an ideal cosmic king. There would be cosmic battles to help shepherd in the arrival of the future Buddha, Maitreya. Little wonder that Buddhism is ambivalent about kings. The gift of kings is likened to “honey laced with poison.”

Buddhism had more recently (300) suffered a setback in

India during the Hindu revival under the Gupta rulers. The *Mahaparinirvana Sutra*, an Indian text, had witnessed the changing political fortunes of Indian Buddhism and even saw the time of degenerate dharma as just 60 years away. This sutra was translated by Dharmaksema (c. 385–433), a Buddhist monk at Liang-chou, a key border outpost on the Silk Road, in early fifth century China. By 500 a number of apocryphal texts appeared in China criticizing the corruptions in the Sangha and prophesying the decline of the Dharma.

One of those apocryphal texts was the *Hsiang-fa chueh-i ching* mentioned earlier. Compiled between 517 and 520, it still operated on the old assumption of being present in the “Age of Semblance Dharma.”² In 493, the Northern Wei Dynasty moved its capital from Datong to Luoyang (Loyang), one of the four ancient capitals of China. A rift arose in the Northern Sangha after the spectacular rise of Loyang, the new capital. It gave rise to an urban temple piety that peaked under the regency of the Empress Dowager Ling (515–520). She built the Yung-ling temple with an exaggerated 1,000 Chinese-feet high pagoda that a visiting monk, the legendary Bodhidharma (c. 500), the founder of Chan Buddhism, could not help admiring for days. That emotionally exuberant and priest-dominated urban piety stood in marked contrast to the Spartan and monk-guided rural piety that went before Loyang. Loyang temples would also drain the resources of the rural Sangha. It would undermine the original rural Sangha-household experiment.

V. THE SANGHA-HOUSEHOLD OF T’AN-YAO C. 460

The Sangha-household was an experiment that T’an-yao got the Wei Emperor to set up after 460. It began with the emperor donating an imperial estate, made up of a subjugated Chinese population transported *en masse* and settled as serfs on a royal estate near the capital. Many more Sangha-households arose, much to the enrichment of the Sangha.

Wealth corrupts and we soon hear of complaints against

clerical officials (monks overseeing the transportation of the grain to storage at the capital) misusing the Sangha grain. The harvested grain had originally been an internal reserve supplying “economic aid” for farmers in lean years, but now it often ended up helping to build these fabulously gorgeous Buddhist temples, showcased in the *Legends of the Loyang Temples*. Most of the monks in these temples were acting like temple priests. They guided and served the pilgrims and lay devotees rather than engaging in monastic meditation and study of the dharma. Sometimes the monks were just hired in to help serve the private temple owner.

Soon there were those, both within and outside the Sangha, that began to criticize the exuberant temple piety at Loyang and there were rumors of excessive wealth and sexual misconduct.

VI. “EVIL MONKS?” IN BUDDHIST HISTORY AND IN NORTHERN CHINA

Charges of “evil monks” have a long history in Buddhism. So we will have to be time and space specific in cataloguing the internal changes of the Buddhist Sangha during the fifth and sixth century in Northern China.

In the late fifth century, the Wei court railed against these “unregistered” monks known for their “wandering” all too freely among the people (allegedly stirring up trouble for the ruler). There was also complaint against (so-called) “privately kept monks” that somehow lay outside traditional Wei state control. The supreme irony here is that in the early days of Wei rule, it was the state that would send these “wandering” monks to the countryside as evangelicals spreading the Buddha Dharma so as to pacify the people.

That was the Central Asian style of itinerant monks: homeless renunciates always on the move (nine months out of twelve). In time, the wayfarers would settle down and become permanent residents in well grounded temples. These monastics now observed only a ritualized (not a real) mendacity and a theatrical (highly

localized) wayfaring. Similarly, in the early days, “privately kept” monks were kept privately because there were no public temples to house them. Instead of staying outside the village or town and sleeping overnight under trees or in cemeteries, some well-courted itinerant monks were invited to live in the backyard of their patron who saw to their upkeep.

In short, there is a whole socio-geopolitical history to and a notable shift in the economy of enlightenment hidden behind the lore of monastic abuse and of evil monks. It is to that longer history that we now turn to unfold the more detailed story of “evil monks” and the rise and fall of the Sangha-households. We want to briefly examine five moments in that story beginning in 446.

I: Emperor T'ai-wu and the Suppression of Buddhism (446–452)

Emperor T'ai-wu (423–452) apparently was not used to seeing well-endowed temples. So in 446 when he came south to put down an insurrection, he was surprised to come across a temple in Ch'ang-an that had staffs and spears, bows and arrows hanging on a wall. This discovery triggered the first major Buddhist persecution in China (446–452).

Under the resultant ban of Buddhism, monks were defrocked and stupas burnt and destroyed. But except for Ch'ang-an, there was no proof of widespread monastic corruption or of temples getting too wealthy for their own good.

Liang-ch'eng, the early northern capital near the steppes, was no Loyang, the later capital. An early Chinese visitor to Liang-ch'eng found the old capital to be a tent city without a permanent roof. It was unpaved with horses and sheep roving freely. Buddhist temples as we know them in Loyang came much later and were the result of the Buddhist revival after 452. In short, widespread Sangha evils in the North did not rise until after 472; and stories of economic abuse surfaced, it seems, only in 493. And that is understandable in view of the sequence of events summarized below.

Emperor T'ai-wu died in 452. Buddhism was revived. The key architect of the revival was T'an-yao, a Liang-chou monk who was invited to the capital in 453. In 454, he spearheaded the “Buddha Cave” project at Ta-t'ung (Yun-kang) just outside the capital. In 460, he became the leader of the Sangha. He and other Liang-chou monks then gathered at a Shih-hu-ssu at Pei-t'ai (a height north of the capital). Shih-hu-ssu is a “stone grotto,” a monastery set into a cave on the cliffs of the Yun-kang mountain range north of the capital. These “rock caves” housed Buddha images as well as Buddhist monks. Following the itinerant Silk Road lifestyle, Liang-chou monks kept up their wayfaring and avoided permanent residence. When they needed to meet they chose to gather at these “grotto caves.” It was during such a retreat that T'an-yao laid out his three-fold plan for rebuilding the Three Jewels: (1) carving images into the mountains for popularizing Buddha devotion, (2) extending the “monk family” to include lay brothers as “Sangha household members,” and (3) compiling new sutras so that “the common people would have teachings (Dharma) to live by.” The very success of this program is what then fueled the later criticism, both internal and external, about monk failures and temple evils.

2: Lay Precepts, Sutras and the Era of the Semblance Dharma

The precepts for lay Buddhists (those who did not become monks) are found in the *Wu-chieh ching* (*Pancasila Sutra*). It is a lay *pratimoksa* text outlining the five precepts or vows of the lay Buddhist: not killing, not stealing, not lying, no sexual misconduct, and no intoxicants/alcohol. Down through the Sui dynasty (581–619), peasants still gathered in the fields twice a month to renew these vows. It involved reading the precepts aloud and watching over one another, as monks would do in their fortnight gathering. For the occasion, the peasants even donned monkish garb and held some begging bowls. Here the laymen were part-time practitioners of that *imitatio buddhi*.

However, in the *Sutra of Trapusa and Ballika*, an apocraphal Chinese text, there is a statement that talks of a cosmic decline. The Buddha, as he approaches his death, is presented saying,

I am now entering parinirvana. Following my demise, there will arise in the future age...: First, chaos due to the way of kings; second, chaos due to the people; third, chaos due to the spirits; fourth, chaos due to the ninety-eight heretical teachings flourishing to the utter detriment of the Buddha Dharma; fifth, chaos affecting the True Teaching itself.³

The above sequence is not time specific, but Liang-chou monks were following Dharmaksema (385–433) whose translation of the *Mahaparinirvana Sutra* had dated the demise of the Dharma to 700 years after the Buddha's death. That would translate roughly into third century.

Although the *T'i-wei Po-li ching* (c. 460) did not specify a chaos caused by evil monks, it did register a new tension within the Sangha. It also criticized precept-breaking monks who were wandering about all too freely and doing so unchecked. Meanwhile, resident monks were also being derided. The populace spread lies about these monks, alleging they violated the rules in secret while putting up a false front of fake purity in public. The situation got so bad that eventually, the Buddhist laymen, people in general, and men of other faiths believed those lies. The derision caused good Buddhist deeds to go unsung and left people's faith in the Buddha-Dharma shaken.

3. The Trouble with Stupas & Images

The third moment in these developments concerns the growth of *stupas*, structures containing Buddhist relics, and the growth of available Buddha images. The *Chueh-tsui-fu ching* both witnessed and encouraged this form of piety. It told those who worshipped at home who did not have a buddha-image to pray facing the Buddhas of the Ten Directions (any direction including up and down since

Buddha was everywhere). What this indicates is that images were becoming increasingly accessible to the average laity; but they were not yet so mass produced as to be in everybody's possession.

The growing availability of images and stupas meant that anyone with some extra cash could start sponsoring a stupa or a shrine. The proliferation of stupas brought problems that T'an-yao did not and could not foresee.

The *Bodhisattva Wisdom Dharma* presents the following scenario:

the monks delight in the pure (the solitary life), but the lay people love to be among crowds... In picking their dwellings, each has its own preference. Even among monks some would prefer to build the stupa in mountains, fields, or on (isles in the) lakes; others though might...prefer to build the pagoda-temple in populous places (*ta-kuo*, great country, cities). There might also be good families who choose to donate their private plots to building a stupa, or to convert an old country home into such so that they might worship the Buddha in relative proximity, day and night, with flower and incense. Yet such [divided aims] are contrary to the notion of the Sangha as a fellowship. What should one do?⁴

That question uncovers a problem among the Three Jewels. There was an imbalance in devotion to the Three Jewels. Too much attention was given to the Buddha (images, shrines, and stupas) at the expense of the Dharma and the Sangha. The popularity of Buddha-devotion evident in the proliferation of stupas and pagodas, relic shrines and image halls would prove to be divisive. Neither the sangha nor the state could manage this uncontrolled growth. The Buddha said,

In the last age, people would compete in building temples and stupas but only for fame and not for lasting karmic reward.⁵

The simple fact is that gifts made to the Buddhist stupas and institutions meant that the state was losing much taxable land. In 518 at Loyang the state simply had to reclaim land lost to the temples as gifts.

4. The Trouble with Monks Grown Too Wealthy

In 472, the state complained that there were too many temples being built and too many unregistered monks running loose. That was the result of the earlier Buddhist revival. The anti-Buddhist edict of 472 makes clear that now the state was worried by the recent upsurge of the *stupa*-cult and of activist monks working among the people. The state was losing control over the Buddhist Jewels (Dharma, Buddha, Sangha), a control it once had in simpler days. Five years later in 477, the census number of temples had grown to over 100 in the capital and 6,478 in the country side. The number of monks had likewise exploded to 2,000 and 77,258 correspondingly. This growth was due to the innovations of T'an-yao.

T'an-yao's success in grounding that new Buddhist brotherhood ideal solidly into the structure of an agrarian empire that was China inspired the faithful to hopes of a Buddha-kingdom on earth.

In this way Buddhist monks in China created their own form of "monastic capitalism" like the Benedictine monks did in Europe. By the early sixth century, the posts of monk officials were being sold to the higher bidder. Loyang became a land of temples like nothing before. With the nation's Sangha-grain resources at its (illegal) disposal, extravagant "palace" temples were built.

However, the monks should not take all the blame, because they were losing control over the temples. Of the temples told in the *Lo-yang Ch'ieh-lan chi* (*A Record of Buddhist Monasteries in Lo-yang*)⁶, only two were built by monks. Most were the private temples of the elite who hired in monks to staff them to serve their own ends.

The *Hsiang-fa chueh-I ching* witnessed how the rural Sangha-grain (meant to help the peasants) was being drained

to help build these extravagant urban temples. It called for “aiding the orphaned and widowed” (the poor). It also initiated this call to “donate generally” (instead of specifically) as part of its universalistic piety in the Age of the Semblance Dharma. This is to ensure that the gift (too often earmarked for Buddha projects) can be legally and freely redirected to where the need (the care for the poor in the Sangha domain) is greatest. Otherwise by *vinaya* law, the property of one Jewel cannot be appropriated by another. Gift of grain to the Buddha would stay at the stupa. It might rot, but the Sangha cannot consume it. (It can borrow it and repay it later – in kind.) These issues rose because the Three Jewels were garnishing much earthly wealth due to the generosity of pious donors. This brought up the issue of a heightened tension between Sangha and the state.

5. The Trouble with the State Gaining Supervision of Temple Property

Historically, the northern Sangha was an institution of ascetics, fairly free to run their own affairs. The state seldom intruded into its administration. But with a growing body of laymen claiming to be monks in 472 and with a lot of Sangha grain being lodged at various monastic offices after 476, the government began to actively monitor that traffic in 486. When the *Hsiang-fa chueh-i ching* was compiled, it was after an infamous case of two such clerical Wei-na officials charged in 510 with misusing the Sangha-grain. They lent the grain out at high interest and caused death and suffering as they demanded repayment from drought-stricken farmers. The two were reprimanded, but one of them was later appointed to the top post as leader of the Sangha. Such conflicts of interest were clearly evident, but increasingly, clerical offices were being sold. In 511, the state declared that the civil bureaucracy and not the clerical one would manage the Sangha grain revenue.

The *Hsiang-fa chueh-i ching* also charged “evil secular officials, fearless of karmic retribution” with “taxing (improperly) Sangha

property ... and ordering the (willing) serfs of the Three Jewels about.” This is just one indication of this protracted tug of war between Sangha and state. The Liang-chou monks were aggressive, and their apocryphal sutras were quite anti-state, as this passage from the *Jen-wang-ching* shows:

The ruler, the high ministers, the prince, and nobles take pride in their high status. They are destroying Dharma. They openly establish rules to control my disciples, the monks and the nuns. They do not listen to the renunciates and followers of the Way. They would not heed even the call to build images or stupas. Instead they set up these offices to assume charge of the monks, their rules, their registration, their record, making the monks stand in an inferior position while the lay officers sit on high.⁷

This reflects the development of a schism in the Sangha. The high clerics often served the interest of the state while the lower clergy working among the people often sided with them instead. The Maitreyan revolts of 514–515, 517 that came later were part of a popular discontent with leaders of the Sangha and state. The *Jen-wang ch'ing* proclaims,

(In the future) should my disciples, the monks and the nuns, submit themselves to the officials (of the state), then they are no longer my disciples. That servitude (to officialdom) is like being held hostage in war. And should those high officials presume to audit the records of the monastery and of the monks (so that) the Sangha ends up being manhandled by these higher and lower monk officials, then that amounts to being held in physical bondage itself. At such times, the Buddha Dharma would not last for long.⁸

The monk and layman serving the common good of the Sangha-household were undercut by the state usurping control of the temple estates. The high clerics with ties to the state officials sided with the

state. The lower monks working with the people defended the original ideal. By the time of the next big anti-Buddhist persecution in the 840s that internal schism in the Sangha would be overshadowed by further economic developments in the T'ang. There was not much popular enthusiasm for a Buddhist revival after that persecution. There was no support from the peasants because by then the manorial system had been replaced by tenant farmers renting from the landowners. Temple estates were treating their tenants no better than secular estates. The disestablishment of land-owning temples thus aroused no protest. Well endowed temples after the T'ang would still have hard-working “otherworldly ascetic” monks help fuel a measure of “monastic capitalism,” but the new merchant class in China would not be indebted to any “innerworldly ascetics” coming out of the lay peasant brothers devoted to work at building up (not God’s kingdom on earth, but) a deserving prosperous Sangha refuge on earth. The experiment in the Sangha-household had come to an end.

Notes

- 1 For a more detailed and in-depth account of the story of Buddhism in China, see Whalen Lai, “The Three Jewels in China” in *Buddhist Spirituality: Indian, Southeast Asian, Tibetan, and Early Chinese*, ed. Takeuchi Yoshinori (New York: Crossroad Publishing, 1993), pp. 275-342.
- 2 See Tairyō Makita, *Gikyo Kenkyu* (Tokyo: Kyoto Daigaku Jinbun Kagaku Denkyujo, 1976).
- 3 *Ibid.*, p. 200.
- 4 See Zenryū Tsukamoto, *Shina Bukkyo shi kenkyu: Hokugi hen* (Tokyo: Kobundo, 1942).
- 5 *Taisho Tripitaka* (Japanese Buddhist canon), vol. 8, p. 833ab.
- 6 See Hsuan-Chih Yang, *A Record of the Buddhist Monasteries in Lo-yang* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1984).
- 7 See Makita, *Gikyo Kenkyu*, p. 46, citation taken from *Taisho Tripitaka*, vol. 8, p. 833ab.
- 8 See Zenryū Tsukamoto, *op. cit.* p. 127.

THE ABRAHAMIC TRADITIONS IN CHINA: Judaism, Islam, & Daoist Christianity

M. Darrol Bryant

加拿大滑铁卢大学的戴罗尔·布兰特教授的论文《旧约传统在中国：犹太教，伊斯兰教和道家基督教》探讨了很少被问津的西方宗教传统在中国现状的问题。他认为这些传统虽然始终微不足道，却早已在中国存在且融合进了中国思想和文化之中。犹太人在公元几个世纪初期，特别是在20世纪早期就到了中国，当时他们中的许多人逃到共产主义俄国和纳粹德国。伊斯兰教也于公元800年就传到了中国，特别是在中国西部比较多。早在17世纪和18世纪，穆斯林的学者们就开始把他们的信仰结合进了现代新儒家的条文里。令人惊讶的是，当年6世纪的基督徒也把自己的信仰和佛教、道教的教义融合了起来。这个事实最近才被发现，这就是为人所知的“道家基督教”。

I.

The Silk Road was long the bridge between China and the West. It was along this overland route that Marco Polo made his way from Venice to the Chinese courts in Beijing in 1266. On his way, he passed through Dunhuang, not knowing the treasures that lay hidden there. In Beijing, he encountered the great Kublai Khan (1215–94), who had recently founded the Yuan Dynasty (1264–1366). Kublai Khan inquired about the spiritual teachings of the West and asked Marco Polo to have the Pope send 100 scholars so that he might learn these teachings from the West.¹

This was not the first time that the Silk Road had brought Western travelers to China, nor was it the first time that those coming to

China brought with them the spiritual teachings of other cultures. In the first century of the Common Era, Buddhism had come to China along the Silk Road. Buddhism had originated in India (c. 500 BCE) and travelled into central Asia before making a right turn into China. Neither Marco Polo nor the Great Khan seem to have known about the treasures of Dunhuang, nor that Buddhist monks had been collecting manuscripts, including manuscripts from the West, in the nearby caves since 366. Had Marco Polo stopped at the Mogao Caves, not far from Dunhuang, he would have seen the remarkable “Caves of the Thousand Buddhas” and other treasures.

Nor did the Great Khan or Marco Polo seem to know that Christianity had been in China for centuries, perhaps since as early as the fifth century of the Common Era.² There are even legends that Thomas, the doubting disciple of Jesus, or Bartholomew, another of the Jesus’ disciples, made it to China. However, it is widely agreed that Nestorian Christians³ or Eastern Christians had come to China as early as the 4-500s. They too had come along the Silk Road. Nor did the Great Khan or Marco Polo seem to know that Christians – both from the West and Chinese converts – working with Chinese scholars and employing Confucian, Taoist, and Buddhist terms and ideas had created some remarkable writings that have only recently been rediscovered and published in English as the *Jesus Sutras*.⁴

It is not only 12th century figures who seemed unaware of these aspects of China’s long history; it is also true of contemporary scholarship on China. Too often, the study of the culture and thought of China seems to skip over an aspect of its culture and thought that has been fundamental to China from the very beginning: its great traditions of cultivation of the spirit, what Western scholars misleadingly call its religious traditions. There are many reasons for that but they begin with the fact that the Western term “religion” does not fit very well with what the Chinese call “*chiao*” or teachings.

These wisdom teachings in China reach back to the very beginnings of Chinese civilization. They include the *I Ching* (the Book of Changes), the 64 hexagrams that mark the ebb, flow, and

flux of life, the changes of Heaven and Earth.⁵ They also include the rites and ceremonies honoring the ancestors and maintaining harmony between Heaven and Earth. Then, much later, emerge the great teachings of Confucius – the Way of Goodness – and Lao Tzu – the Nameless Way – from the 500s BCE, teachings that are spread and followed by their disciples and followers down through the centuries. The great teachings of the Buddha had been integrated into the unified worldview of Neo-Confucianism by the time Marco Polo reached China. By the Song dynasty Confucius, Lao Tzu, and Buddha were the three great sages of China.

More recent historical experience in China has also contributed to sidelining the contemporary study of these great traditions of culture and cultivation. For many, it is not fashionable in China to focus on these old ways and superstitions as China enters the brave new world of global politics and economics. But such views are short sighted, since history teaches us that it is the spiritual traditions of humankind that endure amidst the ebb and flow of historical life and the ups and downs of every generation.

Here, I want to focus my attention on the three neglected traditions of Chinese spiritual life: Judaism, Islam and Christianity. The general assumption is that these three monotheistic traditions coming from outside China are forever foreign and cannot be integrated into the traditional Tao of heaven and earth. We want to explore that assumption.

II. THE WAY OF THE TORAH: JEWS IN CHINA

The first of the Abrahamic traditions – Judaism, Christianity, and Islam all claim Abraham (c.1800) as their ancestor – to reach China was the Jewish tradition. Some sources claim that there were Jews in China as early as the third century (c. 250). They are believed to have come from India and to have entered China along the Silk Road. Later, there was an established Jewish community in Henan province, with its own synagogue, from some time in the early Northern Song Dynasty (960–1127) until the present. They

are known as the Kaifeng Jews or the *Tiaojinjiao*. Kaifeng was the capital of the Northern Song Dynasty. In 1163, a Jewish teacher, Leiwei, was given permission to build a synagogue with a study hall, a ritual bath, and a communal kitchen in Kaifeng.

In the early 1600s, the Jesuit missionary to China Matteo Ricci (1552-1610) recounts meeting a Jew from Kaifeng, Ai Tian, who said he worshipped one God. He visited Ricci, and seeing the image of Mary and Child, he thought the image was Rebecca and a child, figures from the Jewish *Tanak* (Bible). Though the Jews of Kaifeng had some knowledge of their own traditions, it seems that they were increasingly assimilated into Chinese culture and intermarried with the Han Chinese, especially in the 1700s. However, they were known for not eating pork. Contact with Jews from Shanghai in the 1800s assisted these Jews in reconnecting with their Jewish heritage. Today, some 600-1000 residents of Kaifeng trace their origins back to this community.

In the 20th century as many as 25,000 Jewish people from Europe and the Soviet Union took up residence in China. Mostly, they were fleeing the Russian Revolution in Russia (1917) and the Nazi Regime (1933) and the Holocaust in Germany. They mainly settled in Hong Kong, Shanghai, and Harbin. At the end of WW II and with the establishment of the People's Republic of China, most of the recent emigrants left for the West, Australia, and Israel. In 1992, diplomatic relations were established between China and Israel. In 2001, an Orthodox Jewish community was established in Beijing.

There is more unknown than known of the Jews in China.⁶ It is an area of the study of Chinese thought and culture that deserves more investigation.

III. THE WAY OF ISLAM IN CHINA

Islam entered China within a century of the Prophet Mohammad's death (570-632).⁷ Islam came to China in two ways. It came along the Silk Road and took root in Western China among peoples that

shared a heritage with Central Asia and were not Han Chinese. It also came later along the coastal trading routes with Arab traders, some of whom settled in Guangzhou (Kwangchow) and Hangzhou (Hangchow). During the Song Dynasty, Muslims regularly held the position of Director General of Shipping due to their prominence in the import/export trade. Emperor Shezong (1067–85) invited more than 1000 Muslims from Bukhara (Uzbekistan) to settle in the northeast, where they became known for their skills and their contributions to trade along the Silk Road.

Over the 1300 years of Muslim presence in China, intermarriage gave rise to the Hui people, a Chinese ethnic group who practice Islam. There are also Uyghur Muslims, a Central Asian Turkish ethnic group concentrated in Xinjiang in Western China. Earlier, they had their own shamanic traditions and then they were Manicheans, Nestorian Christians, and Buddhists before becoming predominantly Muslim. The Uzbeks and Kazakhs also have a Turkic central Asian background and are found primarily in Xinjiang and Mongolia (Kazakhs). There are more than 20 million Muslims in China, between 1-2 percent of the total population.

Over their long histories there has been an exchange between Islam and Chinese culture. However, as the Muslim scholar Sachiko Murata has noted, it was only in the seventeenth century that Muslim scholars began to write in Chinese.⁸ The two most important Muslim thinkers in this tradition are Wang Tai-yu (c. 1590–c.1658) and Liu Chih (1670–1724). Wang wrote *The Real Commentary on the True Teaching* and Liu Chih wrote a volume that Murata translates as *Nature and Principle According to Islam* or *Islamic Neo-Confucianism*. What was the purpose of these writings? Murata says that their writings were “aimed at Muslims who had been largely assimilated into Chinese civilization.” These texts explain “why Muslims look at the world they way they do” and what the implications are for “the practical realm.” The language of these writings is that of “the dominant intellectual school of the day – Neo-Confucianism.” As Murata observes,

this new interpretation clarifies both the necessity for observing the theoretical and practical teachings of the Arabian sage known as Muhammad, and the reasons why these teachings are perfectly in harmony with the Tao of heaven and earth.⁹

It is remarkable that Muslim thinkers had become so integrated into Chinese culture that they could now write in the Neo-Confucian idiom of their own faith tradition. Or is it so remarkable? At the end of her article, Murata suggests that it is not as remarkable as one might think since there are several assumptions common to both traditions. And what are they? Murata characterizes them as follows: (1) the notion of *tawhid* or the unity of reality; (2) the sacredness of the natural world; (3) the idea that “human models of the past” are utterly essential for the quest to live in harmony with heaven and earth; (4) the goal of human life is human perfection and (5) social and political harmony must be built on individuals living in harmony with the Tao.¹⁰ While each of these principles deserves a further essay, I will content myself here with a few brief comments.

Murata says that the Islamic principle of *tawhid*, or the view that creation is by God/Allah and that everything returns to God, is “another version of the assertion of the ultimate reality of the Tao and the manner in which the Tao gives rise to all things.”¹¹ This description is somewhat problematic since there are also significant differences between the theistic character of Allah and the immanent notion of the Tao; but she says that the differences were not problematic for the Chinese Muslim thinkers she examines. Murata implicitly acknowledges the differences when she notes that Buddhists and Taoists “tended to approach the issue of unity in terms of Emptiness or the Buddha nature.”¹² Nonetheless, there is an overlap in the Muslim notion of the Oneness of the Ultimate and the Chinese principles of the Tao or Heaven (Tien).

It is much easier to see the cross-cultural identity of the sacredness of the natural world and the importance of human

exemplars – Confucius for the Confucians, Muhammad for the Muslims, Lao Tzu for Daoists, and Siddhartha Gautama for the Buddhists. Here, there is obviously something shared across tradition, something that facilitated the expression of Muslim convictions in a Neo-Confucian terminology. It would be interesting to know if this tradition continued beyond the seventeenth century and if it continues to influence Chinese Muslims today. Further research in this area is clearly needed.

IV: THE WAY OF CHRISTIANITY IN CHINA

It is generally assumed in the West that Christianity came to China only in recent times, but the late 19th century discovery of Dunhuang is changing that view. One of the most exciting discoveries was of some ancient scrolls, purporting to tell us of “the Jade-Faced One,” better known in the West as Jesus the Messiah. Something of these discoveries is now made available to us in a fascinating book by Martin Palmer entitled *The Jesus Sutras, Rediscovering the Lost Scrolls of Taoist Christianity*.¹³ The story behind these discoveries goes back to 635, when a delegation of Christians arrived in Chang-an, now Xian, the capital of the new Tang Dynasty (618–907). They came from Persia and Central Asia along the Silk Road. They presented themselves to the Tang Court – which would establish one of the golden ages in Chinese civilization, when China extended far into Central Asia.

Palmer began to pursue this story in Hong Kong in 1972, when he first became aware of rumors of an early, but lost Christianity in China. Over the years he pursued these hints. He learned Chinese and began to work in England on issues that brought together the worlds of religion and conservation in China. He learned of a famous Stone stele, discovered in the early 1600s, from 781 during the Tang Dynasty (618–906), arguably the most powerful empire in Chinese history. It contained the names of 70 Syriac clergy from the Eastern Church, sometimes called the Nestorian Christians. Palmer prefers to call them Eastern Christians.¹⁴

The formal delegation that had arrived in Chang-an (now Xian) in 635 was headed by Aluoben (some think this name could be a form of Adam or Abraham) from modern-day Uzbekistan in Central Asia. He was welcomed by the Emperor Taizong of Tang (599-649). The Tang response to the visit is, in part, included in the 781 stele:

*...the Way does not have a common name and the sacred doesn't have a common form. ...Aluoben came from a far land...to present the teaching...His message is mysterious and wonderful beyond our understanding. The teachings tell us about the origin of things and how they were created and nourished.*¹⁵

The 635 visit led to the founding of a Christian monastery near Xian in 1650. Earlier, Emperor Gaozu, the founder of the Tang dynasty, had established the Lou Guan Tai, a Taoist monastery in honor of Laozi (Lao Tzu). Emperor Gaozu had claimed descent from Laozi. It is said that the site of Lou Guan Tai was the place where Laozi wrote the *Tao te Ching*. Taoism became the favoured Way, or religion of the Tang period.

The Christian monastery of *Da Qin* (meaning the West, the Roman Empire, Christian) was sited near this important centre of Daoism. Palmer discovered the long lost monastery of Da Qin when he visited the area in 1998, thanks to an old woman at Lou Guan Tai who said that the nearby pagoda had been “founded by monks who came from the West and believed in One God.”¹⁶ It was here, close to the Taoist Centre of Lou Guan Tai that, Palmer argues, the remarkable translation of the Christian teaching or, as the Chinese called it, the *Luminous/Light Religion* or the *Light of the West* occurred. These translations and creative reformulations of Christian teaching would later emerge in those writings that Palmer now calls the *Jesus Sutras*. Unlike the later translation of the teachings of Islam into the idiom of Neo-Confucianism, the Christian teaching was re-presented in language taken from Taoist and Buddhist sources. It was only a few centuries earlier – 2nd to 4th centuries – that Buddhism, Taoism & Confucianism had had a

fruitful interchange. Now it was Christianity's turn to take on its Chinese face.

Palmer believes that it was at Da Qin that we had the creation of four "Sutras" – the Buddhist term for sacred literature – between 640-675. The four Sutras are (1) *Sutra of the Teaching of the World Honored One*, (2) *Sutra of Cause, Effect, & Salvation*, (3) *Sutra of Origins or the First Treatise in the Oneness of Heaven*, and (4) the *Sutra of Jesus Christ*. From Da Qin also came the writings known, in Palmer's view, as the Liturgical Sutras, that include the sutra "*Taking Refuge in the Trinity*." It comes from a later period, probably c. 720. The later writing obviously draws on the Buddhist tradition of taking refuge in the *dharmā*, the Buddha, and the *sangha*.

It is not possible to review these texts in any detail here, but I would like to offer a brief extract and comment on each.

Palmer believes that the *Sutra of the Teaching of the World Honored One* draws upon the Tatian's *Teachings of the Apostles*, a text much loved in the Eastern Church but not included in the canon of the New Testament, and Matthew 6 and 7.¹⁷ He illustrates this by quoting the *Sutra*:

*...if someone gives alms, he should do it in the knowledge of the World-Honoured One. Let not your left hand know what your right is doing. Pay no attention to outsiders, but worship the One Sacred Spirit. The One will become visible to you and then you should worship only the One.*¹⁸

This text echoes teachings found in Taitan's *Teaching of the Apostles* and in the Gospel of Matthew. Palmer sees this Sutra as closest to the biblical story of Jesus but expressed in terms that echo Taoist and Buddhist teaching. For example, Ye Su, the Messiah, "promised that the Pure Wind (Holy Spirit) would come from Heaven on those who asked." The text is filled, like the *Teachings of the Apostles* and Matthew 6 and 7, with moral maxims and teachings.

But more typical are passages that are not glosses on Christian

texts, but rather employ the language and idiom of the Taoist and Buddhist traditions. There is, for example, the *Sutra of Jesus Christ*:

At this time the Messiah taught the laws of God, of Yahweh...

Nobody has seen God. Nobody has the ability to see God. Truly God is like the wind. Who has seen the wind? God is not still but moves on the earth at all times. He is in everything and everywhere. Humanity lives only because it is filled with God's life-giving breath. Peace comes only when you can rest secure in your own place, when your heart and mind rest in God...

All the great teachers such as the Buddhas are moved by this Wind and there is nowhere in the world where this Wind does not reach and move....

...God is beyond the cycle of death and birth, beyond being called male or female. God made both heaven and earth...¹⁹

A similar drawing upon other traditions occurs in the *Sutra of Returning to our Original Nature* where the notion of “original nature” comes directly from the Taoist Chuang Tzu.²⁰ It also resonates with the Mahayana Buddhist notion of one’s “Buddha nature” as what one awakens to in enlightenment.” This sutra, written c. 780–90, is attributed to Jingjing (luminous purity), whom Palmer regards as a “great Chinese saint and scholar.” In this sutra, the reader is taken step by step through the Way that leads to overcoming desire and transcending rebirth. It is a Way centered on “clearing minds and setting aside all wanting and doing,” it is a Way of “no wanting, no doing, no piousness, no truth.” These latter words echo the Taoist teaching of *wu-wei*, and are shocking to the moral and rationalistic consciousness of much of Western Christianity.

The same can be seen in the *Sutra of Cause, Effect and Salvation*, a sutra that Palmer sees as originating in Central Asia and translated into Chinese. It is the second oldest of the *Jesus Sutras*. It begins,

What is the cause of human beings?

The answer is: Humanity is created both by that which can be seen and that which cannot.

What causes the visible and the invisible?

Everything under heaven consists of the four elements: earth, water, fire, and wind. All brought about by the Sacred Spirit.²¹

The text then goes on to discuss the nature of humanity in relation to the five *skandas* of Buddhism, namely, form, consciousness, mind, sensation, and desire. It then discusses the nature of karma and reincarnation, seeing Jesus as the one who breaks the cycle of cause and effect and opens the way to the recovery of our original nature.

The third of the *Jesus Sutras* is the *Sutra of Origins*. Here we learn that “*everything originates in the One Sacred Spirit*” and that the One Sacred Spirit “*sustains Heaven and Earth.*” Moreover, the “*being and actions of the One Sacred Spirit are everywhere, no beginning and no end. ...The One Sacred Spirit is uncreated and is the essence of all existence and can never be emptied.*”²² The fourth of the four earliest sutras is called the *Sutra of Jesus Christ*. It has two sections, a cosmological section focused on Yama,²³ the Judge of the Dead, and reincarnation, as well as a collection of teachings around the theme of the Ten Commandments, here called the Ten Covenants. The sutra opens with the following words:

At this time the Messiah taught the laws of God, of Yahweh....The Messiah was orbited by the Buddhas and arhats...Looking down, he saw the suffering of all that is born...he began to teach.

Nobody has seen God...Truly, God is like the wind. Who can see the wind? God is not still but moves on earth at all times... Humanity lives only because it is filled with God's life-giving breath. Peace comes only...when your heart and mind rest in God.²⁴

This is a remarkable statement that weaves together Christian, Buddhist, and Taoist teaching in a remarkable – and heretofore unimagined – way. It then continues,

God is beyond the cycle of death and birth, beyond being called male or females. God made both heaven and earth... The sacred Spirit power of God works in all, bringing all to fullness.²⁵

The sutra then goes on to discuss true worship in relation to the Ten Covenants. The first three – Honor God, Honor the Emperor, and Honor your Parents – draws upon the Confucian traditions. The last section recounts the Way of Jesus.

In this section we read that “*God caused the Cool Breeze to come upon a chosen young woman called Mo Yan who had no husband and she became pregnant.*” Then later, in words that echo Buddhist teaching concerning the Bodhisattva Way, that “*the Messiah gave up his body to the wicked one for the sake of all living beings.*” This section concludes in words that link Christian teaching to Taoism, saying that “*the Messiah showed everyone that the Way of God is the Way of Heaven.*”²⁶ Each of these four sutras deserves further attention, but we will have to be content with this brief glimpse of these remarkable but unknown writings from the 6-700s in China. They give us a glimpse of a form of Christianity – Palmer calls it Taoist Christianity – which most of us have never seen before.

Before concluding it is necessary to mention the other “Liturgical Sutras” found in Palmer’s volume. The first we have already noted. Called “Taking Refuge in the Trinity,” it is a clear borrowing from the Buddhist idea of taking refuge. The second, an “Invocation of the Dharma King and Sacred Sutras” or “Let us Praise,” is a chant praising the lineage of the Dharma King and the Sutras. The third

liturgical sutra is called the “Sutra of Returning to your Original Nature,” and the fourth is a chanted “Tao of Jesus” or the “Sutra of Praise to the Three Powers.” Palmer sees the liturgical sutras as largely the creation of Jingjing, the great but unknown Chinese Christian from the late 700s, from the monastery at Da Qin. Palmer believes that he is not only responsible for these “Liturgical Sutras” but also for the formulations found on the great stone stele of 781. The stele contains a passage that is a fitting conclusion for this venture into the lost world of Taoist Christianity. It is a Christian gloss on the opening to the Tao te Ching and reads,

This truth cannot be named but its function surpasses all expectations. When forced to give it a name, we call it the Religion of Light. As it is with the Way, that which is sacred is not sacred unless it is highly sacred, and that which is the Way is not the Way unless it is the great Way.²⁷

Here, we encounter a remarkable effort to articulate the teaching of the Luminous Light Religion in terms that are drawn from the great traditions of China. These efforts seek to find formulations that render the teachings of the Light of the West in a Chinese idiom. It seems that they were successful for at least a brief moment in the long history of China.

A more complete account of Christianity in China would have to examine the work of the Franciscan missionaries in the 13th century, the Jesuit missionaries, especially Matteo Ricci, at the beginnings of the 1500s and the coming of the Protestant missionaries in the early 1800s. It would also be fascinating to explore the impact of Protestant Christian teachings on the Taiping Rebellion of the mid-19th century, and the later Three-Self movement at the end of the 19th and early 20th century. But these will have to wait for another occasion.

For now, it is sufficient to note that the story of the Abrahamic traditions in China is still unfolding.

V. CONCLUDING COMMENTS

The story of the presence of the Abrahamic traditions of Judaism, Islam and Christianity in China is marked by ups, downs, discontinuities, disappearances and marginality as they adopted and adapted to Chinese culture and forms. But through all those twists and turns, they have all been part of the story of Chinese life and culture over most of the past two millennia.

Our purpose has been to explore the presence of the Abrahamic traditions – Jewish, Christian and Muslim – in Chinese culture. We wanted to see if these foreign teachings could adapt to Chinese thought and culture. In this cursory review, we have seen that there is evidence that all three of these traditions can – and have – found ways to indigenize their teaching. Of course there will always be those who will reject such efforts, but it seems clear that there were those who found the meeting of cultures to be a welcome venture. It is obvious that more work needs to be done in this area, an area that given my limited background in Chinese studies, seems to have been much neglected in contemporary scholarship on the great traditions of spiritual cultivation in China.

Notes

- 1 See Suzanne Conklin Akbari, Amilcare Innucci, & John Turk, *Marco Polo and the Encounter of East and West* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008). I am aware that virtually everything about Marco Polo and his journey to the East is subject to scholarly debate. See, for example, the discussion of Marco Polo in Frances Wood, *The Silk Road, Two Thousand Years in the Heart of Asia* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), pp. 119-125, that judiciously remarks “the text should be used, but used with care.”
- 2 Since I began writing this essay, I have come across some information to suggest that Kublai Khan did know of Christians who had long been in China. See, for example, Richard Foltz, *Religions of the Silk Road* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010) and Frances Wood, *Along the Silk Road*, *op.cit.*, pp. 118 ff.
- 3 Nestorian Christianity refers to the followers of Bishop Nestorius (386-451), Patriarch of Constantinople (428-31), whose teachings were declared heretical at the Council of Ephesus in 431. Bishop Nestorius claimed he was misunderstood and maintained his orthodoxy until the end of his life. Some of his followers broke with the early forms of Christianity and pursued their own version of the Christian faith in communities in Eastern Christianity, particularly in ancient Persia and up into Central Asia. I have taught a course in the History of Christian Thought for more than twenty-years.
- 4 See Martin Palmer, *The Jesus Sutras, Rediscovering the Lost Scrolls of Taoist Christianity* (New York: Ballantine Wellspring, 2001). Palmer’s work will be discussed in the section on Daoist Christianity.
- 5 See John Blofeld, ed. *I Ching* It has an especially useful introduction to the *I Ching* for Western readers.
- 6 See Xin Xu, *The Jews of Kaifeng Ching: History, Culture, Religion* (Jersey City, NJ: KTAV Publishing House, 2003).
- 7 In this brief account of Islam in China, I am indebted to Sachiko Murata “The Islamic Encounter with Chinese Intellectual Traditions,” in Abdul Aziz Said & Meena Sharify-Funk, eds. *Cultural Diversity and Islam* (Lanham, Maryland: University Press of America, 2003), pp. 107-118. Some sources indicate that Uthman, the 3rd Caliph, sent Sa’d ibn Abi-Waqqas, a maternal uncle of the Prophet Mohammad, to Tang China (c. 650). Contemporary scholarship suggests that this is more legend than fact. However, it is a belief widely held among Chinese Muslims.
- 8 See Sachiko Murata, “The Islamic Encounter with the Chinese Intellectual Tradition,” *op.cit.*, p. 107.
- 9 Murata, *op.cit.*, p. 108-109.
- 10 See Murata, *op.cit.*, pp. 114-116. Each of these principles needs to be explored in more detail than we can include in this brief essay.
- 11 *Ibid.*, p. 114.
- 12 *Ibid.*

- 13 Martin Palmer, *The Jesus Sutras, Rediscovering the Lost Scrolls of Taoist Christianity* (New York: Ballantine Wellspring, 2001). I had long been intrigued by the stories of Christianity in China, but could find little. Palmer's book brings to light an amazing story of a long-lost Christianity in China. I am indebted to him for the information found in this section of the paper.
- 14 Palmer uses the phrase "Eastern Christianity" to include Syrian Christianity, one of the earliest streams of Christianity, as well as the so-called Nestorian Christians, and those forms of Christianity that took root in Armenia, the first Christian nation, then in ancient Persian (Iran & Iraq in modern terms), India and out into Central Asia. It also includes Coptic Christianity in Egypt. While these streams of Christianity all accepted the Creed of Nicea (325)-Constantinople (381), they did not accept the later Councils at Ephesus (431) and Chalcedon (451). They are sometimes known as *Monophysites*, or those who affirm a single nature of Christ. They reject what they see as the excessive efforts to rationally explain the nature of Christ. The issues between these streams of Christianity were finally resolved in the 1990s in an initiative headed by Metropolitan Paulos Mar Gregorios, an Indian Syrian Christian Bishop. See also my *Out of Galilee: The History of Christianity Thought as a Great Conversation* (Waterloo, Ontario: Renison University College Course Text, 2007).
- 15 *The Jesus Sutras, op.cit.*, p. 42.
- 16 See *The Jesus Sutras*, p. 18.
- 17 Tatian's *Teachings of the Apostles* is a compilation of the materials similar to those found in the four Gospels that was much loved in the Eastern Church. Tatian (110-180) had come from Persia, studied in Rome, and returned to Persia where he compiled and published in 172 his *Teachings*. It was much used and loved by Persian Christian into the 8th century. Another text called the *Didache* or *Teachings of the 12 Apostles* almost made it into the Christian canon. It hovered on the edge. It opens with these words: "there are two Ways, one of life and one of death. And between the two is a great difference."
- 18 *The Jesus Sutras, op.cit.* p. 52.
- 19 See the *The Jesus Sutras, op.cit.*, pp. 159-60.
- 20 See the *The Jesus Sutras, op.cit.*, p. 51.
- 21 See the *The Jesus Sutras, op.cit.*, p. 139.
- 22 *The Jesus Sutras, op.cit.*, pp. 147, 149.
- 23 "Yama" is the Hindu name for the Lord of Death; it is carried over into Tibetan Buddhism. Palmer sees the material on Yama in the fourth Sutra, *The Sutra of Jesus Christ*, as drawing upon the teachings of Tibetan Buddhism.
- 24 *The Jesus Sutras, op.cit.*, pp. 159-160. See the lines in the opening paragraph of Augustine's *Confessions*: "You made us for yourself, and our heart is restless until it rests in you." *Saint Augustine Confessions*, trans. Henry Chadwick (Oxford: Oxford University Press, World Classics, 1999), p. 3. Palmer gives a harsh and overstated reading of Augustine on page 175 ff. of the *The Jesus Sutras*.

- 25 *The Jesus Sutras, op.cit.*, p. 160.
- 26 *The Jesus Sutras, op.cit.*, pp. 166-167.
- 27 *The Jesus Sutras, op.cit.*, p. 218.

APPENDIX

Sing-ying Ho. “Artist’s Statement” for West Meets East, curated by Ann Roberts. Waterloo, Ontario: Harbinger Gallery, May 1-22, 2010.

Artist Statement

Ho, Sin-ying (Cassandra)

The exploration of the idea of technology and our place in society in the 21st century has been an ongoing subject in my current body of work. My interest and expertise in this topic derive from my personal experience living in three countries and two languages. I incorporate computer decal transfer images and painted ornaments on vessels to address observations of the old and the new in terms of communication, language, aesthetics, technology, identity, economy, and power. I use ornaments with their own symbolic meanings from old cultures, as well as recognized icons from Celtic, Egyptian, Greek, Roman, and Chinese cultures, linked by cyber text. I use computer language as part of the composition and metaphor to express, describes, and reflect collisions among cultures.

In my work, I demonstrate that visual signs and linguistic symbols are equally important for tracing and recording human history, culture, and geography. I expand linguistic symbols to computer binary codes and to symbols of ornaments as densely painted decoration motifs from old cultures on classical porcelain vessels to signify the identity of the cultures. As well, deconstructed and reconstructed, painted hybrid porcelain vessels transform familiar forms into unfamiliar and unidentified sculptures, illustrating the intercourse of cultures – new and old culture changing under the influence of technology. Combining hand-painted and digitally printed images creates a contrast of technology.

As the world moves toward greater globalization, technology leads people of many nationalities and cultures to merge together

and evolve into an unknown. I reference my own experience being Asian-Chinese, living in North America, and the collisions I have come across. My collision course of cross-cultural experience speaks to universal concerns.



Figure 1 Sin-ying Ho. *Fractured Unity*



Figure 2 Sin-ying Ho *Music*



Figure 3 Sin-ying Ho *Trilogy*

CONTRIBUTORS

Joseph A. Adler, Professor of Asian Studies, Kenyon College (Ohio) holds a PhD in Confucian Studies from the University of California at Santa Barbara. He has taught at Kenyon College since 1987 and has been Chair of Religious Studies and Director of Asian Studies. He is the author of *Chinese Religious Traditions* (Prentice Hall, 2002) and has contributed to *Confucianism and Ecology* (Harvard University Press, 2002) and *Confucian Spirituality* (Crossroad 2004).

Ye Bai, Professor of Chinese Literature Institute of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Beijing, and the Vice Chair of the Contemporary Chinese Literature Research Association. He is the author of numerous studies in Chinese Literature.

M. Darrol Bryant, Distinguished Professor Emeritus and Director of the Centre for Dialogue and Spirituality in the World Religions, Renison University College, University of Waterloo has taught a course in The Religions of East Asia over the past twenty years. He is the author/editor of more than twenty volumes in the study of religion including *Religion in a New Key, God: The Contemporary Discussion*, and *Muslim-Christian Dialogue: Promise and Problems*. He is the subject of a documentary film, *Traveling Guru* by Marjonneke, a Canadian film maker, on his travels to India with students to introduce them to the living religious traditions of India.

Glen F. Cartwright is the Principal and Vice-Chancellor of Renison University College, Waterloo. Prior to his coming to Renison he was long time Professor in the Department of Educational and Counseling Psychology at McGill University. He has a long-

standing research interest in education and computer applications. His writings have appeared in the *British Journal of Educational Psychology* and *The Futurist*.

James Flath, Associate Professor of History, University of Western Ontario teaches courses in East Asian History and Modern China. His doctorate is from the University of British Columbia. He is the author of the *Cult of Happiness* and co-editor with Norman Smith of *Beyond Suffering, Recounting War in Modern China*. His work focuses on Chinese material culture.

Whalen Lai is an Emeritus Professor of Religious Studies at the University of California (Davis) and a specialist in Buddhism and Chinese traditions. He was educated in Japan and at Harvard University (PhD). He has written extensively on Buddhism in China. His publications include *Early Ch'an in China and Tibet* and his "Three Jewels in China" appeared in the classic *Buddhist Sprituality: Indian, Southeast Asian, Tibetan, Early Chinese* edited by Takeuchi Yoshinori.

Yan Li is the Director of the Confucius Institute at the University of Waterloo. She is also cross-appointed in East Asian Studies at Renison University College. She was educated in the People's Republic of China and in Canada at the University of Windsor. She is an award winning author and her works include *Daughters of the Red Land*, *Married to the West Wind* and, most recently, *Lily in the Snow*.

Judith Maclean Miller is an Associate Professor of English at Renison University College. She is author and editor of numerous studies on Canadian literature and writers including *Reading/Writing Canada: Short Fiction & Non-Fiction* (New York: W.W. Norton, 2005) and *Places of Their Own: Women Writing Since 1900*. She has long been interested in East Asian poetry and literature. She

has also contributed to several publications that bring together poetry, art, and music including *Birthstory* and *Glyph*.

Norman Smith is an Associate Professor in the History Department of the University of Guelph. He is a specialist in modern China. He is the author of *Resisting Manchukuo: Chinese Women Writers and the Japanese Occupation* and co-editor with James Flath of *Beyond Suffering, Recounting War in Modern China*.

Ning Wang, Associate Professor of History at Brock University teaches courses in East Asian History. He was educated at Peking University (MA) and the University of British Columbia (PhD). He is a specialist on modern China, especially Chinese intellectuals. He has published "Constructing Chinese Cultural Identity..." in the *International Journal of Diversity*.

Jie Yang, Assistant Professor of Anthropology at Simon Frazer University in Vancouver, British Columbia teaches courses in anthropology and is especially interested in China. She works at the intersection of ideology and politics. She holds a doctorate from the University of Toronto.

